



THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT OF
THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



Adobe Acrobat Reader

Finding Words

You can use the Find command to find a complete word or part of a word in the current PDF document. Acrobat Reader looks for the word by reading every word on every page in the file, including text in form fields.

To find a word using the Find command:

1. Click the Find button (**Binoculars**), or choose Edit > Find.
2. Enter the text to find in the text box.
3. Select search options if necessary:
Match Whole Word Only finds only occurrences of the complete word you enter in the box. For example, if you search for the word *stick*, the words *tick* and *sticky* will not be highlighted.

Match Case finds only words that contain exactly the same capitalization you enter in the box.

Find Backwards starts the search from the current page and goes backwards through the document.

4. Click Find. Acrobat Reader finds the next occurrence of the word.

To find the next occurrence of the word, Do one of the following:

Choose Edit > Find Again
Reopen the find dialog box, and click Find Again.
(The word must already be in the Find text box.)

Copying and pasting text and graphics to another application

You can select text or a graphic in a PDF document, copy it to the Clipboard, and paste it into another application such as a word processor. You can also paste text into a PDF document note or into a bookmark. Once the selected text or graphic is on the Clipboard, you can switch to another application and paste it into another document.

Note: *If a font copied from a PDF document is not available on the system displaying the copied text, the font cannot be preserved. A default font is substituted.*

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



To select and copy it to the clipboard:

1. Select the text tool **T**, and do one of the following:
To select a line of text, select the first letter of the sentence or phrase and drag to the last letter.

To select multiple columns of text (horizontally), hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option (Mac OS) as you drag across the width of the document.

To select a column of text (vertically), Hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option+Command (Mac OS) as you drag the length of the document.

To select all the text on the page, choose Edit > Select All. In single page mode, all the text on the current page is selected. In Continuous or Continuous – facing mode, most of the text in the document is selected. When you release the mouse button, the selected text is highlighted. To deselect the text and start over, click anywhere outside the selected text. The Select All command will not select all the text in the document. A workaround for this (Windows) is to use the Edit > Copy command. Choose Edit > Copy to copy the selected text to the clipboard.

2. To view the text, choose Window > Show Clipboard

In Windows 95, the Clipboard Viewer is not installed by default and you cannot use the Show Clipboard command until it is installed. To install the Clipboard Viewer, Choose Start > Settings > Control Panel > Add/Remove Programs, and then click the Windows Setup tab. Double-click Accessories, check Clipboard Viewer, and click OK.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **[REPORT OF ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION**
2 **ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 17, 2015 ON PAGE 152]**

3
4
5
6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS WILL BEGIN.
7 WE'LL FIRST BE LED IN PRAYER BY PASTOR ANTHONY BROWN OF THE
8 MORNING STAR MISSIONARY BAPTIST CHURCH IN THE FOURTH
9 SUPERVISORIAL DISTRICT. AND PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE BY THE DWAYNE
10 CONYERS, RETIRED CAPTAIN, UNITED STATES AIR FORCE, FROM THE
11 WEST HOLLYWOOD, THIRD SUPERVISORIAL DISTRICT. SO, PASTOR. THIS
12 IS ONE OF THE BEST THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY EMPLOYEES, ONE OF
13 THE BEST THE BISHOPS OF HIS CHURCH. HE'S NOT A PASTOR, HE IS
14 BISHOP, AND WE REALLY APPRECIATE HIS SERVICE FOR THE LORD AND
15 HIS SERVICE FOR THE COUNTY CITIZENS WHERE HE'S EMPLOYED.
16 BISHOP.

17
18 **BISHOP ANTHONY BROWN:** THANK YOU, SUPERVISOR ANTONOVICH. I
19 APPRECIATE THAT INTRODUCTION. THANK YOU SO MUCH. SHALL WE
20 PRAY? OUR FATHER IN HEAVEN, WE COME TO MASS, LORD, THANKING
21 YOU FOR THIS DAY. WE THANK YOU, LORD, FOR OUR LAST NIGHT'S
22 LYING DOWN AND HOW YOU'VE TOUCHED US THIS MORNING AND YOU
23 ALLOWED US TO GATHER HERE TODAY TO JUST TALK ABOUT SOME
24 CONCERNS THAT INVOLVES OUR LOS ANGELES COUNTY. WE PRAY THAT
25 YOU WOULD LOOK UPON EACH SUPERVISOR, THAT YOU WOULD BLESS THEM

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AND GIVE THEM ALL THE KNOWLEDGE THAT THEY NEED TO CONTINUE TO
2 DO THOSE THINGS WHICH THEY HAVE BEEN DOING FOR OUR COUNTY. WE
3 JUST GIVE YOU GLORY AND WE GIVE YOU HONOR, AND, LORD, WE ALSO
4 ASK THAT YOU WOULD LOOK UPON THOSE THAT WOULD ADD A CONCERN
5 THAT THEY WOULD ADDRESS ON TODAY. WE PRAY THIS IN THE NAME OF
6 OUR LORD GOD, WE PRAY, AMEN.

7

8 **DWAYNE CONYERS:** PLEASE FACE THE FLAG AND PUT YOUR HANDS ON
9 YOUR HEART. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE RECITED.]

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR SHEILA KUEHL. EXCUSE ME.
12 DON KNABE. THEN SUPERVISOR SHEILA KUEHL.

13

14 **SUP. KNABE, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR, MEMBERS OF THE BOARD.
15 WE WANT TO ONCE AGAIN WELCOME ANTHONY WHO PASTORS THE MORNING
16 STAR MISSIONARY CHURCH. AND SOME OF YOU ALSO MAY RECOGNIZE
17 HIM, AS THE MAYOR INDICATED, AS OUTSTANDING EMPLOYEE OF I.S.D.
18 HERE IN THE HALL OF ADMINISTRATION. ANTHONY HAS FILLED IN FOR
19 US ON SEVERAL OCCASIONS AND HAS ALSO DONE NUMEROUS INVOCATIONS
20 FOR ALL OF US THROUGHOUT THE COUNTY. WE HAD A LAST-MINUTE
21 CANCEL AND HE WAS ABLE TO FILL IN FOR US. SO ON BEHALF OF
22 MYSELF AND MY COLLEAGUES, ANTHONY, WE REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU
23 NOT ONLY FOR WHAT YOU DO EACH AND EVERY DAY ON BEHALF OF THE
24 COUNTY, BUT TAKING THE TIME TO LEAD US IN AN INVOCATION. GOD
25 BLESS. [APPLAUSE.]

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR SHEILA KUEHL.

3

4 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR. TODAY WE
5 WERE LED IN THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE BY CAPTAIN DWAYNE CONYERS
6 OF THE UNITED STATES AIR FORCE. CAPTAIN CONYER'S DECORATIONS
7 INCLUDE THE AIR FORCE OVERSEAS LONG-TOUR SERVICE RIBBON, AIR
8 FORCE LONGEVITY SERVICE AWARD AND AIR FORCE TRAINING RIBBON.
9 HE WAS RAISED IN PHILADELPHIA, ATTENDED HOWARD UNIVERSITY,
10 LIVES IN OUR THIRD DISTRICT IN HOLLYWOOD AND WORKS AS A WRITER
11 AND A PRODUCER. PLEASE HELP ME THANK HIM. [APPLAUSE.]

12

13 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** GOOD MORNING, MR.
14 MAYOR, MEMBERS OF THE BOARD. WE WILL BEGIN TODAY'S AGENDA ON
15 PAGE 2 WITH POLICY MATTER. ITEM P-1. THIS ITEM WILL BE HELD
16 FOR DISCUSSION ALONG WITH THE RELATED ITEM NO. 4 ON REPORTS.
17 ON ITEM R-1 AS POSTED ON THE SUPPLEMENTAL AGENDA, THE DIRECTOR
18 OF CHILDREN AND FAMILY SERVICES REQUESTS THIS ITEM BE
19 CONTINUED ONE WEEK NOVEMBER 24, 2015. ON PAGE 3, BOARD OF
20 SUPERVISORS, ITEMS 1 THROUGH 6, ON ITEM 4, THIS ITEM WILL BE
21 HELD FOR DISCUSSION WITH ITEM P-1. ON ITEM NO. 6, AS INDICATED
22 ON THE POSTED AGENDA, THE CHAIR OF THE AUDIT COMMITTEE
23 REQUESTS THAT THE PORTION RELATED TO THE SUNSET REVIEW BE
24 REFERRED BACK TO THE COMMITTEE. THE REMAINING ITEMS UNDER THE
25 BOARD OF SUPERVISORS IS BEFORE YOU.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MOTION BY SUPERVISOR SHEILA KUEHL,
3 SECOND WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.

4

5 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** ON PAGE 9, CONSENT
6 CALENDAR, ITEMS 7 THROUGH 41, ON ITEM NO. 7, A MEMBER OF THE
7 PUBLIC REQUESTS THIS ITEM BE HELD. ON ITEM NO. 8, SUPERVISOR
8 KNABE AND A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC REQUEST THIS ITEM BE HELD. ON
9 ITEM NO. 9, SUPERVISOR RIDLEY-THOMAS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
10 REQUEST THIS ITEM BE HELD ALONG WITH RELATED ITEM NO. 43. ON
11 ITEM NO. 10 AND 11, A MEMBER OR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC REQUEST
12 THESE ITEMS BE HELD. ON ITEM NO. 16, A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
13 REQUESTS THIS ITEM BE HELD. ON ITEM NO. 18, SUPERVISOR KUEHL
14 REQUESTS THAT THIS ITEM BE HELD. ON ITEMS 21 AND 22 AND 24 AND
15 25, A MEMBER OR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC REQUEST THESE ITEMS BE
16 HELD. ON ITEM NO. 27, SUPERVISOR KNABE REQUESTS THIS ITEM BE
17 CONTINUED TWO WEEKS TO DECEMBER 1, 2015. ON ITEM 34, 36 AND ON
18 37, A MEMBER OR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC REQUEST THESE ITEMS BE
19 HELD. ON ITEM 39, A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC REQUESTS THAT THIS
20 ITEM BE HELD. THE REMAINING ITEMS UNDER THE CONSENT CALENDAR
21 ARE BEFORE YOU.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MOTION BY SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-
24 THOMAS. SECOND WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** ON PAGE 23,
2 ORDINANCES FOR INTRODUCTION, ITEMS 42 AND 46. ON ITEM 42, THE
3 INTERIM COUNTY COUNSEL REQUESTS THIS ITEM BE CONTINUED ONE
4 WEEK TO NOVEMBER 24, 2015. ON ITEM 43, THIS IS AN ORDINANCE
5 FOR INTRODUCTION AMENDING COUNTY CODE TITLE 2 ADMINISTRATION
6 TO ESTABLISH THE OFFICE OF DIVERSION AND RE-ENTRY WITHIN THE
7 DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH SERVICE. AND ON THIS ITEM, SUPERVISOR
8 RIDLEY-THOMAS REQUESTS THIS BE HELD ALONG WITH RELATED ITEM
9 NO. 9. ALSO A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC REQUESTS THAT THIS ITEM BE
10 HELD. ON ITEM NO. 44, THIS IS AN ORDINANCE FOR INTRODUCTION
11 AMENDING COUNTY CODE TITLE 2, ADMINISTRATION, REQUIRED FOR THE
12 SYBIL BRAND COMMISSION FOR INSTITUTIONAL INSPECTIONS, CONDUCT
13 ANNUAL ELECTIONS OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR AND PROVIDE THAT
14 COMMISSIONERS BE PAID FOR THEIR ATTENDANCE AND UP TO THREE
15 COMMISSION RELATED ACTIVITIES PER WEEK NOT TO EXCEED \$150 PER
16 WEEK.

17

18 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MOTION BY SUPERVISOR DON KNABE,
19 SECONDED WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.

20

21 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** ON ITEM NO. 44--
22 SORRY. ON ITEM 45, THIS IS AN ORDINANCE FOR INTRODUCTION
23 AMENDING THE A.R.C.O. MIDCON L.L. FRANCHISE TO REFLECT A
24 TRANSFER OF THE FRANCHISE RIGHTS TO TESORO REFINING AND
25 MARKETING COMPANY, AND ON THIS ITEM, A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 REQUESTS THIS ITEM BE HELD. ON ITEM 46, THIS IS AN ORDINANCE
2 FOR INTRODUCTION AMENDING THE PROPRIETARY PETROLEUM PIPELINE
3 FRANCHISE GRANTED TO TESORO SOCIAL PIPELINE COMPANY L.L.C. TO
4 EXTEND THE TERM OF THE FRANCHISE FOR TWO YEARS THROUGH
5 DECEMBER 31, 2017. AND ON THIS ITEM, A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
6 REQUESTS THAT THIS ITEM BE HELD. PUBLIC HEARING. ON ITEM 47,
7 WE WILL HOLD THIS FOR HEARING. ON PAGE 25, MISCELLANEOUS
8 ADDITIONS TO THE AGENDA WHICH WERE POSTED MORE THAN 72 HOURS
9 IN ADVANCE OF THE MEETING AS INDICATED ON THE SUPPLEMENTAL
10 AGENDA. ON ITEM 48-A, SUPERVISOR RIDLEY-THOMAS REQUESTS THIS
11 ITEM BE CONTINUED TWO WEEKS TO DECEMBER 1, 2015.

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MOTION BY SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-
14 THOMAS. SECOND WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED ON THE
15 CONTINUANCE.

16

17 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** ON PAGE 28, NOTICES
18 OF CLOSED SESSION. ON ITEM C.S.-3, THE INTERIM COUNTY COUNSEL
19 REQUESTS THIS ITEM BE CONTINUED ONE WEEK TO NOVEMBER 24, 2015.
20 ON C.S.-3. ALSO, ON ITEM C.S.-1 AND C.S.-4, A MEMBER OR
21 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC REQUEST THESE ITEMS BE HELD. THIS ALSO
22 INCLUDES ITEM C.S.-7 AS POSTED ON THE SUPPLEMENTAL AGENDA.
23 THAT COMPLETES THE READING OF THE AGENDA. BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
24 SPECIAL ITEMS BEGIN WITH SUPERVISORIAL DISTRICT NO. 2.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS,
2 SUPERVISOR SHEILA KUEHL, DO YOU HAVE ANY? SUPERVISOR DON
3 KNABE? SUPERVISOR, DO YOU HAVE ANY? NOW THIS IS A VERY, VERY
4 SPECIAL LITTLE BOY. THIS IS GUS GUS. HE'S LOOKING FOR A HOME.
5 NOW YOU CAN CALL HIM GUS OR GUS GUS, HE DOESN'T CARE, BUT HE
6 JUST WOULD LIKE TO HAVE A LITTLE HOME. YOU CAN CALL 562-256-
7 1649. WHAT HAPPENED? OKAY, I THOUGHT YOU SAID HE HAD PEED.
8 [LAUGHTER.] HE'S LOOKING DOWN, OH MY GOSH. ANYWAY, GUS GUS IS
9 LOOKING FOR A HOME. YOU CAN CALL 562-256-1649. HE'S A CUTE
10 LITTLE BOY AND HE'S ONLY 8 WEEKS OLD. HE LOOKS VERY SHARP IN
11 THAT LITTLE RED PORSCHE THAT ONE OF MY COLLEAGUES DRIVES.
12 SOUTH, NORTH, EAST, WEST PARTS OF THE COUNTY ZIPPING ALONG.
13 RAIN OR SHINE. LOOK AT THAT. HE'S GOT THE RED BOW, READY TO
14 MATCH THE CAR, SHEILA. I'M NOT SAYING WHO IT IS, BUT--
15 [LAUGHTER.] ANYWAY, THIS LITTLE GUS IS LOOKING FOR A HOME.
16 THIS WOULD BE VERY PEACEFUL COMPARED TO THE MOOSE YOU HAVE,
17 SACHI. [LAUGHTER.] OKAY, GUS, WE WILL GET YOU A HOME. THERE'S
18 THREE OF THEM. THERE ARE THREE LITTLE TRIPLETS THAT ARE
19 LOOKING FOR THAT HOME WHO ARE GUS'S SIBLINGS.

20

21 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** MEMBERS OF THE
22 PUBLIC, IT IS YOUR RIGHT AND THE BOARD'S INTENT TO ENCOURAGE
23 THE PUBLIC'S PARTICIPATION IN TODAY'S BOARD HEARING. THE RIGHT
24 OF THE PUBLIC TO ADDRESS THE BOARD MUST BE BALANCED WITH THE
25 NEED TO ENSURE THAT PUBLIC COMMENT DOES NOT INTERFERE WITH THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ORDERLY COURSE OF THE BOARD'S BUSINESS ON BEHALF OF THE PUBLIC
2 OR THE ABILITY OF OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC TO ADDRESS THE
3 BOARD. THE FOLLOWING CODE OF CONDUCT IS OPERATIVE DURING
4 TODAY'S BOARD HEARING AND ALL ARE REMINDED TO ABIDE BY THE
5 FOLLOWING RULES: SPEAKERS MUST CEASE SPEAKING IMMEDIATELY WHEN
6 THEIR TIME IS ENDED. PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEMS MUST
7 RELATE TO THE SUBJECT MATTER OF THE ITEM. GENERAL PUBLIC
8 COMMENT IS LIMITED TO SUBJECTS WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE
9 BOARD. PUBLIC COMMENT DOES NOT INCLUDE THE RIGHT TO ENGAGE IN
10 A DIALOGUE WITH BOARD MEMBERS OR STAFF. PLEASE REMAIN
11 RESPECTFUL OF THE FORUM AND REFRAIN FROM UTTERING, WRITING OR
12 DISPLAYING PROFANE, PERSONAL, THREATENING, DEROGATORY,
13 DEMEANING OR OTHER ABUSIVE STATEMENTS TOWARD THE BOARD, ANY
14 MEMBER THEREOF, STAFF OR OTHER PERSONS. MEMBERS OF THE
15 AUDIENCE SHOULD BE RESPECTFUL OF THE VIEWS EXPRESSED BY
16 SPEAKERS, STAFF AND BOARD MEMBERS AND MAY NOT CLAP, CHEER,
17 WHISTLE OR OTHERWISE DISRUPT THE ORDERLY CONDUCT OF THE
18 MEETING. A PERSON ENGAGING IN CONDUCT THAT DISRUPTS THE
19 MEETING IS SUBJECT TO BEING REMOVED FROM THE BOARD HEARING. IF
20 YOU WITNESS CONDUCTOR BEHAVIOR BY OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
21 THAT DISRUPTS YOUR ABILITY TO REMAIN ENGAGED OR PARTICIPATE IN
22 THE MEETING, PLEASE NOTIFY THE SERGEANT AT ARMS OR OTHER
23 COUNTY STAFF. THANK YOU.
24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS ON ITEM
2 9, 43.

3

4 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** MR. MAYOR, AT THE REQUEST OF SUPERVISOR
5 KUEHL, I'M WILLING TO DEFER TO HER WITH RESPECT TO ITEM 47.

6

7 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. SUPERVISOR?

8

9 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** SO WE CAN TAKE UP ITEM 47 JUST SO EVERYBODY
10 KNOWS WHAT WE'RE DOING, I THINK? IT STARTS WITH A REPORT.

11

12 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** ON ITEM 47, THIS IS
13 A HEARING ON AMENDMENT TO LOS ANGELES COUNTY CODE TITLE 22
14 PLANNING AND ZONING, TO REGULATE VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA
15 MOUNTAINS, NORTH AREA COMMUNITY STANDARDS DISTRICT, DEFINING
16 VINEYARDS AS A USE REQUIRING A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT FOR ALL
17 NEW OR EXPANDING VINEYARDS AND ADDING DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS
18 FOR ALL NEW, EXPANDING AND EXISTING VINEYARDS. THERE WILL BE A
19 DEPARTMENTAL STATEMENT. CORRESPONDENCE WAS RECEIVED ON THIS
20 ITEM.

21

22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** YES, MA'AM.

23

24 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** FOR ALL THOSE WHO
25 PLAN TO TESTIFY BEFORE THE BOARD, PLEASE STAND AND RAISE YOUR

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 RIGHT HAND TO BE SWORN IN. IN THE TESTIMONY YOU MAY GIVE
2 BEFORE THIS BOARD, DO YOU SOLEMNLY SWEAR TO TELL THE TRUTH,
3 THE WHOLE TRUTH AND NOTHING BUT THE TRUTH SO HELP YOU GOD?
4

5 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MICROPHONE. TRY IT NOW.
6

7 **ANITA GUTIERREZ:** GOOD MORNING, SUPERVISORS. ANITA GUTIERREZ
8 FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL PLANNING. WE'RE HERE TODAY TO
9 PRESENT AN AMENDMENT TO THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA
10 COMMUNITY STANDARDS DISTRICT TO ADDRESS VINEYARD DEVELOPMENT
11 IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA. ON JUNE 16TH OF THIS
12 YEAR, YOUR BOARD PASSED AN URGENCY ORDINANCE WHICH PLACED A
13 TEMPORARY PROHIBITION ON NEW VINEYARDS AS A PRIMARY OR
14 ACCESSORY USE FOR ALL PROPERTIES LOCATED WITHIN THE C.S.D. THE
15 URGENCY ORDINANCE WAS ENACTED IN RESPONSE TO A LARGE SURGE IN
16 VINEYARD APPLICATIONS SUBMITTED WITHIN THE LAST YEAR. THERE
17 WERE CONCERNS OVER THE POTENTIAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS SUCH
18 INCREASED VINEYARD DEVELOPMENT COULD CAUSE AND THE LACK OF
19 EXISTING REGULATIONS GOVERNING VINEYARDS WITHIN THE SANTA
20 MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA. THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH
21 AREA IS AN UNINCORPORATED PORTION OF THE SANTA MONICA
22 MOUNTAINS THAT LIES WEST OF THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES AND NORTH
23 OF THE COASTAL ZONE BOUNDARY. THE MEDITERRANEAN ECOSYSTEM
24 FOUND WITHIN THIS AREA, ALONG WITH ITS DIVERSE TOPOGRAPHY HAS
25 CREATED A LANDSCAPE FILLED WITH UNIQUE, NATURAL RESOURCES

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 INCLUDING MORE THAN 50 ENDANGERED PLANTS AND ANIMALS.
2 INCREASED VINEYARD DEVELOPMENT IN THIS AREA MAY LEAD TO
3 UNINTENDED ENVIRONMENTAL CONSEQUENCES, SUCH AS HABITAT LOSS
4 AND FRAGMENTATION, WATER QUALITY DEGRADATION, DIMINISHED
5 SCENIC VIEWS AND GROUND WATER DEPLETION, ESPECIALLY WHEN
6 NATIVE VEGETATION AND SENSITIVE HABITATS ARE REMOVED TO MAKE
7 ROOM FOR NEW VINEYARDS. CURRENT REGULATIONS ARE UNABLE TO
8 ADDRESS THESE IMPACTS AS MOST VINEYARDS WOULD BE APPROVED
9 THROUGH MINISTERIAL SITE REVIEW. AS SUCH ON JULY 28TH OF THIS
10 YEAR, THE BOARD EXTENDED THE URGENCY ORDINANCE AND DIRECTED
11 REGIONAL PLANNING TO PREPARE AN ORDINANCE WITHIN 120 DAYS THAT
12 WOULD ADDRESS VINEYARD DEVELOPMENT IN THE SANTA MONICA
13 MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA. OVER THE PAST FOUR MONTHS, REGIONAL
14 PLANNING HAS WORKED WITH THE DEPARTMENTS OF PUBLIC HEALTH,
15 PUBLIC WORKS, AGRICULTURAL COMMISSIONER, WEIGHTS AND MEASURES
16 AS WELL AS VINTNERS, APPLICANTS WITH PENDING PROJECTS AND
17 ENVIRONMENTAL GROUPS TO DRAFT A VINEYARD ORDINANCE FOR THE
18 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA. REGIONAL PLANNING HELD FOUR
19 STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS WITH WINE GROWERS AND APPLICANTS TO GET
20 FEEDBACK AND INPUT INTO THE POSSIBLE STANDARDS AND LANGUAGE TO
21 INCLUDE WITHIN THE PROPOSED ORDINANCE. MANY OF THE STANDARDS
22 INCORPORATED INTO THIS ORDINANCE CAME FROM THE CODE OF
23 SUSTAINABLE WINE GROWING WORKBOOK AS WELL AS BEST MANAGEMENT
24 PRACTICES ALREADY UTILIZED IN THE LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM. IN
25 ADDITION, REGIONAL PLANNING ALSO CONSULTED WITH ENVIRONMENTAL

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ORGANIZATIONS SUCH AS HEAL THE BAY AND THE SANTA MONICA
2 MOUNTAINS CONSERVANCY TO DRAFT DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS THAT
3 WOULD APPROPRIATELY ADDRESS IMPACTS TO NATURAL AND SCENIC
4 RESOURCES. UNDER THE PROPOSED ORDINANCE, VINEYARDS WOULD BE
5 DEFINED AS A PLANTATION OF GRAPEVINES THAT TYPICALLY PRODUCE
6 TABLE GRAPES OR GRAPES USED IN WINE MAKING. NEW AND EXPANDING
7 VINEYARDS WOULD BE SUBJECT TO A DISCRETIONARY REVIEW, WHICH
8 WOULD ENSURE THAT POTENTIAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS ARE
9 IDENTIFIED AND MITIGATED TO THE GREATEST EXTENT FEASIBLE. AS
10 PART OF THIS REVIEW, VINEYARD APPLICANTS WOULD HAVE TO ADHERE
11 TO BEST MANAGEMENT PRACTICES FOR SOIL EROSION, PEST
12 MANAGEMENT, WATER CONSERVATION AND ON-SITE WATER RETENTION.
13 NEW AND EXPANDING VINEYARDS WOULD ALSO HAVE TO BE SITED TO
14 AVOID SENSITIVE HABITATS AND MINIMIZE IMPACTS TO SCENIC VIEWS,
15 AND WOULD BE SUBJECT TO SIZE AND SLOPE LIMITATIONS. THE
16 PROPOSED ORDINANCE WOULD ONLY APPLY TO VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA
17 MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA. THE ORDINANCE WOULD APPLY TO NEW
18 AND PENDING VINEYARD APPLICATIONS AND ALL EXISTING VINEYARDS
19 WOULD HAVE FIVE YEARS TO COMPLY WITH BEST MANAGEMENT PRACTICE
20 STANDARDS. ON SEPTEMBER 30 OF THIS YEAR, THE REGIONAL PLANNING
21 COMMISSION HELD A PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER THE PROPOSED
22 ORDINANCE. DURING THAT HEARING, 23 SPEAKERS TESTIFIED BEFORE
23 THE COMMISSION. 15 IN FAVOR AND 8 OPPOSED TO THE PROPOSED
24 ORDINANCE. THOSE IN FAVOR OF THE PROPOSED ORDINANCE INCLUDED
25 ENVIRONMENTAL GROUPS SUCH AS HEAL THE BAY, THE SANTA MONICA

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 MOUNTAINS RESOURCE CONSERVATION DISTRICT AS WELL AS LOCAL
2 HOMEOWNER GROUPS. MANY OF THESE SUPPORTERS ACTUALLY REQUIRED
3 STRICTER REGULATIONS. SPECIFICALLY THEY REQUESTED LARGER
4 BUFFERS BETWEEN VINEYARDS AND SENSITIVE HABITATS, SLOPE
5 RESTRICTIONS ON VINEYARDS LESS THAN A TENTH OF AN ACRE AND
6 WILDLIFE PERMEABLE FENCING, AND MANY SUPPORTERS EVEN PROPOSED
7 AN OUTRIGHT BAN OF VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS
8 NORTH AREA. THE OPPOSITION EXPRESSED CONCERNS WITH FENCING
9 REQUIREMENTS, NEW SIZE RESTRICTIONS ON VINEYARDS AND
10 DISCRETIONARY REVIEW. AFTER THE TESTIMONY, THE COMMISSION
11 APPROVED THE MOTION TO ADD ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS INTO THE
12 ORDINANCE THAT VINEYARD APPLICANTS PROVIDE PROJECTED WATER
13 USAGE AND, IF APPLICABLE, WATER WELL DATA FOR VINEYARD
14 IRRIGATION AND OPERATIONS. THE COMMISSION ULTIMATELY VOTED 3-0
15 TO RECOMMEND TO YOUR BOARD TO HOLD THE PUBLIC HEARING TO
16 CONSIDER THE PROPOSED ORDINANCE AS AMENDED AND TO ADOPT THE
17 ORDINANCE AS WELL AS THE ASSOCIATED NEGATIVE DECLARATION. THE
18 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS IS REGULATED BY TWO SEPARATE DOCUMENTS,
19 THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM AND THE SANTA
20 MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA PLAN. HOWEVER, AS DISCUSSED
21 EARLIER, THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS AS A WHOLE IS ONE
22 ECOSYSTEM WITH THE SAME TYPES OF HABITAT THROUGHOUT THE NORTH
23 AREA THAT IS STILL VIGOROUSLY PROTECTED IN THE COASTAL ZONE.
24 THEREFORE, REGIONAL PLANNING RECOMMENDS APPROVAL OF THE
25 PROPOSED ORDINANCE TO ENSURE THAT FUTURE VINEYARD DEVELOPMENT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA OCCURS IN A MANNER
2 THAT IS SENSITIVE TO THE AREA'S UNIQUE RESOURCES. THANK YOU.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. WE HAVE A NUMBER OF PUBLIC
5 TESTIMONY. DAN FREDMAN. TOBY KEELER. SNOWDY DODSON. BATTA
6 VUJICIC. MORNING.

7

8 **DAN FREDMAN:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS DAN FREDMAN. I'M WITH
9 THE MALIBU COST VINTNERS AND GRAPE GROWERS ALLIANCE. I HAVE A
10 SMALL VINEYARD IN MALIBU. BEEN UP HERE WITH MALIBU FOR 15
11 YEARS, HAD A VINEYARD FOR 3. I'M HERE WITH THE GROUP
12 REQUESTING A POSTPONEMENT TO VOTE ON THIS. THE INITIAL
13 EMERGENCY ORDINANCE WAS DONE IMPROPERLY. IT WAS NOT RESEARCHED
14 PROPERLY. IT WAS INITIALLY BASED ON THE DROUGHT. WE PROVED
15 THAT GRAPEVINES, THEY ARE DROUGHT TOLERANT. THEN IT GOT MOVED
16 OVER TO THE SITUATION WITH THE INCREASE OF THE ADDITIONAL
17 APPLICATIONS. WE FOUND OUT THAT THAT WAS BECAUSE OF THE
18 DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL PLANNING SENT SOME PEOPLE OVER TO THE
19 TRIUNFO LOBO COMMUNITY NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION TO SPEAK, AND
20 TOLD THEM THAT THEY SHOULD ALL GO FILE FOR THEIR PERMITS
21 IMMEDIATELY SO THEY COULD BE GRANDFATHERED IN ONCE THE NEW
22 S.E.A. STUFF IS HERE. WE HAVE CONTINUED TO PRESENT THAT
23 INFORMATION TO THE DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL PLANNING AND TO
24 SUPERVISOR KUEHL'S OFFICE, YET WE STILL SEE THAT BROUGHT UP AS
25 A PRIMARY THING. THERE IS A VIDEO ON YOUTUBE THAT COVERS THIS.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 WE WENT IN IN GOOD FAITH, SPEAKING WITH DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL
2 PLANNING TO GET AS MUCH INFORMATION AS POSSIBLE. WE FELT WE
3 WERE MAKING A LOT OF PROGRESS AND THAT THEY WERE LISTENING TO
4 US. COME TO FIND OUT AT THE VERY END OF IT WE'RE TOLD, NO,
5 WE'RE GOING TO REVERT TO THE PLAN THAT THE COASTAL COMMISSION
6 USED, WHICH BANS VINEYARDS. THE VERY FEW THINGS THAT THEY HAVE
7 ALLOWED US IN TERMS OF TO PETITION THE DIRECTOR FOR, WE JUST
8 DON'T FEEL WE'RE GOING TO GET A PROPER HEARING FOR IT. WE
9 BELIEVE THAT WITH ENOUGH ADDITIONAL RESEARCH, WE WILL BE ABLE
10 TO DRAW UP A PLAN THAT WILL ENABLE THE 150 YEARS OF MALIBU
11 GRAPES AND GRAPEVINES IN THIS AREA TO CONTINUE. THANK YOU VERY
12 MUCH.

13

14 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. EMMA WILBY. YES, MA'AM.

15

16 **SNOWDY DODSON:** AM I ON?

17

18 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** YOU'RE ON.

19

20 **SNOWDY DODSON:** SNOWDY DODSON WITH THE CALIFORNIA NATIVE PLANT
21 SOCIETY. WE SUBMITTED A LETTER. I JUST WANT TO GIVE SOME ADDED
22 INFORMATION. CURRENTLY, THE LOCAL COASTAL PLAN PROHIBITS
23 FURTHER VINEYARD DEVELOPMENT IN THAT COASTAL AREA. I THINK
24 THAT IT'S UNFAIR TO THE PEOPLE, THE ANIMALS AND THE
25 ENVIRONMENT IN THE NORTHERN REGION TO NOT ALSO BE AFFORDED

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THAT OPPORTUNITY. I THINK VINEYARDS SHOULD BE BANNED IN THAT
2 AREA, TOO. I FEAR THAT IF WE GO FORWARD WITH THIS, THE CAMEL'S
3 NOSE IS IN THE DOOR AND THEN WE WILL ALLOW VINEYARDS IN THE
4 COASTAL AREA TOO. SO I SEE THAT AS HAPPENING IN THE FUTURE.
5 IT'S A REAL THING THAT COULD HAPPEN. HOWEVER, IF THIS
6 ORDINANCE GOES FORWARD, IT NEEDS TO BE TWEAKED. I DON'T THINK
7 IT SHOULD BE APPROVED AS WRITTEN RIGHT NOW. I THINK
8 REQUIREMENTS SHOULD BE MORE STRINGENT. THERE SHOULD BE MORE
9 TREES PROTECTED ON THE LIST AS WE SUBMITTED A LETTER FROM OUR
10 GROUP. THERE SHOULD BE MANY, MANY MORE STRINGENT REQUIREMENTS
11 ON ANY FURTHER VINEYARDS IF INDEED THAT IS WHAT WE WANT IN THE
12 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS, IN OUR COUNTY: THERE ISN'T MUCH
13 COASTAL SAGE SCRUB LEFT IN THIS WORLD. THERE ISN'T MUCH
14 CHAPARRAL. TURNING IT INTO ANY KIND OF VINEYARDS REALLY DOES
15 NOT PROTECT THE ENVIRONMENT, DOES NOT FURTHER ANYTHING ABOUT
16 THE BEAUTY OF OUR COUNTY AND OF OUR SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS.
17 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, SIR.

20

21 **TOBY KEELER:** TOBY KEELER. OLD TOPANGA HOMEOWNERS AND FRIENDS
22 OF THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. 21,000 SPECTACULAR PRISTINE
23 ACRES OF RUGGED CANYONS AND SWEEPING RIDGE LINES MUST BE
24 PROTECTED FROM THE THREAT OF NEW COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS. WE NEED
25 YOUR STRONG AND CRUCIAL VOICE TO SAY NO TO COMMERCIAL

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA PLAN. THIS
2 IS NOT ABOUT BACKYARD GARDENS. AFTER DECADES OF HARD-FOUGHT
3 BATTLES AND INVESTING MILLIONS IN PUBLIC FUNDS IN PRESERVING
4 OPEN SPACE AND PROTECTING THIS NATURAL LANDSCAPE, WE CANNOT
5 LET SPECIAL INTERESTS FROM THE CENTRAL VALLEY AND ELSEWHERE
6 PREVAIL IN CARVING OUT AND STRIPPING HUGE SWATHS OF NATIVE
7 HABITAT AND REPLACING IT WITH NON NATIVE COMMERCIAL VINEYARD
8 CROPS. NO TO CREATING A PATCHWORK OF VINEYARD PLANTATION,
9 BLIGHT THAT HORRIBLY FRAGMENTS THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS.
10 COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS ARE A MENACE TO OUR ENVIRONMENT AND OUR
11 MAGNIFICENT SCENIC RESOURCES AND TO OUR FRAGILE WILDLIFE AND
12 ECOSYSTEM. SUPPORT ITEM NO. 47. BAN COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS.
13 THANK YOU.

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP JOAN
16 YACOVONE AND JOEL SCHULMAN.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, SUPERVISORS. GREETING TO YOU ALL. GLAD
19 TO BE HERE TO OFFER ADDITIONAL INPUT ON THE PROPOSED ORDINANCE
20 AND WOULD LIKE TO RELATE AND ECHO AGAIN THE MESSAGE THAT WE
21 WORKED DILIGENTLY WITH YOUR STAFF IN AN ATTEMPT TO ARRIVAL TO
22 A MUTUAL BALANCED ORDINANCE AND PROPOSAL. WITH IN MIND FULLY
23 THAT YES INDEED, WE DO LIVE IN AN AREA THAT IS EXCEPTIONALLY
24 BEAUTIFUL AND GORGEOUS. AND I PERSONALLY HAVE RAISED MY FAMILY
25 IN MIDST OF IT AND I VALUE THE ENVIRONMENT THAT WE LIVE IN. I

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 VALUE THE HILLS THAT WE LIVE IN. BUT WE DO NOT WORSHIP THE
2 HILLS. WE VALUE AND ARE GOOD STEWARDS OF THE HILLS. WE FEEL
3 THAT ALL OF THE LAYERS OF THE ORDINANCES THAT WERE PROPOSED
4 OVER THE YEARS TO PROTECT THOSE MOUNTAINS ARE DONE WITH THAT
5 IN MIND, TO PROTECT. BUT YET AT THE COST OF THE TAXPAYERS.
6 COST OF THE PRIVATE PROPERTY OWNERS AND AS SUCH, WE FEEL THAT
7 IT'S ALMOST AS A CAMEL THAT-- AS A STRAW THAT BREAKS THE
8 CAMEL'S BACK. AND WE FEEL THAT THAT PROTECTION PERHAPS SHOULD
9 CONTINUE. BUT IT SHOULD NOT BE ONLY THE BURDEN AND HARDSHIP OF
10 THE PRIVATE PROPERTY OWNERS. IF PERHAPS IT SHOULD BE PLACED ON
11 THE BURDEN OF THE SOCIETY IN GENERAL SO THAT WE INDEED HAVE
12 THAT IN TIME TO COME. NOW, IN DEALING WITH THE STAFF, STAFF
13 HAS IN GOOD FAITH MET WITH US. WE DISCUSSED MANY ELEMENTS OF
14 IT AND FURTHER THIS MORNING I MET WITH THE STAFF AND THEY
15 CLEARED UP SEVERAL POINTS FOR ME. ONE OF THEM WAS THAT ANY AND
16 ALL EXISTING FLOOD PLANS THAT WERE APPROVED ARE PART OF THOSE
17 VINEYARDS THAT ARE CONFORMING AND THEY WILL BE AS SUCH TREATED
18 AS A BEST PRACTICE MANAGEMENT AND THEY WILL NOT BE CLASSIFIED
19 INCONVENIENCE.

20

21 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. WRAP IT UP.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** BASICALLY IN WRAPPING UP, THE ASSURANCE THAT I
24 PERSONALLY RECEIVED IS GOOD. I RECEIVED THAT FROM NICOLE AND
25 FROM ANITA THIS MORNING. AS FAR AS MINISTERIAL APPROVAL OF

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 VERIFICATION, IT WILL BE DONE ONLY BY DIRECTOR AND NOT LINKED
2 INTO THE C.U.P. AND ALSO WANTED TO ECHO MR. BEN FREDMAN'S
3 REQUEST TO POSTPONE THIS HEARING FOR HEMMING UP A BETTER
4 ORDINANCE THAT WILL BE BALANCED. AND AS SUCH, THE ASSOCIATION
5 OF CONEJO SIMI MOORPARK REALTORS HAVE SENT A LETTER REQUESTING
6 CONSIDERATION FOR DELAY. THANK YOU FOR THE TIME.

7

8 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. KIM LAMORIE. YES, MA'AM.

9

10 **EMMA WILBY:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS EMMA WILBY AND I SUPPORT
11 THE AMENDMENT REGULATING THE VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA
12 MOUNTAINS BUT I FEEL IT IS NOT ADEQUATE. MONITORING IS
13 ESSENTIAL TO SUCCESS OF THIS AMENDMENT, AND THE COST AND
14 FREQUENCY OF MONITORING NEED TO BE ADDRESSED. SO I REQUEST
15 CONTINUING THE CURRENT BAN ON ALL NEW VINEYARDS. THANK YOU.

16

17 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP MOLLIE
18 HELFAND. YES, MA'AM.

19

20 **JOAN YACAVONE:** JOAN YACAVONE. I LIVE IN LIBERTY CANYON IN THE
21 AGOURA HILLS AREA AND I SUPPORT A BAN OF UNFORTUNATELY ALL
22 VINEYARDS. WHAT I HAVE SEEN HAPPEN IN LIBERTY CANYON IS THAT
23 RESIDENTS BECOME ENAMORED WITH THE IDEA OF GROWING GRAPES ON
24 THEIR SLOPES AND MOST OF OUR SLOPES IN LIBERTY CANYON ARE 2-1
25 SLOPES. AND THEN WHEN THEY REALIZE THAT GROWING GRAPES IS NOT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 JUST A ONE-TIME THING, THAT IT REQUIRES MAINTENANCE AND
2 CERTAINLY A LOT OF WORK AND ATTENTION, THE VINEYARDS THAT ARE
3 ON THESE SLOPES ARE THEN ABANDONED. AND WHAT HAPPENS IS
4 THEY'RE NEVER REPLANTED. SO RIGHT NOW I HAVE SEEN SEVERAL IN
5 MY NEIGHBORHOOD OF THESE DENUDED, TERRACED SLOPES, WHICH I CAN
6 ONLY HOPE WILL SURVIVE IF WE ACTUALLY DO HAVE A LOT OF RAIN
7 THIS LAST YEAR. ALSO VINEYARDS ARE JUST INCOMPATIBLE WITH THE
8 WILDLIFE CORRIDOR WE'RE TRYING TO PROMOTE IN THE LIBERTY
9 CANYON AREA. SO I DO SUPPORT THIS ITEM 47. THANK YOU.

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP KATHY
12 BERKOWITZ AND SUSAN RANDALL KNIPE. YES, SIR.

13

14 **JOEL SCHULMAN:** I'M JOEL SCHULMAN. I'M A MEMBER OF POISON-FREE
15 MALIBU. WE'RE AN ORGANIZATION TRYING TO PRESERVE THE WILDLIFE
16 IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS AND ELSEWHERE, ESPECIALLY FROM
17 THE RODENT POISONS WHICH ARE AFFECTING THE WILDLIFE AT THE 90
18 PERCENT LEVEL. SO WE TOTALLY SUPPORT A BAN OF VINEYARDS IN
19 THIS NORTH AREA. THE PUBLIC LOVES OUR PRECIOUS COASTAL
20 MOUNTAIN ECOSYSTEM. I'VE SEEN VISITOR USAGE INCREASE
21 INCREDIBLY IN THE DECADES THAT I'VE LIVED THERE. IF YOU STAND
22 IN THE RIGHT PLACES IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS, YOU CAN GET
23 THE FEELING OF BEING TOTALLY SURROUNDED BY NATURE AND NOTHING
24 ELSE. BUT THE WONDERFUL FEELING-- THERE ARE FEW PLACES LIKE
25 THIS LEFT AND THEY ARE DECREASING. FURTHERMORE, A VERY

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 IMPORTANT POINT, AS WE ARE LEARNING FROM OUR LOCAL MOUNTAIN
2 LIONS. BOBCATS AND OTHER WILDLIFE, THE IDEA OF A CRITICAL
3 MASSIVE OPEN SPACE. IF YOU DECREASE THE AMOUNT OF NATURE BY 10
4 PERCENT, THAT DOESN'T DECREASE THE HABITAT FOR WILDLIFE BY 10
5 PERCENT; IT COULD BE 20 PERCENT OR 30 PERCENT. WILDLIFE NEEDS
6 A CERTAIN AMOUNT. AND YOU CAN'T JUST DECREASE IT AND EXPECT
7 THE WILDLIFE TO CONTINUE, ESPECIALLY MOUNTAIN LIONS IS IN THAT
8 CATEGORY. FURTHERMORE, AS RECENT NEWS HAS TAUGHT US, IF YOU'VE
9 NOTICED, ANOTHER MOUNTAIN LION DIED LAST MONTH, P34 IN POINT
10 MUGU STATE PARK. MANY OF THEM ARE DYING OF THIS ANTICOAGULANT
11 RODENTICIDES THAT ARE USED IN AN ABUNDANCE BY MANY OF THE
12 VINEYARDS. THE SANTA MONICA LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM HAS A BAN ON
13 ANTICOAGULANT RODENTICIDES IN IT. THIS ALSO SHOULD. I DON'T
14 THINK IT DOES AT THIS POINT. IT'S VERY IMPORTANT TO PROTECT
15 THE WILDLIFE. IT CAN ALSO ALWAYS BE ARGUED THAT A BIT MORE
16 LAND CAN BE SACRIFICED FOR VINEYARDS OR AGRICULTURE OR BALL
17 FIELDS OR ALL KINDS OF NICE THINGS. BUT THAT PHILOSOPHY IS
18 EXACTLY WHAT IS WIPING OUT THE TINY AMOUNT OF NATURE THAT WE
19 HAVE LEFT. THE RESULT IS THAT 90 PERCENT OF NATURE IS GONE AND
20 WE CANNOT AFFORD ANYMORE. THANK YOU.

21

22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
23 ROGER PUGLIESE. YES, MA'AM.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **KIM LAMORIE:** GOOD MORNING, HONORABLE SUPERVISORS. MY NAME IS
2 KIM LAMORIE AND I'M PRESIDENT OF THE FEDERATION REPRESENTING
3 MORE THAN 10,000 HOMEOWNERS AND PROPERTY OWNERS IN THE SANTA
4 MONICA MOUNTAINS. WE SUPPORT A VINEYARD ORDINANCE FOR THE
5 NORTH AREA PLAN THAT IS CONSISTENT WITH THE L.C.P. AS RESIDENT
6 ACTIVISTS FOR 47 YEARS, WE'VE WORKED WITH THE COUNTY TO
7 DEVELOP AND DRIVE TO FRUITION BOTH N.A.P. AND THE L.C.P. WE
8 KNOW BETTER THAN ANYONE ELSE, THERE IS NO DISTINCTION BETWEEN
9 THESE TWO LANDSCAPES AND ECOSYSTEM. ONE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS
10 AND WE NEED TO LOCK IN THE SAME NATURAL RESOURCE PROTECTIONS
11 FOR N.A.P., FROM COMMERCIAL VINEYARD PLANTATIONS THAT FRAGMENT
12 AND STRIP NATIVE HABITAT, DESTROY THE ENVIRONMENT AND ARE
13 SCENIC ASSETS. CUMULATIVE VINEYARDS THAT PERMANENTLY DISFIGURE
14 AND CONVERT THE WILD ENVIRONMENT INTO UNSIGHTLY COMMERCIAL
15 OPERATIONS ALSO DESTROY HOMEOWNER PROPERTY VALUES AND OUR
16 COMMUNITY'S QUALITY OF LIFE. THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS ARE A
17 RENOWNED TREASURE, SPECTACULAR AND UNPARALLELED RAW BEAUTY AND
18 L.A. COUNTY CITIZENS ARE HEAVILY INVESTED IN PRESERVING AND
19 RECREATING IN THEM. MILLIONS OF TAX DOLLARS HAVE BEEN SPENT ON
20 OPEN SPACE, TRAILS, PARK LAND AND ON SCENIC ROUTE
21 PRESERVATIONS, NOT TO BE EXPLOITED BY COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS.
22 VINEYARDS ARE A SERIOUS AND DEADLY THREAT TO ALREADY IMPERILED
23 WILDLIFE. THEIR HABITAT IS BULLDOZED, BLOCKED, REPLANTED WITH
24 A CROP FOOD SOURCE THAT LURES THEM IN, THEN RAZOR AND BARBED
25 WIRE IS INSTALLED AND INTERWOVEN IN NONPERMEABLE FENCING TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 KEEP THEM OUT. THE NETTING IS LAYERED OVER THE CROPS, ONCE
2 AGAIN LURING IN, TANGLING AND KILLING NATIVE BIRDS. VIA
3 VINEYARDS, RODENTICIDES AND OTHER POISONS ARE INSERTED
4 DIRECTLY INTO THE FOOD CHAIN, POISONING OUR LEGENDARY
5 PREDATORS. THE PROPOSED ORDINANCE MUST ALSO REQUIRE,
6 THEREFORE, WILDLIFE PERMEABLE FENCING. REMOVAL AND PROHIBITION
7 OF RAZOR AND BARBED WIRE, 200-FOOT SETBACKS FROM E.S.H.A.,
8 WHICH IS THE SAME AS THE L.C.P., AND GARDEN VINEYARDS NEED TO
9 COMPLY WITH DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS AND 3:1 SLOPE REQUIREMENTS.
10 AS STEWARDS OF THE ENVIRONMENT, WE NEED TO PROTECT OUR
11 WILDLIFE AND RESOURCES. THE SPECIAL INTERESTS OF A FEW CANNOT
12 TRUMP THE PEOPLE'S BEST INTERESTS. PLEASE SUPPORT ONE
13 CONSISTENT VINEYARD POLICY FOR THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS.
14 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

15

16 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. JIM PALMER. YES, MA'AM.

17

18 **KATHY BERKOWITZ:** GOOD MORNING, HONORABLE SUPERVISORS. MY NAME
19 IS KATHY BERKOWITZ AND I AM IN FAVOR OF ITEM 47. I LIVE ON THE
20 EDGE OF THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAIN ECOSYSTEM AND HAVE PLANTED
21 GRAPES IN MY YARD ONLY TO DISCOVER THAT ALL GRAPES EVENTUALLY
22 HAD A BITE OUT OF THEM. THE SOFT FRUIT SEEMED TO LURE IN EVERY
23 RAT, SQUIRREL AND BIRD AROUND TO THE FEAST. OUR MENTOR IN THE
24 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAIN, DAVE BROWN, USED TO SAY, "OUR CRITTERS
25 ARE OTHER PEOPLE'S VERMIN." CERTAINLY THIS WOULD BE THE CASE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 OF THE COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS WHO WOULD HAVE TO KILL CRITTERS TO
2 HAVE A PROFITABLE ENTERPRISE. PEOPLE OF OUR URBAN AREAS FLOCK
3 TO THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS EVERY WEEKEND TO ENJOY THE
4 NATURAL BEAUTY AND TO EXPERIENCE THE WILD LAND. COMMERCIAL
5 VINEYARDS WOULD BE A BLIGHT ON THE ECOSYSTEM. I DON'T SEE HOW
6 THEY COULD BE COMPATIBLE WITH THIS NATURAL AREA. I THEREFORE
7 PROPOSE THAT WE BAN ALL COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS IN THE NORTH AREA
8 PLAN.

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP MICHAEL
11 HART. YES, MA'AM.

12

13 **SUSAN RANDALL KNIPE:** SUSAN RANDALL. GOOD MORNING, SUPERVISORS,
14 I'M LUCKY ENOUGH TO LIVE ON A HORSE RANCH IN THE SANTA MONICA
15 MOUNTAINS AND I SUPPORT 47. HOWEVER, MY RANCH EXISTS SOLELY ON
16 WELL WATER. SO I BEG YOU, PLEASE BAN COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS.
17 THANK YOU.

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MA'AM. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
20 JOHN GOODEN. JOHN GOODEN. YES, SIR.

21

22 **ROGER PUGLIESE:** MY NAME IS ROGER PUGLIESE. I'M THE CHAIR OF
23 THE TOPANGA ASSOCIATION FOR A SCENIC COMMUNITY WITH A
24 MEMBERSHIP OF OVER 400 HOMEOWNERS IN THE CANYON. WE ARE IN
25 SUPPORT OF THE AMENDMENT THAT'S BEFORE YOU. THE NORTH AREA

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 PLAN COMPRISES ALMOST HALF OF THE TOPANGA COMMUNITY. WE ARE
2 ALSO IN SUPPORT OF A BAN ON NEW COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS IN THE
3 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. WE ALL KNOW THERE'S A BIG DIFFERENCE
4 BETWEEN COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS AND GARDEN-TYPE VINEYARDS. WE'RE
5 VERY CONCERNED WITH THE CONTINUED DEGRADATION OF THE MOUNTAIN
6 COMMUNITIES, SO WE STAND WITH OTHERS ON THE SUPPORT OF THE
7 AMENDMENT AND ALSO ON A FUTURE BAN OF NEW COMMERCIAL
8 VINEYARDS. THANK YOU.

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
11 KATHERINE PEASE. YES, SIR.

12

13 **JIM PALMER:** MY NAME IS JIM PALMER. I'M ASKING YOU TO VOTE NO,
14 DO NOT BAN VINEYARDS. IF ANYTHING, TAKE YOUR TIME TO EXAMINE
15 THE FACTS. I TAKE EXCEPTION TO THE SECOND SPEAKER WHO
16 REPRESENTED THEMSELVES FROM THE CALIFORNIA NATIVE PLANT
17 SOCIETY BECAUSE THERE IS A RECOMMENDED LIST OF NATIVE PLANTS
18 FOR THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS FROM THE CALIFORNIA NATIVE
19 PLANT SOCIETY, LOS ANGELES, SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS CHAPTER.
20 THIS PARTICULAR DOCUMENT WAS IN 1994 WHICH LISTS GRAPES AS A
21 NATIVE SPECIES INDIGENOUS TO THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. THIS
22 REPORT WAS LATER REVISED IN '96 AND IN '97 STATING THAT GRAPES
23 ARE NATIVE PLANTS TO THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS, ARE
24 INDIGENOUS TO THE AREA. SO TO VOTE TO BAN VINEYARDS, YOU ARE
25 VOTING TO BAN NATIVE SPECIES AND INDIGENOUS PLANTS TO THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AREA. THAT IS THE REASONING THAT I'M FINDING IT DIFFICULT TO
2 UNDERSTAND. SO COULD SOMEBODY PLEASE ADDRESS THIS QUESTION IN
3 THEIR COMMENTS AS TO WHY THEY WANT TO BAN A NATIVE PLANT THAT
4 IS INDIGENOUS TO THE AREA? THERE'S OTHER DOCUMENTS WHICH
5 SUPPORT THIS ARGUMENT. THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NATIONAL
6 PARK AREA, WHICH IS PART OF THE U.S. NATIONAL SERVICE, ALSO
7 SAYS THAT GRAPES ARE NATIVE PLANTS AND INDIGENOUS TO THE SANTA
8 MONICA MOUNTAINS. THERE'S NO WATER IN ANY OF THE WELLS. SO ALL
9 THE WATER THAT'S BEING USED TO IRRIGATE VINEYARDS IS COMING
10 FROM METERED WATER FROM SOURCES THAT SELL AT RETAIL. VINEYARDS
11 DO NOT USE GRADING. THEY PLANT ON CONTOURS. I RECEIVED A
12 LETTER FROM THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES AGRICULTURAL
13 COMMISSIONER ASKING FOR AN APPOINTMENT SO THAT THEY CAN COME
14 OUT ON THEIR ANNUAL INSPECTION TO APPROVE THE BEST MANAGEMENT
15 PRACTICES AND THE USE OF NATURAL MATERIALS. NO RODENTICIDES
16 ARE USED. WE ARE NOT RESPONSIBLE FOR ANY OF THESE PESTICIDE
17 ISSUES. SO PLEASE VOTE NO. CONSIDER THE FACTS.

18
19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP PAUL
20 CULBERG PAUL? YES, SIR.

21
22 **MICHAEL HART:** HI, MY NAME IS MICHAEL HART. I LIVE AT MALIBU
23 LAKE, RIGHT CLOSE TO THE MIDDLE OF THIS AREA. I'M IN FAVOR OF
24 47. I'M IN FAVOR ALSO OF A BAN OF COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS. I
25 DISAGREE WITH THE LAST GENTLEMAN. GRAPES MAY BE NATIVE PLANTS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 BUT NOT WINE GRAPES. THERE'S LOTS OF NATIVE GRAPES THAT AREN'T
2 THOSE TYPE OF GRAPES. THANK YOU.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
5 ALI ZADEH. YES, SIR.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, SUPERVISORS. SIX-MONTHS AGO, THERE WAS
8 NO URGENCY ORDINANCE AND THERE WAS NO VINEYARD ORDINANCE
9 BECAUSE THERE WAS NEVER A NEED FOR ONE. SUPERVISOR KUEHL
10 INTRODUCED THE URGENCY ORDINANCE AND WAS BASED ON A NOTICEABLE
11 SURGE IN NEW VINEYARD APPLICATIONS RECEIVED BY THE REGIONAL
12 PLANNING DEPARTMENT IN HER DISTRICT. WHAT SUPERVISOR KUEHL
13 FAILED TO DISCLOSE WAS THE SOURCE OF THE NOTICEABLE UPSURGE,
14 WHICH WAS A MEETING THAT TOOK PLACE BETWEEN THE REGIONAL
15 PLANNERS AND THE LOBO TRIUNFO CANYON HOMEOWNERS' ASSOCIATION
16 IN 2014. IN THAT MEETING, YOU CAN HEAR PLANNERS EMMA HOWARD,
17 DAVID MCDONALD AND JODY SACKETT ENCOURAGING THE HOMEOWNERS TO
18 SUBMIT THEIR APPLICATIONS. VIRTUALLY ALL OF THE NEW VINEYARD
19 APPLICATIONS WERE LOCALIZED IN THE TRIUNFO CANYON, LOBO CANYON
20 AREA AND RESULTED DIRECTLY FROM THIS MEETING WITH THE COUNTY
21 PLANNERS. FOR SUPERVISOR KUEHL NOT TO DISCLOSE THIS MEETING AS
22 THE SOURCE OF THE NOTICEABLE UPSURGE IN NEW VINEYARD
23 APPLICATIONS WAS INAPPROPRIATE AND A FORM OF DECEPTION. SHE
24 HAS HAD MONTHS TO CORRECT THIS MISINFORMATION, BUT SHE STILL
25 CHOOSES NOT TO. HER OWN DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL PLANNING

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ENCOURAGES HOMEOWNERS TO SUBMIT VINEYARD APPLICATIONS, THEN
2 WHEN SHE HID THAT INFORMATION FROM THE OTHER SUPERVISORS IN
3 ORDER TO CREATE THE BASIS FOR THE URGENCY ORDINANCE. WHAT
4 HAPPENED TO ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRANSPARENCY AND DISCLOSURE OF
5 INFORMATION IN OUR LOCAL GOVERNMENT? WE ARE ASKING THE
6 SUPERVISORS TODAY TO DO THE RIGHT THING AND NOT APPROVE THE
7 ORDINANCE AS PROPOSED. INSTEAD WE ASK THAT YOU DELAY A
8 DECISION AND GIVE THE DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL PLANNING
9 SUFFICIENT TIME TO CONDUCT FURTHER RESEARCH ON FENCING
10 ALTERNATIVES, BEST AGRICULTURAL PRACTICES AND PROVIDE THE
11 CITIZENS OF THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES WITH A PLAN THAT WILL
12 STAND THE TEST OF TIME. L.A. TAXPAYERS DO NOT NEED MORE LEGAL
13 EXPENSE DEFENDING POORLY, ILL-WRITTEN, ILL-CONCEIVED
14 ORDINANCES. THANK YOU.

15

16 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
17 STEVEN GILBARD. YES, MA'AM.

18

19 **KATHERINE PEASE:** GOOD MORNING, SUPERVISORS. MY NAME IS
20 KATHERINE PEASE AND I'M THE WATERSHED SCIENTIST AT HEAL THE
21 BAY. I'M HERE TODAY TO EXPRESS HEAL THE BAY'S CONCERN OVER THE
22 PROPOSED VINEYARD ORDINANCE FOR THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS
23 NORTH AREA. WHILE WE SUPPORT THE PROPOSED ORDINANCE AND ITS
24 PROHIBITION ON LARGE VINEYARDS, WE ASK FOR A FULL BAN ON ALL
25 VINEYARDS, OR AT A MINIMUM, FOR FURTHER SAFEGUARDS TO BE ADDED

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TO THE ORDINANCE FOR GARDEN VINEYARDS IN ORDER TO PROTECT
2 NATIVE HABITAT AND WATER QUALITY. PRESERVING NATIVE HABITAT
3 MUST BE A PRIORITY FOR THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. DUE TO
4 CONCERNS OVER THE IMPACTS OF VINEYARDS ON NATURAL RESOURCES,
5 THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM RESULTED IN
6 THE PROHIBITION OF VINEYARDS IN THE COASTAL ZONES OF THE SANTA
7 MONICA MOUNTAINS. HOWEVER, ECOSYSTEMS DON'T FOLLOW POLITICAL
8 BOUNDARIES. THE SAME HABITAT AND WILDLIFE THAT EXISTS IN THE
9 COASTAL ZONE OF THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS ARE ALSO FOUND IN
10 THE NORTH AREA AND THEY SHOULD BE AFFORDED THE SAME
11 PROTECTION. THE INCREASING PRESENCE OF VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA
12 MONICA MOUNTAINS CAUSES LOSS OF HABITAT AND FRAGMENTATION AS
13 WELL AS CONCERNS OVER WATER QUALITY FROM INPUTS OF SEDIMENT,
14 PESTICIDES AND FERTILIZERS TO WATER BODIES. HEAL THE BAY IS
15 ALSO CONCERNED OVER THE IMPACTS TO WATER SUPPLY. WE SIMPLY
16 CANNOT ALLOW PRECIOUS, AND LIMITED WATER RESOURCES TO BE USED
17 FOR NEW VINEYARDS, A NONESSENTIAL USE. ABSENT A FULL BAN ON
18 VINEYARDS, WE ASK THAT THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS STRENGTHEN THE
19 PROPOSED ORDINANCE BY LIMITING THE SIZE OF VINEYARDS TO A
20 QUARTER ACRE, REQUIRING A BUFFER OF 200 FEET BETWEEN VINEYARDS
21 AND SENSITIVE HABITAT TYPES, PROHIBITING PESTICIDES,
22 HERBICIDES AND ANY TOXIC CHEMICALS, PROHIBITING NEW WELLS TO
23 SUPPORT IRRIGATION, REQUIRING MONITORING AND REPORTING OF THE
24 REQUIRED BEST MANAGEMENT PRACTICES AND REQUIRING EXISTING
25 VINEYARDS TO CONFORM TO THE NEW DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS WITHIN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TWO YEARS. ECOSYSTEMS OF THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS ARE
2 UNIQUE, FRAGILE AND IN DIRE OF PROTECTION. IN SUMMARY, WE ASK
3 YOU TO ADD ADDITIONAL SAFEGUARDS TO THE PROPOSED ORDINANCE TO
4 ADEQUATELY PROTECT OUR NATURAL RESOURCES FOR ALL TO ENJOY.
5 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

6

7 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** LET ME ALSO CALL UP MELANIE BECK. YES,
8 SIR.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. OVER THE COURSE OF THESE HEARINGS, I
11 HAVE HEARD ARGUMENTS ALLOWING-- FOR ALLOWING COMMERCIAL
12 DEVELOPMENT DEVELOPMENT, REPEATED AD NAUSEAM BASED UPON ITS
13 HISTORICAL IMPORTANCE. TRUE ENOUGH. BY 1880, WINE WAS AN
14 ECONOMIC DRIVER OF THE FLEDGLING LOS ANGELES ECONOMY.
15 VINEYARDS GREW AND SPREAD INTO THE SOUTH EASTERN COUNTIES.
16 THESE FLAT LANDS, PREVIOUSLY RANGE LAND, PROVIDED RICH SOILS,
17 LOW LABOR DEMANDS, WHICH ENCOURAGED THE GROWTH. THERE WAS NO
18 NEED TO LOOK FOR THE MOUNTAINS FOR VINEYARD DEVELOPMENT. WHEN
19 JOHN BALLARD HOMESTEADED LANDS NOW THREATENED BY THE VINE IN
20 THE HEART OF WHAT IS NOW CORNELL IN 1900, THERE WERE NO
21 VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS, BECAUSE THE SOILS ARE
22 FAR TOO SHALLOW AND THERE IS NO LIMESTONE UNDERSTRUCTURE.
23 INSTEAD BALLARD MADE HIS LIVING SCAVENGING AND SELLING
24 FIREWOOD. FOR A REASON REPEATED BY MANY, VINEYARDS DID NOT
25 THEN AND SHOULD NOT NOW BE ALLOWED TO STRIP WHAT HAS BEEN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 REFERRED TO AS "THE LUNGS OF LOS ANGELES." THE SANTA MONICA
2 MOUNTAINS DO NOT HAVE A HISTORY OF VITICULTURE THOUGH LOS
3 ANGELES DOES. THERE IS NO BASIS NOW TO ATTEMPT TO JUSTIFY
4 COMMERCIAL VINEYARD EXPANSION IN THESE MOUNTAINS FOR
5 HISTORICAL REASONS. IF SO, THEN PONDERING HISTORICAL VALUES,
6 PERHAPS WE SHOULD REINTRODUCE THE GRIZZLY BEAR.

7

8 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** VERY GOOD. OKAY. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
9 DAVID VALDEZ. YES, SIR.

10

11 **ALI ZADEH:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS ALI ZADEH AND I HAVE
12 PROPERTY IN THE L.A. COUNTY CLOSE TO NORTH AREA AND CANYON
13 ROAD, AND I OPPOSE THIS ORDINANCE. BASICALLY IT MAKES ME
14 NERVOUS. THEY ARE REDUCING AND ELIMINATING ALL KIND OF
15 ACTIVITY IN THAT AREA. FIRST THEY HAVE PASSED THE RIDGE LINE
16 ORDINANCE AND IN THAT HEARING I HEARD THAT THE SINGLE-FAMILY
17 IS GOING TO BE ALLOWED. THEN LATER ON, THEY CHANGED THEIR MIND
18 AND BASICALLY EVEN THOUGH SUPERVISOR YVONNE BURKE THEY SAID IN
19 THAT HEARING, THOSE THEY APPLIED BEFORE THEY WOULD BE
20 GRANDFATHERED, BUT UNFORTUNATELY THEY CHANGED ON THAT ONE.
21 THEY HAD TO HIRE ATTORNEY TO GET THE PERMIT, BUT IT APPLIED
22 CHANGE A LOT OF THINGS. BY RESTRICTING THE ABILITY OF THE
23 PROPERTY OWNERS, THEY SIMPLY, YOU KNOW, DEVALUEATE THEIR
24 PROPERTY VALUES. ARE YOU GOING TO LOWER THE TAXES FOR THAT
25 THOSE PROPERTY OWNERS? AND I HAVEN'T HEARD OR I HAVE NOT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 RECEIVED ANY NOTICE FOR THIS HEARING FROM THE COUNTY. I
2 RECEIVED THIS ONE FROM ONE ACTIVIST, BASICALLY I'M ATTENDING.
3 I BELIEVE NONE OF THE PROPERTY OWNERS BEEN INFORMED ABOUT THIS
4 HEARING. SO BASICALLY IT MAKES ME VERY NERVOUS, EVEN THOUGH
5 THEY TOLD ME MY PROPERTY IS NOT IN THE NORTH AREA BUT IT MAKES
6 ME VERY, VERY NERVOUS. DEVALUATED THE PROPERTY VALUES AND
7 RESTRICTING OUR ABILITY TO BUILD A HOUSE OR RESTRICTING OUR
8 ABILITY TO PLANT THE TREES OR ANY GRAPEVINE OR ANYTHING. SO I
9 ASK SUPERVISORS, PLEASE. THANK YOU.

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. STEVEN GILBARD, YOU'RE
12 HERE, AND LEAH CULBERG. YES, SIR.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HONORABLE SUPERVISORS. TO THE BEST OF MY KNOWLEDGE, I
15 AM THE POSTER BOY FOR GETTING THROUGH ON THE 7 POINTS OF THE
16 SPECIAL EXCEPTIONS THAT WERE CREATED ON JULY 28TH. I'VE
17 SUBMITTED EVERYTHING AND I'M WAITING FOR ONE LAST STAMP FOR
18 ZONING, BUT IT'S DONE. UNFORTUNATELY, WHAT WE HAVE IS A
19 RELATIVELY ABSURD SITUATION. WE ENDED UP \$6,000 TO GET ALL THE
20 PERMITS AND TO GET THE SURVEYS AND STUDIES DONE TO GET THROUGH
21 THAT PIECE AND YET WE WERE TOLD THERE WOULDN'T BE EXTRA COST.
22 WE PAID IT, ANYWAY. THAT'S NOT WHAT'S IMPORTANT. I'M GOING
23 SKIP QUICKLY BECAUSE WE HAVE OTHER THINGS HERE. I'VE HAD MY
24 PROPERTY FOR 25 YEARS. IT'S ZONED AGRICULTURAL. THIS PROPERTY
25 IS PERMITTED TO GROW ANYTHING AGRICULTURAL UNDER THE LAND, OF

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE LAWS OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA WITHOUT LIMITATION.
2 PROPERTY IS BEING CERTIFIED RIGHT NOW IS BEING ORGANIC SO WHEN
3 PEOPLE TALK ABOUT US USING PESTICIDES, TALK ABOUT SPRAYING ALL
4 THE OTHER PIECES, IT'S NONSENSE. THEY TALK ABOUT THE FENCES.
5 WE HAVE FENCES ALL OVER THE REGION. THE FENCES THERE ARE MUCH,
6 MUCH MORE IMPERMEABLE. THE FENCES DO NOT HAVE BARBED WIRE, WE
7 DO NOT HAVE RAZOR WIRE. I DON'T KNOW WHY THEY SAY THESE THINGS
8 BUT THEY TELL STORIES TO MAKE SURE THAT YOU HEAR WHAT THEY
9 WANT YOU TO HEAR. I COULD BE PLANTING AVOCADOS OR CITRUS OR
10 EVEN ALMONDS. ALMONDS, THE NUMBER ONE WATER DRAWING CROP IN
11 THE STATE. IT'S TOTALLY ABSURD. I WOULDN'T BE IN FRONT OF YOU
12 IF I WAS PLANTING THOSE THINGS. YOU SINGLED OUT ONE SINGLE
13 ELEMENT, VINES, AND YOU SAY WE CAN'T HAVE VINES. TOMATOES ARE
14 A VINE. ARE WE SINGLING OUT NO MORE TOMATOES IN THE REGION, AS
15 WELL? BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT THIS REGULATION IS DOING. YOU'VE
16 MORPHED FROM SOMETHING THAT WAS EROSION AND ENVIRONMENTAL.
17 THAT DIDN'T HOLD UP BECAUSE U.C. DAVIS, LOS ANGELES COUNTY
18 AGRICULTURAL COMMISSIONER, THE FIRE DEPARTMENT AND THE
19 DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS HAVE ALL SAID THAT VINES PROTECT
20 THE SOIL. THEY DON'T HAVE AN EROSION PROBLEM. THERE IS NO
21 HISTORY OF THOSE THINGS. WE HAVE A VERY SIMPLE PLAN THAT'S
22 BEEN STAMPED RIGHT NOW THAT REQUIRES NO GRADING AND THERE
23 NEVER HAS BEEN ANY GRADING ON ALMOST ANY OF THE VINEYARDS THAT
24 I KNOW OF. THERE ARE ALSO NO COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS GOING IN. WE
25 ARE SMALL OPERATIONS. WE ARE FAMILY OPERATIONS. I IMPLORE YOU

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TO VOTE NO AGAINST THIS. SEND IT BACK AND MAKE THEM FIX IT.
2 THEY RUSHED THIS TO GET THROUGH BECAUSE WE ARE REACHING THE
3 END OF THAT FOUR-MONTH PERIOD. RUSHING IS NOT A GOOD WAY TO
4 HAVE GOVERNMENT.

5

6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP DON
7 SCHMITZ. YES, MA'AM.

8

9 **MELANIE BECK:** GOOD MORNING, SUPERVISORS, MY NAME IS MELANIE
10 BECK, I'M REPRESENTING NATIONAL PARK SERVICE, SANTA MONICA
11 MOUNTAINS NATIONAL RECREATION AREA. THE NATIONAL PARK SERVICE
12 THANKS THE BOARD AND REGIONAL PLANNING STAFF FOR TAKING QUICK
13 ACTION ON THE VINEYARD ORDINANCE. N.P.S. MANAGES SANTA MONICA
14 MOUNTAINS NATIONAL RECREATION AREA FOR PARK RESOURCES CONGRESS
15 RECOGNIZED TO BE A VALUE TO THE AMERICAN PUBLIC AND THE
16 CITIZENS OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA. NATURAL RESOURCES AND THE
17 HABITAT THEY PROVIDE FOR WILDLIFE, TWO WORDS INTENDED.
18 CULTURAL RESOURCES THAT PROVIDE A GLIMPSE INTO THE HUMAN PAST
19 IN THE MOUNTAINS AND A SPECTACULAR SCENIC BACKDROP THESE
20 COMBINED RESOURCES PROVIDE THAT DELIGHT, PHYSICALLY CHALLENGE
21 ON TRAILS AND EMOTIONALLY RELIEVE MILLIONS OF VISITORS AND
22 TRAVELERS EACH YEAR. IN THE PARKS LEGISLATION, CONGRESS
23 RECOGNIZED THAT STATE AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS HAVE THE GREATEST
24 ABILITY TO PROTECT THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. THIS
25 ORDINANCE'S DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS PROTECT THE PARK SETTING,

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 CONSERVATION WOULD BE EVEN BETTER SERVED IF THEY WERE LIMITED
2 TO NO MORE THAN FUEL MODIFICATION ZONES A AND B THAT EXTEND TO
3 VINEYARDS. WE ALSO RESPECTFULLY ENCOURAGE THE COUNTY TO
4 APPROACH VARIANCE REQUESTS WITH ATTENTION TO THE ZONING CODE
5 REQUIREMENT THAT SUCH ADJUSTMENT WILL NOT BE MATERIAL,
6 DETRIMENTALLY-- I'M SORRY. WILL NOT BE MATERIALLY DETRIMENTAL
7 TO THE PUBLIC HEALTH, SAFETY OR GENERAL WELFARE OR TO THE USE,
8 ENJOYMENT, VALUATION OF PROPERTY OF OTHER PERSONS LOCATED IN
9 THE VICINITY. PUBLIC RECREATION LANDS OWNED BY N.P.S., STATE
10 PARKS, M.R.C.A., MOUNTAINS RESTORATION TRUST AND ALSO THE
11 COUNTRY ARE OFTEN NEIGHBORS. THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION.

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MA'AM. YES, SIR.

14

15 **DAVID VALDEZ:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS DAVID VALDEZ AND I AM A
16 LONG-TIME RESIDENT OF THE MALIBU. I AM HERE IN OPPOSITION TO
17 THE VINEYARD ORDINANCE BEING PROPOSED. THE ORDINANCE AS
18 CURRENTLY PROPOSED IMPOSES ONEROUS, UNIQUE AND ARBITRARY
19 RESTRICTIONS ON THE PERMITTED USES OF PROPERTIES, ZONED
20 HISTORICALLY AS AGRICULTURAL. THIS IS AN USURPATION OF
21 PROPERTY RIGHTS ON THE PART OF THE DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL
22 PLANNING AND DOES NOT REFLECT CURRENT PRACTICES ACROSS THE
23 COUNTY. SPECIFICALLY, IT IMPOSES A NEW AND COSTLY BURDEN ON
24 PROPERTY OWNERS WHO WOULD NOW BE REQUIRED TO GET A CONDITIONAL
25 USE PERMIT TO CONDUCT LEGALLY RECOGNIZED AGRICULTURAL USE OF

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE LAND. THIS ORDINANCE AS CURRENTLY WRITTEN IS INADEQUATE
2 AND SHORT SIGHTED FOR THE NORTH ZONE. REGULATIONS THAT IMPOSE
3 PRACTICES THAT BY THEIR VERY NATURE PRECLUDE AGRICULTURE IN
4 THE AREA SUCH AS PERMEABLE FENCING DO NOT FOSTER THE
5 BENEFICIAL COEXISTENCE OF NATURAL HABITATS IN ENVIRONMENTALLY
6 SENSITIVE AGRICULTURE AND PRIVATE LAND, BUT RATHER ENCOURAGE
7 ORGANIZATION AND INTRUSIVE HABITATION BY LARGER NUMBER OF
8 PEOPLE. THE LARGE PARCELS BEING SUBJECTED TO THESE
9 RESTRICTIONS WILL BECOME TARGETS FOR RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT
10 AS WE HAVE SEEN IN CALABASAS, AGOURA, WESTLAKE VILLAGE AND
11 THOUSAND OAKS. FURTHER STUDY OF POLICY DEVELOPMENT BASED ON
12 LOCAL CONDITIONS IS REQUIRED. PRIVATE PARCELS WITHIN OR
13 ADJACENT TO THE SANTA MONICA NATIONAL RECREATION AREA WERE
14 SOLD AS AGRICULTURAL HOMESTEADS BY THE U.S. LAND COMMISSION
15 ALMOST 150 YEARS AGO. THE VERY SAME COMMISSION THAT RESERVED
16 THE VAST MAJORITY OF THE 300,000 ACRES OF THE SANTA MONICA
17 MOUNTAINS INTO FEDERAL TRUST. THE COMMISSION RECOGNIZED AT THE
18 TIME THAT THE LANDS IN QUESTION WERE TOPOGRAPHICALLY AND
19 GEOLOGICALLY SUITABLE FOR AGRICULTURE AND THE COUNTY HAS LONG
20 RECOGNIZED THIS USE THROUGH ITS ZONING AUTHORITY. WITH A LONG
21 HISTORY OF AGRICULTURE, THE NORTHERN AREA SHOULD BE ALLOWED TO
22 CONTINUE THIS IDENTITY THROUGH FAIR AND RATIONAL PLANNING
23 POLICY SO AS TO PRESERVE THIS LEGACY. THANK YOU.
24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
2 PAUL EDELMAN. PAUL EDELMAN AND SUSAN NISSMAN. YES, SIR. OR
3 YES, MA'AM.

4

5 **LEAH CULBERG:** LEAH CULBERG AND I AM A PAST PRESIDENT OF THE
6 TRIUNFO LOBO COMMUNITY ASSOCIATION. HONORABLE SUPERVISORS.
7 I'VE WRITTEN AND SPOKEN ABOUT THE NEED TO BAN VINEYARDS SO
8 MUCH THAT I THOUGHT TODAY I WOULD JUST TAKE A CUE FROM DAVID
9 LETTERMAN AND GIVE YOU MY TOP 10 REASONS WHY WE SHOULDN'T HAVE
10 VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. VINEYARDS, ONE, ARE
11 INCONSISTENT WITH THE GOALS OF THE N.A.P. TO KEEP THE AREA A
12 RURAL MOUNTAIN COMMUNITY NOT A RURAL FARMING COMMUNITY, ARE
13 INCONSISTENT WITH THE CREDO OF THE N.A.P., LET THE LAND BE THE
14 GUIDE. THREE, DESTROY PROTECTED VIEW SHEDS WITH UNNATURALLY
15 BARE, GRADED HILLSIDES AND GRADED THEY ARE, I HAVE SEEN IT FOR
16 YEARS. FOUR, ARE INCONSISTENT WITH THE GOALS OF THE NATIONAL
17 RECREATION AREA TO PRESERVE OUR UNIQUE MEDITERRANEAN
18 ECOSYSTEM. FIVE, FRAGMENT OR OBLITERATE HABITAT. SIX,
19 INTERRUPT AND/OR BLOCK WILDLIFE TRAILS. SEVEN, KILL THOUSANDS
20 OF BIRDS WITH USE OF BIRD NETTING. EIGHT, POLLUTE SOIL AND
21 WATERWAYS WITH HERBICIDES, PESTICIDES, AND NITROGEN-LACED
22 FERTILIZERS. NINE, DEplete GROUND WATER AND CONSEQUENTLY DRY
23 UP WELLS OF LOCAL HOMEOWNERS AND INCREASE FIRE DANGER. TEN,
24 INCREASE WATER RUNOFF, MUDSLIDES AND SILTING OF STREAM BEDS,
25 ROCKSLIDES AND HILLSIDE COLLAPSE. AND I DID ADD AN 11, GREATLY

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 INCREASE TRAFFIC GENERATED BY INEBRIATED DRIVERS DUE TO
2 VINEYARD TOURISM. THANK YOU.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP ERIC
5 PREVEN. YES, SIR.

6

7 **DON SCHMITZ:** SUPERVISORS, GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS DON
8 SCHMITZ. I HAVE A QUESTION FOR YOU. HOW MANY VINEYARDS BY ACRE
9 ARE THERE IN THE NORTH AREA PLAN? HOW MANY ACRES OF VINEYARDS
10 WILL BE ALLOWED UNDER THIS ORDINANCE? HOW MANY ACRES OF OPEN
11 SPACE? WHAT WILL BE THE IMPACT OF THIS PURPORTED HABITAT
12 FRAGMENTATION? I BET YOU DON'T KNOW. AND I BET YOU DON'T KNOW
13 BECAUSE IT'S NOT IN THE STAFF REPORT. WOULD YOU BE SURPRISED
14 TO KNOW THAT MAYBE 1 PERCENT OF THE NORTH AREA PLAN IS UNDER
15 VINE RIGHT NOW? HOW IS IT THAT YOU AS A GOVERNMENTAL AGENCY
16 CAN TAKE AWAY THE ECONOMIC USE OF SOMEBODY'S PROPERTY UNLESS
17 YOU HAVE A VERY COMPELLING AND DOCUMENTED BASIS FOR IT? NOW,
18 SUPERVISOR KUEHL, EVERY SINGLE ONE OF US WILL AGREE THAT THIS
19 IS AN INCREDIBLY BEAUTIFUL AND SENSITIVE AREA. I LIVE THERE. I
20 RAISE MY KIDS THERE. I RIDE MY HORSES THERE. AND I'VE BEEN IN
21 THE LAND USE PLANNING FOR 30 YEARS, IF YOU INCLUDE MY TIME
22 WITH THE COASTAL COMMISSION. I'M SPEAKING AGAINST MY OWN
23 ECONOMIC SELF INTEREST HERE, BECAUSE MY FIRM IS GOING TO BE
24 VERY BUSY REPRESENTING PEOPLE TO GET CONDITIONAL USE PERMITS
25 TO PUT IN THEIR VINEYARDS, BUT THIS IS NOT WELL THOUGHT OUT.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 YOU KNOW VERY WELL THAT THE GOVERNMENT CAN ONLY TAKE AWAY THE
2 USE AND ENJOYMENT OF SOMEBODY'S PROPERTY WHETHER IT BE A
3 PERCENTAGE OR NOT IF THEY'VE GOT A BONA FIDE BASIS TO DO THAT.
4 WHERE ARE THE SCIENTIFIC STUDIES? YOU'VE HEARD ANECDOTAL
5 STATEMENTS BY PEOPLE THAT I DON'T THINK HAVE EVER SPENT ANY
6 TIME WORKING IN A VINEYARD, TALKING ABOUT ALL THE DELETERIOUS
7 IMPACTS. BUT THE FACT OF THE MATTER IS VINEYARDS USELESS WATER
8 THAN ANY OTHER CROP. HOW COME YOU'RE NOT CHARTING THEM OUT FOR
9 A BAN OR REQUIRING CONDITIONING PERMITS? IT'S BECAUSE IT'S
10 BECOME THE CAUSE CELEBRE. CARVED UP ON THAT WALL, IT STATES,
11 THIS COUNTRY IS FOUNDED ON FREE ENTERPRISE. CHERISH AND HELP
12 PRESERVE IT. IT'S ON THE WALL. SO UNLESS YOU'VE GOT A REALLY
13 GOOD SCIENTIFIC REASON FOR WHAT YOU'RE PROPOSING TO DO, YOU
14 NEED TO POSTPONE THIS AND DEMAND THAT THAT SCIENTIFIC
15 RATIONALE BE TROTTED OUT. THANK YOU.

16

17 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** YES. THANK YOU.

18

19 **PAUL EDELMAN:** HONORABLE SUPERVISORS, PAUL EDELMAN, DEPUTY
20 DIRECTOR OF NATURAL RESOURCES AND PLANNING, THE SANTA MONICA
21 MOUNTAINS CONSERVANCY. ACTUALLY THIS PLAN IS BEAUTIFULLY
22 THOUGHT OUT. IT'S ALL ABOUT BALANCE, AND THE AMENDMENT THE
23 REGIONAL PLANNING COMMISSION HAS COME UP WITH IS FANTASTIC.
24 THAT AREA IS A PUBLIC PLACE THAT SHOULD BE ENJOYED BY ALL. TWO
25 ACRES IS PLENTY OF LAND ON A PIECE OF PROPERTY FOR A VINEYARD

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 YOU CAN EASILY GET 2,000 BOTTLES AN ACRE FOR INDIVIDUAL USE. I
2 THINK PEOPLE ARE FORGETTING THE FACT THAT JUST BECAUSE A LAND
3 IS ZONED AG OR LAND IS ZONED RESIDENTIAL, YOU CAN'T USE EVERY
4 SQUARE FOOT OF IT FOR THAT USE. WE LIVE IN A SOCIETY WITH
5 RULES FOR THE COMMONS. SO IN OTHER WORDS, YOU CAN'T GO WALL-
6 TO-WALL WITH YOUR HOUSE AND YOU CAN'T GO WALL-TO-WALL WITH
7 YOUR AGRICULTURE WITHOUT SOME KIND OF PERMIT. SO WE URGE YOU
8 TO SUPPORT THE AMENDMENT. WE FEEL IT'S REALLY WELL THOUGHT OUT
9 AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, MA'AM.

12

13 **SUSAN NISSMAN:** SUSAN NISSMAN ON BEHALF OF MY HUSBAND AND I WHO
14 HAVE LIVED IN THE MOUNTAINS OF TOPANGA FOR ALMOST 40 YEARS.
15 THERE IS NO PROPERTY RIGHT TO DESTROY THE ENVIRONMENT. IT WAS
16 SCIENTIFICALLY DOCUMENTED DURING THE FORMATION OF THE SANTA
17 MONICA L.C.P. THAT THE NUTRIENTS IN THE SOIL AMENDMENTS ADDED
18 TO SUPPORT THE GROWING OF GRAPES IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS
19 ACTUALLY FOREVER ALTER AND CONVERT THAT VERY SOIL THAT
20 SUSTAINS THE ESSENTIAL BIODIVERSITY OF THIS RARE, ONLY ONE IN
21 THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA MEDITERRANEAN ECOSYSTEM.
22 ADDITIONALLY, THE NUTRIENT RICH RUNOFF GOES INTO OUR CREEKS
23 AND STREAMS, LOADING UP THE SANTA MONICA BAY WITH MORE
24 NUTRIENTS AND THREATENING A HEALTHY MARINE ENVIRONMENT. WATER
25 SHEDS ARE ONE, AS SHOULD BE THE POLICIES REGULATING VINEYARDS.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 WATER SHEDS DO NOT KNOW THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE COASTAL
2 ZONE AND THE NORTH AREA. EVERYTHING FLOWS TO THE SEA FROM THE
3 MOUNTAINS. PLEASE DO NOT ALLOW SPECIAL INTERESTS TO TRIUMPH
4 OVER THE BEST INTERESTS OF THE PUBLIC AND LOS ANGELES COUNTY
5 COUNTY'S UNIQUE AND PRECIOUS NATURAL RESOURCES. PLEASE ADOPT A
6 CONSISTENT AND PROTECTIVE POLICY PROHIBITING NEW VINEYARDS IN
7 THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA, PLANNING AREA, UNLESS
8 CONSISTENT WITH THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS L.C.P. AS RESIDENTS
9 OF THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS FOR FOUR DECADES, AND ACTIVELY
10 INVOLVED IN STEWARDING AND PROTECTING THIS NATURAL RESOURCE
11 FOR THE MILLIONS WHO COME TO ENJOY THE MOUNTAINS AND OUR
12 BEACHES, WE REMIND YOU THESE ARE ONE COASTAL MOUNTAIN RANGE.
13 PLEASE REAFFIRM THE POSITION THE MAJORITY OF THE BOARD OF
14 SUPERVISORS CORRECTLY TOOK JUST OVER A YEAR AGO IN ADOPTING A
15 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS LOCAL COSTAL PLAN WHICH BANNED NEW
16 VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. NOTHING HAS CHANGED
17 THAT WOULD WARRANT EXCLUSION OF THIS STILL WILD 21,000 ACRES
18 COMPRISING SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA FROM SAME
19 PROTECTIONS AS EXHIBITED IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAIN'S L.C.P.
20 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION.

21

22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **SUSAN NISSMAN:** NICE TO BE BACK.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **ERIC PREVEN:** YES, IT'S ERIC PREVEN, A RESIDENT FROM THE THIRD
4 DISTRICT. AND SUSAN NISSMAN WORKS FOR THE THIRD DISTRICT, FOR
5 THE RECORD, AND HAS FOR MANY, MANY YEARS, SO THAT IS IMPORTANT
6 TO NOTE. I THINK THAT WE HAVE TO LOOK INTO THE TRIUNFO LOBO
7 CANYON MEETING WHERE PEOPLE WERE REPORTEDLY PACKING UP TO
8 DECIDE TO SUBMIT APPLICATIONS. THERE'S APPARENTLY A YOUTUBE OF
9 THAT. THAT DOES SEEM EXTREMELY WORRISOME, FRANKLY. I DON'T
10 QUITE GET THAT. WINE IS OF GREAT INTEREST TO CALIFORNIA AND
11 THE WORLD AND I'M ALSO ENORMOUSLY SUPPORTIVE OF THE
12 ENVIRONMENTALISTS HERE TODAY AND THE IDEA THAT WE WANT TO
13 PROTECT OUR ENVIRONMENT AND THE PRECIOUS ECOSYSTEMS THAT EXIST
14 IN THIS AREA, OBVIOUSLY. BUT I DO TAKE SOME EXCEPTION TO THE
15 TERM "BAN" BEING THROWN AROUND WHEN I ASK THE ESTEEMED VERY,
16 VERY, VERY HELPFUL GUY, RICHARD BRUCKNER, THIS GUY WHEN HE
17 GETS AN ASSIGNMENT FROM A SUPERVISOR, BELIEVE ME HE SCURRIES
18 RIGHT OVER TO THE TASK AT HAND AND DOES WHATEVER HE CAN TO GET
19 THAT TO HAPPEN. BUT I THOUGHT THAT THE PEOPLE, THE PUBLIC WERE
20 TOLD THAT THERE WAS GOING TO BE SOME WORKING WITH THE
21 APPLICANTS TO CLARIFY THAT THIS WAS NOT A BAN, AND OF COURSE
22 THIS WAS NOT, AND WE'RE NOT AGAINST ANY KIND OF WINERIES. BUT
23 THEN I HEAR THIS IDEA THAT THERE WAS A KIND OF OVERSTUFFED
24 BALLOT AND MISCALCULATE THE AMOUNT. THAT NEEDS TO BE
25 RECHECKED, OBVIOUSLY. THAT'S OUR SYSTEM, AS WE LOOK AT THESE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THINGS. WE NEED TO GIVE A FAIR AND EQUITABLE ASSESSMENT. I
2 CAN'T SEE HOW THAT'S THE CASE. NOW IN THIS VERY AREA, MANY OF
3 THESE ESTEEMED ENVIRONMENTAL COLLEAGUES OF MINE, FRANKLY, WERE
4 NOWHERE TO BE FOUND WHEN THE MALIBU GOLF INSTITUTE WAS BEING
5 PUSHED THROUGH BY THE GREAT KNABE AND YAROSLAVSKY. THIS WAS A
6 GROUP THAT SAID, "WE'RE GOING TO RUN A GOLF COURSE AND FANCY.
7 WE'RE ALSO GOING TO BRING A BUNCH OF HOTELS BUT WE ARE GOING
8 TO CALL IT-- NOT HOTELS BUT HOTEL ROOMS BUT IT'S AN INSTITUTE
9 DON'T WORRY ABOUT THAT." BUT THE IDEA THERE WAS THEY WERE
10 GOING TO BE RESPECTFUL OF THE ENVIRONMENT AND TAKE CARE. MY
11 EXPERIENCE WITH WINE MAKERS ARE, YOU HAVE TWO DIFFERENT KINDS.
12 YOU HAVE THE BIG GUYS WHO ARE ROLLING WITH BIG EQUIPMENT AND
13 YOU HAVE PEOPLE WHO WANT TO DO ORGANIC COOL STUFF THAT MIGHT
14 REPRESENT MALIBU. MALIBU HAS A TRADITION THERE. SO I WOULD ASK
15 YOU TO RECONSIDER.

16

17 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. JOHN BERTOLLI.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, I'M HERE TO SPEAK OUT IN FAVOR OF 47
20 ALSO JUST TO BAN COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS IN THE MOUNTAINS. IT
21 SEEMS LIKE THERE'S THIS ARBITRARY LINE THAT WAS DRAWN WITH THE
22 COASTAL ZONE. THE NORTH HILLS AREA IS NO DIFFERENT IN TERMS OF
23 BEING PART OF THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. I THINK THAT ON THE
24 OTHER SIDE OF THINGS, PEOPLE OFTEN TALK ABOUT TAKINGS. WELL
25 THIS IS A TAKING OF NATURAL RESOURCES. THIS IS A TAKING OF

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 NATURE. SO I'M NOT ANTI-DEVELOPMENT. I FEEL THAT THERE'S NO
2 PLACE FOR VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. I THINK
3 THERE'S CERTAIN THINGS WE SHOULD KEEP SACRED. AND I THINK THAT
4 THE PEOPLE THAT FIGHT SO HARD TO HAVE VINEYARDS OR TO DO THIS
5 KIND OF DEVELOPMENT COULD USE THEIR ENERGY, THEIR RESOURCES,
6 THEIR TIME FOR INNOVATIVE AND CREATIVE IDEAS LIKE, HERE'S A
7 RADICAL ONE, WHY DON'T YOU TAKE BLIGHTED URBAN AREAS AND
8 CREATE VERTICAL FARMS? GROW GRAPES THAT WAY. JUST GET INTO THE
9 21ST, 22ND CENTURY, THINK AHEAD. CONTRIBUTE INSTEAD OF TAKING.
10 SO I'M SURE THE VINTNERS AND THE WINE PEOPLE WILL SAY, "WELL
11 THAT'S NOT ROMANTIC, A BUNCH OF VERTICAL FARMS." WELL, NO,
12 IT'S NOT, BUT IT'S A STORY. IF YOU CREATE WINE BY REVITALIZING
13 AN URBAN AREA, WHICH IS ACTUALLY POSSIBLE THESE DAYS, YOU
14 MIGHT HAVE A GREAT STORY. YOU MIGHT SELL MORE WINE. YOU MIGHT
15 CREATE A REALLY INTERESTING WINE. SO I GUESS THE POINT IS:
16 THERE ARE ALTERNATIVES TO THIS. WHY CORRUPT A BEAUTIFUL
17 NATURAL RESOURCE THAT WE HAVE? EVEN IF YOU THINK VINEYARDS ARE
18 BEAUTIFUL, WHICH I DO, I JUST DON'T THINK THERE'S A PLACE FOR
19 THEM IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS AND I URGE YOU TO BAN THEM
20 THERE. THANK YOU.

21

22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THAT CONCLUDES THE PUBLIC TESTIMONY.
23 SUPERVISOR-- LET ME ASK THE DEPARTMENT IF THEY WOULD RESPOND
24 AND THEN SUPERVISOR KUEHL.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **RICHARD BRUCKNER:** MR. CHAIRMAN, SUPERVISORS, A COUPLE OF
2 RESPONSES, ONE JUST A CLARIFICATION. THIS IS NOT A BAN BUT IT
3 WAS A CAREFUL REGULATION WORKED OUT AFTER TALKING TO MEMBERS
4 OF THE COMMUNITY, MEMBERS OF THE ORGANIC VINTNERS SOCIETY AND
5 OTHERS. SO THE NOTION THAT THIS IS A BAN IS MISPLACED.
6 SECONDLY, IT DID COME TO MY ATTENTION THAT THERE WAS THIS
7 YOUTUBE VIDEO THAT I GOT TO SEE THIS MORNING AND IT WAS A
8 VIDEO OF THE STAFF ABOUT A YEAR AGO TALKING TO COMMUNITY
9 MEMBERS AND THERE WAS NO RUSH TO SUBMIT, THERE WAS NO
10 ENCOURAGEMENT TO RUSH TO SUBMIT THE PLANS. IT WAS SIMPLY THE
11 STAFF EXPLAINING TO THE COMMUNITY AS WE DO A NUMBER OF
12 MEETINGS WHAT IS ANTICIPATED IN THE NEAR FUTURE. SO THERE WAS
13 NO RUSH TO JUDGMENT THERE, THERE WAS NO ENCOURAGEMENT TO
14 SUBMIT NUMEROUS PLANS. SO I WANTED TO CLARIFY THAT. THERE WAS
15 ALSO A CONCERN ABOUT THE RUSH TO BRING THIS TO THIS BOARD. AND
16 THE LAST TIME WE WERE HERE, WE HAD ASKED FOR 10 MONTHS, BUT
17 THE BOARD ENCOURAGED US TO DO THAT IN FOUR MONTHS SO WE'RE
18 HERE FOUR MONTHS LATER WITH THIS RECOMMENDATION.

19

20 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** AND HOW DOES THIS-- WHAT EFFECT DOES
21 THIS PROPOSAL HAVE ON EXISTING VINEYARDS?

22

23 **RICHARD BRUCKNER:** EXISTING VINEYARDS CAN CONTINUE. THERE IS A
24 FIVE-YEAR TIMEFRAME FOR WHICH THEY HAVE TO COMPLY WITH BEST
25 PRACTICES. THEY CONTINUE THROUGH THE FIVE YEARS AND AFTER THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 FIVE YEARS THERE IS SOME BEST PRACTICES LISTED HERE TO ENSURE
2 WATER QUALITY AND RUNOFF.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR?

5

6 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR. THANK YOU VERY MUCH
7 TO ALL THOSE WHO TESTIFIED, TO OUR CAPABLE STAFF AND STAFFS OF
8 ALL OF OUR OFFICES. IT WAS INTERESTING TO ME HOW MUCH-- HOW
9 MANY TIMES PEOPLE MENTIONED CAMELS WHO ARE NOT NATIVE TO
10 SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA THOUGH CECIL B. DE MILLE DID INTRODUCE
11 THEM AND WE HAD THEM HERE FOR QUITE A WHILE AFTER SILENT
12 MOVIES WERE HERE. SOME SAID THIS WAS THE NOSE UNDER THE
13 CAMEL'S TENT, THAT THERE WOULD BE MORE AND MORE AND MORE
14 VINEYARDS. SOME SAID IT WAS THE STRAW THAT BROKE THE CAMEL'S
15 BACK WHICH MEANS TOO MUCH REGULATION. OFTEN WHEN YOU GET THIS
16 KIND OF TESTIMONY, YOU SAY TO YOURSELF, MAYBE WE'RE DOING IT
17 JUST RIGHT, LIKE THE THREE BEARS. I DON'T THINK IT'LL EVER BE
18 JUST RIGHT SO FAR AS MY CONSTITUENTS ARE CONCERNED BECAUSE
19 THEY HAVE DISPARATE INTERESTS. IN TERMS OF PROTECTING THIS
20 AREA OF THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS, WHICH IS NOT SUBJECT TO
21 THE CURRENT LOCAL COASTAL PLAN THAT WAS ADOPTED LAST YEAR, I
22 BELIEVE THIS IS A GOOD COMPROMISE. AND "I THEREFORE MOVE THAT
23 THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS CLOSE THE PUBLIC HEARING ON PROJECT
24 NO. R2015-02310-3, ADOPT THE NEGATIVE DECLARATION FOR THE
25 PROJECT AND DETERMINE, BASED ON THE WHOLE RECORD BEFORE THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 BOARD, THE PROJECT WILL NOT HAVE A SIGNIFICANT EFFECT ON THE
2 ENVIRONMENT. I FURTHER MOVE THAT THE BOARD INDICATE ITS INTENT
3 TO APPROVE PROJECT NUMBER R2015-02310-3 TO REGULATE VINEYARDS
4 IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA COMMUNITY STANDARDS
5 DISTRICT AND INSTRUCT COUNTY COUNSEL TO PREPARE THE FINAL
6 ORDINANCE WITH THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS, AND THIS HAS BEEN
7 PASSED OUT TO MY COLLEAGUES AS AN AMENDMENT: 1) APPLY THE
8 DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS DELINEATED IN SECTION 22.44.133. D.8. B
9 TO ALL VINEYARDS REGARDLESS OF SIZE, INCLUDING VINEYARDS THAT
10 HAVE LESS THAN 4,356 SQUARE FEET OF LAND AREA. EXISTING
11 VINEYARDS SHALL HAVE FIVE YEARS TO COME INTO COMPLIANCE. 2)
12 PROHIBIT THE PLANTING OF VINEYARDS REGARDLESS OF SIZE ON ANY
13 TERRAIN WITH A SLOPE RATIO GREATER THAN 3:1, WHICH IS A 33
14 PERCENT SLOPE. 3) INCREASE THE REQUIRED SETBACK FROM SENSITIVE
15 HABITAT IN SECTION 22.44.133.D.8.C. SUB. 11 BY AN ADDITIONAL
16 100 FEET. AND, FINALLY: 4) REQUIRE ALL VINEYARD FENCING TO BE
17 WILDLIFE PERMEABLE. FENCING THAT IS NON-WILDLIFE PERMEABLE MAY
18 SURROUND THE IMMEDIATE BUILDING SITE AREA OF STRUCTURES AND
19 EXTEND NO FURTHER THAN THE OUTER EXTENT OF FUEL MODIFICATION
20 ZONE A. SUCH FENCING SHALL BE SOLELY FOR SAFETY PURPOSES AND
21 SHALL BE NO MORE THAN 6 FEET IN HEIGHT." SO I WOULD ASK YOUR
22 SUPPORT OF THIS COMPROMISE FOR THE ORDINANCE CONCERNING
23 VINEYARDS.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. COMMENTS?

2 SUPERVISOR KNABE.

3

4 **SUP. KNABE:** THIS MAKES IT A LITTLE MORE RESTRICTIVE, RIGHT? I
5 MEAN, IT'S NOT A BAN, BUT IT'S MORE RESTRICTIVE THAN WE TALKED
6 ABOUT.?

7

8 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** NOT RESTRICTIVE. IT MAKES IT STRICTER FOR
9 EXPANSION. HOWEVER, AS WE SAID, PEOPLE HAVE FIVE YEARS FOR THE
10 EXISTING VINEYARDS TO COME INTO COMPLIANCE ON THE WATER USE
11 AND ET CETERA IN TERMS OF WHAT WE PUT IN.

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** CALL THE ROLL.

14

15 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR SOLIS?

16

17 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** AYE.

18

19 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR RIDLEY-
20 THOMAS?

21

22 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** AYE.

23

24 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR KUEHL?

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** AYE.

2

3 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR KNABE?

4

5 **SUP. KNABE:** ABSTAIN.

6

7 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR

8 ANTONOVICH?

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** ABSTAIN. MOTION CARRIES. SO ORDERED.

11 SUPERVISOR MARK? WE'LL MOVE TO THE SET ITEM. YOU WANT TO DO

12 THAT REAL QUICK? ITEM 9 AND 43 ARE RELATED AS ONE ITEM. SO

13 SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS AND THEN THAT WILL BE FOLLOWED

14 BY SUPERVISOR HILDA SOLIS'S ITEM.

15

16 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR. I JUST WANT TO POINT

17 OUT THAT THE HISTORY OF THIS ITEM DEALING WITH THE OFFICE OF

18 DIVERSION AND RE-ENTRY AND THE INTRODUCTION OF THIS ORDINANCE

19 REALLY DOES DEMONSTRATE THE BOARD'S COMMITMENT TO DRAMATICALLY

20 IMPROVING CARE FOR PERSONS WITH MENTAL ILLNESS AND SUBSTANCE

21 ABUSE CHALLENGES AND WHO ARE ESSENTIALLY IN NEED OF OUR

22 ATTENTION, CARE AND SUPPORT AND AT THE SAME TIME, THE MOTION

23 SEEKS TO PRESERVE PUBLIC SAFETY. I BELIEVE THAT DIVERSION IS

24 THE RIGHT THING TO DO. WE KNOW THIS. IT PUTS US IN A BETTER

25 POSITION WITH RESPECT TO FISCAL RESPONSIBILITY IMPROVEMENTS.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THESE DOLLARS ARE MORE STRATEGICALLY UTILIZED IN THIS VEIN
2 RATHER THAN IN INCARCERATION SCENARIOS. IN SEPTEMBER OF 2015,
3 WE AUTHORIZED A FUNDING OF DIVERSION. THIS APPROACH WOULD
4 REDIRECT INDIVIDUALS WITH SERIOUS MENTAL HEALTH ILLNESS AND
5 CO-OCCURRING DISORDERS FROM CRIMINAL LIFE AND BEING PART OF
6 THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM AND WHAT IT DOES AS AN ALTERNATIVE
7 IS CAUSE THEM TO BE TREATED IN AN INTEGRATED HEALTHCARE
8 SYSTEM. THE BOARD DID APPROVE ACTION AND CONFIRMED OUR INTENT
9 TO LEVERAGE SIGNIFICANT DOLLARS IN THIS CONNECTION AND I THINK
10 IT OUGHT TO BE UNDERSCORED. COUNTY COUNSEL HAS CONFIRMED THAT
11 WE CAN APPROACH THIS IN A PROPER WAY, PURSUANT TO THE BOARD'S
12 INSTRUCTION, TO FURTHER ANALYZE THIS FROM A LEGAL PERSPECTIVE.
13 SO THE ORDINANCE REALLY ESTABLISHES A PERMANENT STEERING
14 COMMITTEE THAT INCLUDES OUR CRITICAL PARTNERS AND
15 STAKEHOLDERS. NOT THE LEAST OF WHOM WOULD BE THE DISTRICT
16 ATTORNEY, THE SHERIFF, THE DEPARTMENT OF PROBATION, THE AGENCY
17 THAT WE JUST MOVED FORWARD IN TERMS OF HEALTH. AND THAT
18 STEERING COMMITTEE HAS BEEN ACTIVELY MEETING TO DEVELOP ITS
19 PLAN. IT'S A GOOD THING. IT'S AN IMPORTANT THING. THE
20 ORDINANCE ALSO HAS BEEN DRAFTED TO MAKE CLEAR THAT OUR
21 PRIORITY IS TO EXPAND DIVERSION SERVICES THAT WORK, LIKE
22 MENTAL HEALTH, LIKE DRUG ABUSE TREATMENT AND HOUSING TO KEEP
23 VULNERABLE INDIVIDUALS OUT OF THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM AND
24 THIS HAS IMPLICATIONS FOR THAT WHICH IS MORE HUMANE AND
25 FISCALLY PRUDENT. I THINK THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH SERVICES IS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 WELL POISED TO ACT AS A HOME FOR THESE COMPREHENSIVE DIVERSION
2 EFFORTS, GIVEN ITS ROLE IN THE JAILS TO OVERSEE HEALTHCARE
3 DELIVERY AND ITS SUCCESSFUL EFFORT TO PROVIDE HOUSING WITH
4 SUPPORTIVE SERVICES. THERE IS NO ENTITY IN OUR COUNTY FAMILY
5 OF DEPARTMENTS THAT HAS PERFORMED MORE EFFECTIVELY IN TERMS OF
6 INDIVIDUALS WHO WOULD OTHERWISE BE HOMELESS, SUBJECT TO
7 INCARCERATION SCENARIOS AFTER THEIR RELEASE, AND THIS END
8 WHICH PERTAINS TO THOSE WHO SUFFER FROM MENTAL ILLNESS. BUT I
9 WANT TO UNDERSCORE, IT WILL TAKE MORE THAN JUST ONE
10 DEPARTMENT. ALL THE DEPARTMENTS THAT ARE IN THE EFFORT TO HELP
11 US, THE LAW ENFORCEMENT PARTNERS, OBVIOUSLY THE OFFICE OF THE
12 C.E.O., THE STEERING COMMITTEE. BUT IT'S GOING TO TAKE US ALL
13 AND I WANT TO GIVE A PARTICULAR SHOUT OUT TO THE MEMBERS OF
14 THIS BOARD WHO HAVE MADE IT CLEAR THEY BELIEVE IN THIS
15 APPROACH BECAUSE WE KNOW THAT THERE IS MUCH WORK THAT CAN BE
16 DONE, MUCH GOOD WORK THAT IS BEING DONE. AND I JUST THINK THAT
17 THIS IS A STEP IN THE DIRECTION OF INNOVATION, SHIFTING THE
18 PARADIGM TOWARD ALTERNATIVES TO INCARCERATION THAT WILL PUT US
19 ULTIMATELY IN BETTER STEAD. I THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR.

20

21 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE TWO SPEAKERS.
22 GENEVIEVE CLAVREUL AND ERIC PREVEN.

23

24 **ERIC PREVEN:** THANK YOU. ITS ERIC PREVEN, THE RESIDENT FROM THE
25 THIRD DISTRICT AND I APPLAUD THE SUPERVISORS FOR MOVING IN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THIS DIRECTION. OBVIOUSLY DIVERSION AND RE-ENTRY IS A CRITICAL
2 COMPONENT TO DEALING WITH OUR POPULATION AND THIS IS-- I
3 BELIEVE IT'S ABOUT \$70 SOME MILLION DOLLARS THIS YEAR AND THEN
4 IT WILL BE \$14 MILLION IN ONGOING FUNDS. SO THAT IS VERY MUCH
5 APPRECIATED. 10 PERCENT OF THIS IS AN ADMINISTRATIVE COST AND
6 I ALWAYS HAVE TO ASK WHEN WE HAVE BUREAUCRACY GROUPS PUSHING
7 ONE ANOTHER IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION, WHY THE COST OF
8 ADMINISTRATIVE EXPANSION RISE SO SUBSTANTIALLY? I REALIZE
9 EVERYTHING HAS A COST. BUT WHEN YOU HAVE PEOPLE WHO ARE
10 ALREADY SORT OF ON THE PAYROLL, BECAUSE IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING
11 WE'RE NOT REALLY BULKING UP HERE. WE ARE GOING TO BE
12 PARTNERING UP HERE. I JUST HAVE THE TO ASK. CAN'T WE PUT MORE
13 OF THAT MONEY ONTO THE SCREEN? IT'S YOUR BUSINESS. 40 PERCENT
14 OF THE FUNDS ARE GOING TO BE USED FOR HOUSING, SO WE
15 APPRECIATE THAT. 50 PERCENT WILL BE USED FOR DIVERSION AND
16 ANTIRECIDIVISM PROGRAMS WHICH OBVIOUSLY MEANS PARTNERSHIPS AND
17 TRYING TO GET THINGS GOING WITHIN THE COUNTY'S EXISTING
18 PROGRAMS. AND THEN 10 PERCENT. NOW IF IT'S 10 PERCENT OF \$74.5
19 MILLION, THOSE WHO ARE SKILLED AT DOING THE QUICK CALCULATION
20 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT \$7.4 MILLION. NOW THAT COULD BUILD THREE
21 QUARTERS OF A PARKS AND REC SWIMMING POOL IN MR. RIDLEY-
22 THOMAS' DISTRICT. THAT COULD BUILD A LOT OF DIFFERENT THINGS
23 THAT WOULD AFFECT PEOPLE, MAYBE A CENTER. SO I KNOW THAT
24 THINGS COST BUT WE GOT THESE GUYS TAKING ADMINISTRATIVE MONEY
25 OUT OF EVERY POT AND IT'S THE SAME GUYS. THAT WORRIES ME. I

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 KNOW THAT YOU'RE TRYING, BUT WE HAVE TO GET CONTROL OF THAT.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** DR. CLAVREUL.

5

6 **DR. GENEVIEVE CLAVREUL:** GOOD MORNING, BOARD OF SUPERVISORS,
7 DR. GENEVIEVE CLAVREUL. I AM TOTALLY IN FAVOR OF DIVERSION AND
8 ESPECIALLY THE MENTAL HEALTH SUPPORT GIVEN. I AM CONCERNED
9 THAT AGAIN WE ARE MOVING THAT WITHIN THE D.H.S. DEPARTMENT. WE
10 ARE CERTAINLY NOT DOING A SUPERB JOB AND I THINK THAT'S GOING
11 TO EVEN CREATE MORE ISSUES. IT'S DIFFERENT TRYING TO GET A LOT
12 OF THINGS OUT OF THE SAME DEPARTMENT. AND TO GIVE IT TO A
13 DEPARTMENT WHO IS ALREADY IN BIG TROUBLE. AND I'M SEEING THAT
14 EVERY WEEK. AND WE ARE HAVING LAWSUIT AFTER LAWSUIT FOR
15 MALPRACTICE AND SO ON. THE COMPLEXITY OF THE DIVERSION WHICH
16 YOU ARE TRYING TO ADDRESS VIGOROUSLY, ESPECIALLY WITH THE
17 MENTAL HEALTH INVOLVED IN IT, THAT SHOULD BE UNDER THE
18 DEPARTMENT OF MENTAL HEALTH AND NOT DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH. SO I
19 AM REALLY CONCERNED OF THAT CONSTANT MORE AND MORE DUTY AS
20 UNDER D.H.S., UNTIL YOU LOOK AT D.H.S. AND THAT'S MY RESPONSE
21 TO A COUPLE OF ARTICLES IN THE NEWSPAPER I THOUGHT YOU MIGHT
22 WANT TO READ. I MADE COPIES FOR ALL OF YOU. AND WHAT I THINK
23 OF D.H.S. ONE SECOND. THANK YOU.

24

25 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** , MR. MAYOR, WITH YOUR PERMISSION I'D LIKE
3 TO MOVE THE ITEM FORWARD.

4

5 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. ANY
6 OPPOSITION? OKAY. SO ORDERED. OKAY, NEXT ITEM. YES, BOTH
7 ITEMS.

8

9 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** 9 AND 43.

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SO P-1 AND ITEM 4 ARE RELATED ITEMS,
12 SO SPEAKERS WILL BE GIVEN ONE SET TIME TO DRESS BOTH ITEMS.

13

14 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** GOOD MORNING, SUPERVISORS, THIS IS A REPORT
15 BACK ON WAGE THEFT BY THE COUNTY COUNSEL, THE C.E.O. AND THE
16 DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AND BUSINESS AFFAIRS. I'M JUDY
17 WHITEHURST, ASSISTANT COUNTY COUNSEL AND WITH ME ALSO IS MARY
18 WICKHAM, INTERIM COUNTY COUNSEL, AND MIKE BUENNAGEL, SENIOR
19 ASSOCIATE COUNTY COUNSEL, ON THE COUNTY COUNSEL REPORT. IN
20 ADDITION, THE C.E.O., SACHI HAMAI AND BRIAN STIGER FROM THE
21 DEPARTMENT OF BUSINESS AND CONSUMER AFFAIRS WILL ALSO BE
22 PROVIDING A REPORT. THE COUNTY MINIMUM WAGE WAS ADOPTED ON
23 SEPTEMBER 29, 2015 AND BECAME EFFECTIVE ON OCTOBER 29, 2015.
24 IT ESTABLISHES A MINIMUM WAGE FOR EMPLOYEES THAT WORK IN LOS
25 ANGELES COUNTY'S UNINCORPORATED AREAS. ON JULY 1, 2016, THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 MINIMUM WAGE INCREASES TO \$10.50 FOR BUSINESSES WITH 26 OR
2 MORE EMPLOYEES. ON JULY 1, 2017, IT BECOMES \$10.50 WITH
3 BUSINESSES WITH 25 EMPLOYEES OR LESS. AT THAT TIME ALL
4 BUSINESSES WILL BE REQUIRED TO COMPLY WITH THE COUNTY'S
5 MINIMUM WAGE IN THE UNINCORPORATED AREA. THE MINIMUM WAGE
6 INCREASES EVERY JULY 1ST THEREAFTER AND IN 2021 THE INCREASE
7 IS BASED ON THE CONSUMER PRICE INDEX. THE MINIMUM WAGE
8 ORDINANCE ALLOWS THE C.E.O. OR DESIGNEE TO START PUBLIC
9 OUTREACH AND ENFORCEMENT USING CHAPTER 1.25 OF THE COUNTY
10 CODE. CHAPTER 1.25 APPLIES TO ALL COUNTY CODE VIOLATIONS AND
11 ALLOWS FOR ADMINISTRATIVE FINES AND NONCOMPLIANCE FEES BUT
12 DOES NOT PERMIT THE COUNTY TO RECOVER BACK WAGES. ON JULY 21,
13 2015 YOUR BOARD ASKED FOR TWO REPORTS. THE FIRST IS FROM
14 COUNTY COUNSEL AND IS A REPORT BACK ON THE COUNTY'S AUTHORITY
15 TO REGULATE WAGE THEFT AND THE TOOLS AVAILABLE TO DO SO. THE
16 SECOND REPORT ASKED THE C.E.O., THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER
17 AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS AFFAIRS, COUNTY COUNSEL AND OTHER
18 AGENCIES TO REPORT BACK WITH A MOST EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT
19 MODEL TO ENFORCE WAGE THEFT REGULATIONS. SO I'LL BEGIN WITH
20 THE COUNTY COUNSEL REPORT. WAGE THEFT IS GENERALLY ANY FAILURE
21 BY AN EMPLOYER TO PAY WAGES OR PROVIDE BENEFITS OWED TO AN
22 EMPLOYEE THAT HE OR SHE IS LEGALLY ENTITLED TO RECEIVE.
23 EXAMPLES OF WAGE THEFT INCLUDE FAILURE TO PAY MINIMUM WAGE OR
24 OVERTIME, FAILURE TO PAY MEAL AND REST BREAKS, IMPROPER
25 PAYCHECK DEDUCTIONS, UNDER-THE-TABLE PAYMENTS SUCH AS CASH

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 PAYMENTS IN ORDER TO AVOID MINIMUM WAGE AND OTHER BENEFITS,
2 AND MISCLASSIFICATION OF EMPLOYEES AS INDEPENDENT CONTRACTORS.
3 THE U.C.L.A. INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH ON LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT
4 STUDIED INDUSTRIES WITH HIGH WAGE THEFT RATES. THESE FIGURES
5 HERE INCLUDE THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY UNINCORPORATED AREA AS
6 WELL AS INCORPORATED CITIES IN THE COUNTY. THE STUDY FOUND
7 HIGH WAGE THEFT RATES IN THESE INDUSTRIES: GARMENT WITH 57.8
8 PERCENT. DOMESTIC SERVICE WITH 34.7 PERCENT. BUILDING SERVICES
9 WHICH INCLUDES JANITORIAL AND LANDSCAPING AT 31.5 PERCENT.
10 RETAIL, AUTO REPAIR AND CAR WASH, RESTAURANTS AND HOTELS AND
11 RESIDENTIAL CONSTRUCTION. WITH THE ASSISTANCE OF THE ASSESSOR,
12 WE WERE ABLE TO ESTIMATE THE TYPES OF BUSINESSES IN THE
13 UNINCORPORATED AREAS. AS YOU CAN SEE FROM THE TOTAL, THERE ARE
14 APPROXIMATELY 15,000 BUSINESSES IN THE UNINCORPORATED AREA. WE
15 BELIEVE THIS IS THE FLOOR BASED UPON THE INFORMATION IN THE
16 ASSESSOR'S OFFICE. THE TOP THREE INDUSTRIES MAKE UP ABOUT 67
17 PERCENT OF ALL THE BUSINESSES AND THEY INCLUDE SERVICES WHICH
18 WOULD BE BUSINESSES LIKE LAUNDRIES, BEAUTY SALONS, JANITORIAL
19 SERVICES, RETAIL, WHICH GENERALLY COVERS ALL RETAIL, FOOD
20 SERVICE SUCH AS RESTAURANT, CAFE, BARS, CATERING, TAKEOUT. THE
21 REMAINING CATEGORIES MAKE UP THE LAST THIRD OF THE BUSINESSES
22 IN THE UNINCORPORATED AREA, AND THAT WOULD INCLUDE CAR WASHES,
23 HOTEL LODGING AND THOSE SORTS OF BUSINESSES. THE COUNTY'S
24 POWER TO REGULATE WAGE THEFT STEMS FROM ITS POLICE POWER. THE
25 CALIFORNIA CONSTITUTION PROVIDES THAT COUNTIES MAY MAKE AND

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ENFORCE IN THE UNINCORPORATED AREA, ALL LOCAL POLICE, SANITARY
2 AND OTHER ORDINANCES AND REGULATIONS NOT IN CONFLICT WITH
3 GENERAL LAWS OF THE STATE. ADDITIONAL CONTRACTING POWER IS
4 FOUND IN THE CALIFORNIA CONSTITUTION AS WELL AS IN STATE LAW
5 AND THE GOVERNMENT CODE AND THE COUNTY CHARTER. AND USING
6 THESE LAWS, THE COUNTY MAY ENTER INTO CONTRACT AND PLACE
7 RESTRICTIONS ON ITS CONTRACTORS THAT IT DOES BUSINESS WITH.
8 THE COUNTY'S POLICE POWER OR REGULATORY POWER MAY BE EXERCISED
9 TO ESTABLISH THE MINIMUM WAGE ORDINANCE, WHICH WE'VE ALREADY
10 DONE, CREATE A WAGE ENFORCEMENT ORDINANCE AND AMEND THE
11 BUSINESS LICENSE ORDINANCE. THE COUNTY CAN ENFORCE ITS MINIMUM
12 WAGE ORDINANCE USING THE FOLLOWING REGULATORY TOOLS: RECOVER
13 BACK WAGES FOR EMPLOYEES. ISSUE ADMINISTRATIVE FINES AND
14 IMPOSE PENALTIES BOTH FOR EMPLOYEES AND THE COUNTY. PERMIT
15 ACCESS TO EMPLOYER RECORDS USING SUBPOENA POWER EITHER THROUGH
16 THE BOARD OR THROUGH A COUNTY HEARING OFFICER. PROHIBIT AND
17 PENALIZE RETALIATION AGAINST EMPLOYEES. ALLOW AN EMPLOYEE TO
18 FILE A CIVIL LAWSUIT, WHICH IS ALSO KNOWN AS A PRIVATE RIGHT
19 OF ACTION INSTEAD OF COMING DIRECTLY TO THE COUNTY, AND ALLOW
20 FOR ENFORCEMENT USING CIVIL LAWSUITS, JUDGMENTS, LEVIES AND
21 LIENS. AN ADDITIONAL TOOL RELATES TO THE BUSINESS LICENSING
22 ORDINANCE. THE COUNTY CURRENTLY LICENSES A PORTION OF
23 BUSINESSES OPERATING IN THE UNINCORPORATED COUNTY. THE
24 TREASURER TAX COLLECTOR ADMINISTERS AND ENFORCES TITLE 7 OF
25 THE COUNTY CODE. APPROXIMATELY 5,000 OF THE NEARLY 15,000

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 BUSINESSES IN THE UNINCORPORATED AREA ARE LICENSED BY THE
2 COUNTY OR APPROXIMATELY 1/3 OF THE BUSINESSES. GENERALLY,
3 BUSINESSES LICENSED INVOLVE HEALTH AND SAFETY COMPONENTS LIKE
4 AMBULANCES, BINGO, CARD GAME, MEDICAL MARIJUANA DISPENSARIES,
5 ADULT BUSINESSES, SALE OF SECONDHAND GOODS. ADDITIONAL
6 CONTRACTING TOOLS ARE ALSO AVAILABLE TO THE COUNTY USING ITS
7 CONTRACTING AUTHORITY, AND AS A MARKET PARTICIPANT, THE COUNTY
8 CAN ADD REQUIREMENTS TO ITS CONTRACTS. WE ALREADY DO THIS FOR
9 JURY SERVICE. THE COUNTY MAY ALSO CONSIDER REQUIRING ALL
10 BIDDERS TO REPORT WAGE VIOLATIONS AND DEDUCT POINTS OR
11 POTENTIALLY PREVENT THEM FROM BIDDING, REQUIRING EXISTING
12 CONTRACTORS TO REPORT WAGE VIOLATIONS, OR POTENTIALLY
13 TERMINATE EXISTING CONTRACTS FOR WAGE VIOLATIONS. THE LAST
14 TOOL THAT THE COUNTY HAS IS TO PARTNER WITH OTHER GOVERNMENTS.
15 IF THE COUNTY CHOOSES TO HAVE A WIDER ROLE IN ENFORCEMENT IT
16 COULD PARTNER WITH AND/OR CONTRACT WITH CITIES OR THE STATE TO
17 ENFORCE THEIR WAGE LAWS. TO CONCLUDE THE COUNTY COUNSEL
18 REPORT, THE COUNTY HAS REGULATORY AND CONTRACTING POWER AND WE
19 HAVE VARIOUS TOOLS TO ADDRESS WAGE THEFT. AND NOW THE C.E.O.
20 AND THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AND BUSINESS AFFAIRS WILL
21 DISCUSS THE PROPOSED WAGE ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM.

22
23 **C.E.O. SACHI HAMAI:** THANK YOU. AS JUDY INDICATED EARLIER, ON
24 JULY 31, 2015, YOUR BOARD INSTRUCTED THE C.E.O., DEPARTMENT OF
25 CONSUMER AND BUSINESS AFFAIRS, COUNTY COUNSEL AND OTHER

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 RELEVANT COUNTY AGENCIES TO REPORT BACK WITH THE MOST
2 EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT MODEL TO ENFORCE WAGE THEFT
3 REGULATIONS, INCLUDING AN INVENTORY AND ANALYSIS OF THE
4 COUNTY'S EXISTING WAGE ENFORCEMENT EFFORTS, POTENTIAL
5 COLLABORATIONS WITH OTHER JURISDICTIONS, USE OF COMMUNITY-
6 BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND AN ESTIMATE OF RESOURCES, STAFFING AND
7 COSTS. CURRENTLY WITHIN THE COUNTY, THE EXISTING COUNTY WAGE
8 ENFORCEMENT EFFORTS ARE FOR PREVAILING WAGE COMPLIANCE IN
9 PUBLIC WORKS CONTRACTS, PREVAILING WAGES ARE SET BY THE STATE
10 AND FEDERAL LAW. AND THE COUNTY MONITORS FOR COMPLIANCE. THIS
11 RESPONSIBILITY LIES PRIMARILY WITH I.S.D. AND PUBLIC WORKS.
12 THE LIVING WAGE COMPLIANCE AND COUNTY CONTRACTS UNDER
13 PROPOSITION A AND CAFETERIA SERVICE CONTRACTS, THIS
14 RESPONSIBILITY LIES WITH EVERY DEPARTMENT THAT HAS A PROP A OR
15 CAFETERIA SERVICES CONTRACT. WE CURRENTLY RECOMMEND PLACING
16 THE WAGE ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM WITHIN THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER
17 AND BUSINESS AFFAIRS AND DO NOT RECOMMEND CHANGING OR
18 RELOCATING ANY OF THE PREVAILING WAGE OR LIVING WAGE
19 COMPLIANCE EFFORTS FROM THE DEPARTMENTS THAT CURRENTLY PERFORM
20 THOSE FUNCTIONS. THE PROPOSED COUNTY WAGE ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM
21 WOULD BE FOR FISCAL YEAR '15/'16, FIVE POSITIONS. AND THAT
22 WOULD COST APPROXIMATELY \$400,000 FOR A SIX-MONTH PERIOD WHICH
23 INCLUDES \$100,000 FOR COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS. NOW I
24 WILL TURN IT OVER TO BRIAN STIGER, WHO IS THE DIRECTOR OF THE
25 CONSUMER AND BUSINESS AFFAIRS.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **BRIAN STIGER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD MORNING, MR. MAYOR,
3 HONORABLE SUPERVISORS. I WANT TO THANK THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE
4 OFFICER FOR RECOMMENDING THAT OUR DEPARTMENT ENFORCE THE NEW
5 MINIMUM WAGE ORDINANCE. AND IT IS MY PLEASURE TO GIVE YOU A
6 BRIEF OVERVIEW OF OUR PROPOSED WAGE ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM. THE
7 DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AND BUSINESS AFFAIRS HAS ENFORCED
8 CONSUMER PROTECTION LAWS FOR ALMOST 40 YEARS. WE HAVE A LONG
9 HISTORY OF EDUCATING CONSUMERS AND BUSINESSES, INVESTIGATING
10 CONSUMER COMPLAINTS AND SEEKING RESTITUTION FOR CONSUMERS WHO
11 HAVE BEEN VICTIMIZED IN THE MARKETPLACE. THIS PROPOSED WAGE
12 ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM FITS SEAMLESSLY INTO OUR CURRENT
13 ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE. NOT ONLY DO WE HAVE AN EFFECTIVE
14 INFRASTRUCTURE IN PLACE TO IMPLEMENT THIS PROGRAM, WE HAVE
15 BUILT A CULTURE AND REPUTATION OVER A LONG PERIOD OF TIME TO
16 ENFORCING CONSUMER LAWS IN A FAIR, FORM AND CONSISTENT MANNER.
17 WE WILL ENFORCE THE MINIMUM WAGE ORDINANCE THROUGH EDUCATION
18 AND ENFORCEMENT. THROUGH OUR OWN EXPERIENCE AND CONSULTING
19 WITH THE WAGE ENFORCEMENT EXPERTS, OUR PROGRAM WILL STRIKE AN
20 APPROPRIATE BALANCE BETWEEN EDUCATION AND ENFORCEMENT. WE WILL
21 ALLOCATE THE NECESSARY RESOURCES TO HELP PREVENT WAGE THEFT
22 FROM OCCURRING AT THE OUTSET. WE WILL EDUCATE EMPLOYERS TO
23 HELP THEM UNDERSTAND THEIR RESPONSIBILITIES AND HOW TO COMPLY
24 WITH THE ORDINANCE. THIS PROACTIVE EFFORT WOULD HELP US
25 PROMOTE VOLUNTARY COMPLIANCE. WE WILL ALSO EDUCATE WORKERS ON

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THEIR RIGHTS UNDER THE LAW AND WHERE THEY CAN GO FOR FREE,
2 CONFIDENTIAL HELP IF THEY BELIEVE THEIR EMPLOYER HAS ILLEGALLY
3 WITHHELD THEIR WAGES. BUT DESPITE OUR BEST EFFORTS TO PREVENT
4 WAGE THEFT, WE KNOW SOME EMPLOYERS WILL VIOLATE THE ORDINANCE.
5 WE WILL ACTIVELY ENFORCE THE PROVISIONS OF THE ORDINANCE AND
6 TAKE IMMEDIATE ACTION TO STOP ILLEGAL CONDUCT AND ENSURE ALL
7 BACK AGES ARE PAID TO WAGE THEFT VICTIMS. BEGINNING AT THE TOP
8 THERE, THIS IS GOING TO BE OUR PROPOSED STRUCTURE. OUR POLICY
9 UNIT WILL WORK WITH COUNTY COUNSEL TO CRAFT THE ORDINANCE, A
10 STRONG ORDINANCE, DEVELOP INTERNAL POLICIES AND PROCEDURES AND
11 ANALYZE PROPOSED LEGISLATION. OUR EDUCATION AND OUTREACH TEAM
12 WILL DEVELOP A PUBLIC AWARENESS CAMPAIGN TO EDUCATE EMPLOYERS
13 AND EMPLOYEES ABOUT THE ORDINANCE, MAKE PRESENTATIONS, CONVENE
14 ROUND TABLE DISCUSSIONS AND CREATE EDUCATIONAL MATERIALS. THEY
15 WILL ALSO WORK WITH COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS TO TARGET
16 INDUSTRIES OR WORKERS THAT ARE MOST VULNERABLE TO WAGE THEFT.
17 OUR TEAM WILL ALSO PROVIDE ANY SUPPLEMENTAL ASSISTANCE TO WAGE
18 THEFT VICTIMS INCLUDING INFORMATION ABOUT CONSUMER PROTECTION
19 AND FINANCIAL EMPOWERMENT. OUR INFORMATION CENTER WILL BE
20 STAFFED WITH TRAINED COUNSELORS WHO WILL ANSWER GENERAL
21 QUESTIONS ABOUT THE ORDINANCE. OUR ENFORCEMENT PROCESS, AND
22 WILL BE REFER NON JURISDICTIONAL CASES TO THE MOST APPROPRIATE
23 GOVERNMENT AGENCY. OUR FIELD INVESTIGATIONS TEAM WILL
24 INVESTIGATE ALL ALLEGED VIOLATIONS OF ORDINANCE WITHIN OUR
25 JURISDICTION AUTHORITY. WORKERS, BUSINESSES AND MEMBERS OF THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 PUBLIC WILL BE ABLE TO FILE COMPLAINTS ONLINE, OVER THE
2 TELEPHONE OR IN PERSON. OUR COMPLIANCE UNIT WILL REVIEW AND
3 ANALYZE INVESTIGATIVE REPORTS TO RECOMMEND THE APPROPRIATE
4 LEVELS OF INTERVENTION, CONDUCT SETTLEMENT ARRANGEMENT AND
5 HANDLE THE RECOVERY AND RETURN OF BACK WAGES TO THE VICTIMS.
6 WE WILL PARTNER WITH LOCAL, STATE AND FEDERAL AGENCIES TO
7 SHARE BEST PRACTICES, TRAINING OPPORTUNITIES AND JOINT
8 INVESTIGATIONS. WE WILL ALSO PARTNER WITH COMMUNITY-BASED
9 ORGANIZATIONS TO HELP BUILD TRUST AND BROADEN OUR REACH INTO
10 DIVERSE COMMUNITIES. AND, FINALLY, WE WILL PARTNER WITH THE
11 BUSINESS COMMUNITY TO ASSIST WITH EDUCATION AND OUTREACH
12 EFFORTS TO BUSINESSES AND SEEK THEIR IDEAS ON PREVENTATIVE
13 MEASURES WE CAN IMPLEMENT TO ASSIST BUSINESSES COMPLY WITH THE
14 ORDINANCE. WE ARE PREPARED TO ASSEMBLE A TRANSITION TEAM TO
15 IMMEDIATELY BEGIN BUILDING OUR WAGE ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM AND WE
16 WILL BE READY TO INVESTIGATE WAGE THEFT COMPLAINTS ON JULY 1,
17 2016. AND WITH THAT WE'LL TAKE ANY QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD.

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** I HAVE A QUESTION. SUPERVISOR HILDA
20 SOLIS.

21

22 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR AND ALSO I WANT TO
23 CONGRATULATE THE C.E.O.'S OFFICE AS WELL AS BRIAN STIGER AND
24 COUNTY COUNSEL AND ALL OF OUR STAFFS, ESPECIALLY THOSE THAT
25 HAVE PARTAKEN IN THIS I THINK VERY, VERY EXCITING DAY. THIS IS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 A VERY UNIQUE OPPORTUNITY FOR THE COUNTY TO GET INVOLVED IN
2 HELPING PROVIDE SOLUTIONS, NOT ONLY FOR EMPLOYEES AFFECTED IN
3 THE UNINCORPORATED AREA BUT FOR THOSE SMALL BUSINESSES, FOR
4 THOSE MANY THAT PERHAPS NOW HAVE NOT BEEN TOUCHED
5 APPROPRIATELY BY THE COUNTY BUT IN A WAY THAT HELPS INFORM
6 THEM AND GIVES THEM THE POWER TO MAKE CHOICES, AS WELL,
7 HOPEFULLY GOOD DECISIONS THAT WILL HELP LEAD US TO I THINK A
8 BETTER QUALITY OF LIFE FOR OUR RESIDENTS AND ALSO HOPEFULLY A
9 WIN/WIN FOR US IN THAT IF WE CAN CAPTURE DATA REGARDING THOSE
10 BUSINESSES, WHAT THEY'RE DOING, HOW WE CAN WORK WITH THEM, AND
11 ALSO MAKE SURE THAT APPROPRIATE TAXES AND BENEFITS AND THINGS
12 OF THAT NATURE AND ENFORCEMENT OF OUR WAGE LAWS ARE ALL THERE
13 APPROPRIATELY GIVEN AS OPPORTUNITIES FOR THESE BUSINESSES, I
14 THINK IT'S A WIN/WIN FOR THE COUNTY. THE UNDERGROUND ECONOMY
15 AS YOU KNOW IS PHENOMENAL. THE AMOUNT OF UNTOLD FUNDS THAT GO
16 UNDETECTED OR DO NOT COME IN TO OUR BUDGETS TO HELP FOR
17 SHERIFFS, FOR MENTAL HEALTH, FOR EDUCATION, FOR MANY, MANY
18 THINGS THAT THE COUNTY IS MANDATED TO PROVIDE AS A SAFETY NET.
19 I THINK AS WE MOVE ALONG, I KNOW WE ARE STAFFING UP ON THE
20 SHORT SIDE. AND I UNDERSTAND AFTER THAT WE MAY SEE AN INCREASE
21 DEPENDING ON THE PROGRESS AND I'M HOPEFUL THAT WE WILL SEE
22 SOME PROGRESS. BUT I'M MORE EXCITED ABOUT THE OPPORTUNITY THAT
23 WE WILL ALSO HAVE WITH OTHER CITIES AND LOCALES. ONCE PEOPLE
24 START TO SEE THAT THE COUNTY'S TAKING A LEADERSHIP ROLE, AS
25 WAS DONE A FEW MONTHS AGO THROUGH THE LEADERSHIP OF SHEILA

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 KUEHL AND OTHER MEMBERS OF THE BOARD TO INCREASE MINIMUM WAGE,
2 IT DOES HAVE A DOMINO EFFECT. AND WHILE WE MAY BE TAKING A
3 PAGE OUT OF WHAT OTHER COUNTIES ARE DOING BECAUSE THEY'VE
4 ALREADY IMPLEMENTED SOME SEMBLANCE OF WHAT WE'RE LOOKING AT
5 TODAY, INCLUDING THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES, THEIR PROGRAM MAY BE
6 MORE AMBITIOUS, BUT I WOULD SAY THAT FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS
7 ANGELES, THIS IS A BIG HISTORIC STEP FOR US. AND WE'RE NOT
8 DOING IT ALONE. SO I REALLY WANT TO SAY FOR THOSE INDIVIDUALS
9 THAT ARE OUT THERE WONDERING, WELL, HOW IS THIS ALL GOING TO
10 WORK? A LOT OF IT IS GOING TO BE BRINGING PARTNERS TOGETHER.
11 SO IT'S WONDERFUL TO BE ABLE TO TALK ABOUT ENGAGING THE
12 COMMUNITY AND ALSO PROVIDING SUPPORT FOR THAT COMMUNITY-BASED
13 GROUPS THAT ARE ALREADY OUT THERE SERVING AS KIND OF OUR
14 INDIVIDUALS THAT LEAD US WHEN THERE ARE CONCERNS OUT THERE
15 THAT CAN TELL US AND HELP SHARE INFORMATION THAT WE WANT TO
16 PROVIDE TO THE COMMUNITY, AS WELL. SO IT'S A TWO-WAY STREET, I
17 BELIEVE, AND ONE THAT I THINK WILL CREATE MORE BENEFITS FOR US
18 IN THE LONG RUN, AND HELP TO KIND OF REALLY GIVE CLEAR
19 INFORMATION ABOUT WHAT THE ROLE IS OF THE COUNTY IN ADDITION
20 TO ALL THE RESOURCES THAT WE PROVIDE TO SMALL BUSINESSES. MANY
21 OF YOU HAVE HEARD FROM THE DAIS HERE TIME AND TIME AGAIN HOW
22 IMPORTANT IT IS TO PROVIDE THE NECESSARY TOOLS FOR THE SUCCESS
23 OF OUR SMALL BUSINESSES, AND ESPECIALLY IN IMMIGRANT
24 COMMUNITIES THAT I REPRESENT IN EAST LOS ANGELES AND OTHER
25 UNINCORPORATED AREAS. BUT THIS GOES ACROSS-THE-BOARD AND I

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THINK IT WILL HAVE A LASTING IMPACT BUT WE HAVE TO GIVE IT A
2 CHANCE, AND I REALLY WANT TO THANK THE BOARD. I WANT TO THANK
3 MY CO-AUTHOR, MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS ALSO FOR STEPPING UP AND FOR
4 ALL THE BOARD FOR HELPING US MOVE IN THIS DIRECTION. IT HELPS
5 TO LEVEL THE PLAYING FIELD AND I THINK IT SENDS A STRONG
6 MESSAGE TO EMPLOYERS, ESPECIALLY THOSE THAT DON'T PLAY BY THE
7 RULES, THAT NOW THERE WILL BE A SPOTLIGHT AND THAT SPOTLIGHT
8 CAN BE USED IN DIFFERENT WAYS AND THERE WILL BE DIFFERENT
9 TOOLS THAT YOU WILL COME BACK WITH AND WILL DECIDE HOW THAT
10 WILL BE USED. BUT NONETHELESS WE KNOW OUR ROLE IS SOMEWHAT
11 LIMITED. WE ARE NOT THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT, WE ARE NOT THE
12 STATE GOVERNMENT. BUT IT'S NOT TO SAY THAT WE DON'T HAVE
13 PARTNERS WITH THE LABOR DEPARTMENT, AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL AND
14 ALSO AT THE STATE LEVEL, AND OF COURSE WITH OUR OTHER CITIES.
15 I THINK WE COULD ADDITIONALLY SEE SOME BENEFITS FOR OUR OTHER
16 87 OR 88 CITIES THAT WE ARE PART OF THE COUNTY FAMILY THAT
17 MIGHT WANT TO JOIN US AND PERHAPS CREATE A CONTRACTUAL
18 RELATIONSHIP POTENTIALLY MOVING FORWARD. I'M GOING TO DEVIATE
19 FROM SOME OF MY TALKING POINTS, BUT I DO WANT TO TELL YOU THAT
20 THIS HAS BEEN A REALLY EARNEST EFFORT , I THINK, ON THE PART
21 OF THE COUNTY, AND I REALLY WANT TO COMMEND THE STAFF, COUNTY
22 COUNSEL, ESPECIALLY, AND THE C.E.O.'S OFFICE AND ALL THOSE
23 AFFECTED, FOR WORKING SO CLOSELY WITH US IN HELPING TO COME UP
24 WITH WHAT I THINK IS GOING TO BE SOMETHING THAT WORKS FOR US,
25 AND WE'LL MAKE ADJUSTMENTS AND THAT'S WHAT THIS IS ABOUT. IT'S

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 A COUNTY THAT'S EVOLVING, IT'S A COUNTY THAT'S ADAPTABLE,
2 ADAPTABLE, IT'S A COUNTY THAT SHOULD BE LEADING AND WE LEAD BY
3 EXAMPLE BY TAKING THAT FIRST STEP. AND I KNOW THERE WILL BE
4 QUESTIONS BY SOME MEMBERS AND PERHAPS THE PUBLIC AS TO HOW
5 THIS IS PAID FOR. BUT I THINK IT'S A DROP IN THE BUCKET TO
6 BEGIN A PROCESS THAT WILL BE LONG LASTING. AND WHATEVER THE
7 COUNTY DOES HERE WILL, I BELIEVE, IMPACT WHAT HAPPENS IN OTHER
8 LARGER, SIMILAR AREAS OF JURISDICTION. I THINK THAT BODES WELL
9 FOR US BECAUSE THE COUNTY HAS A LOT TO OFFER AND I FOR ONE
10 WANT TO SEE THAT SOUNDING OUT OF INFORMATION FOR EVERYONE. AND
11 I'M PARTICULARLY HAPPY THAT WE ARE GOING TO BE ABLE TO REACH
12 ALL COMMUNITIES, BECAUSE WHERE WE SEE THE MOST EGREGIOUS
13 VIOLATIONS ARE IN IMMIGRANT COMMUNITIES AND IMMIGRANT-BASED
14 BUSINESSES IN MANY WAYS. AND THAT'S NOT TO SAY THAT PEOPLE
15 DON'T WANT TO COMPLY, BUT PERHAPS THEY DON'T UNDERSTAND
16 BECAUSE OF LANGUAGE BARRIERS. AND THIS WILL BE AN IMPORTANT
17 ASSET, I BELIEVE, FOR US AS WE MOVE FORWARD AND MAKE SURE THAT
18 THOSE MATERIALS AND COMPETENT STAFF ARE EQUALLY PROVIDED WITH
19 THE SKILL SETS TO BE ABLE TO DO THIS JOB. AND WE'LL LEARN,
20 OBVIOUSLY WE'LL LEARN. SO I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT I ALSO WANT
21 TO GIVE A SHOUT OUT TO ONE OF MY COLLEAGUES HERE AT THE DAIS
22 SHEILA KUEHL BECAUSE I DO HAVE AN AMENDMENT THAT I'M PUSHING
23 FOR BECAUSE I'VE BEEN ASKED NOW-- AND I'M SURE SOME OF YOU
24 HAVE BEEN ASKED-- WHAT WOULD IT TAKE FOR US TO REALLY GATHER
25 DATA FOR ALL THE OTHER 88 CITIES AND REALLY UNDERSTAND WHAT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THEIR PROCESSES ARE, WHO'S THE TAXING AUTHORITY OR HOW DO
2 THOSE FEES BECOME ESTABLISHED, WHO COLLECTS THEM, WHERE DO
3 THEY GO? AND I THINK WE CAN LEARN A LOT FROM THAT. SO I WANT
4 TO SUBMIT THIS MOTION. AND IF I CAN READ IT IN AS A PART OF
5 THIS. THIS WOULD BE ITEM 4 REVISED. RECOMMENDATION AS
6 SUBMITTED BY SUPERVISOR SOLIS AND RIDLEY-THOMAS TO TAKE THE
7 FOLLOWING ACTION AS IT RELATES TO ITEM NO. P-1. 5) DIRECT THE
8 TREASURER AND TAX COLLECTOR, COUNTY COUNSEL, C.E.O. AND ALL
9 RELEVANT DEPARTMENTS TO REPORT BACK IN WRITING WITHIN 90 DAYS
10 ON THE EXISTING CRITERIA AND PRACTICES FOR BUSINESS
11 REGISTRATION, LICENSING OR PERMITTING PROCESSES OF ALL 88
12 CITIES IN L.A. COUNTY AND ON THE FEASIBILITY OF EXPANDING
13 BUSINESS LICENSING TO ALL BUSINESSES IN THE UNINCORPORATED
14 AREAS AND TO INCORPORATE TO THE GREATEST EXTENT ALLOWED BY LAW
15 WAGE THEFT CRITERIA IN BUSINESS LICENSING, REGISTRATION AND
16 PERMITTING PROCESSES." AND I WANT TO AGAIN JUST CLOSE BY
17 SAYING THANK YOU TO EVERYONE THAT HAS HAD A HAND IN
18 PARTICULAR. I KNOW MY STAFF AND THE STAFFS OF MY ABLE-BODIED
19 MEMBERS THAT SERVE WITH US HERE ON THE BOARD. IT IS INDEED A
20 WONDERFUL DAY FOR US.

21
22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** BEFORE I CALL ON SUPERVISOR KNABE, LET
23 ME JUST ASK. THE COST FOR THIS OFFICE IS IS \$408,000, FIVE NEW
24 POSITIONS. WHAT WOULD BE THE TOTAL ANNUAL COST FOR 2016-'17

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AFTER YOU HIRE ALL 11 POSITIONS AND A COMMUNITY-BASED
2 ORGANIZATION ALONG WITH OFFICE SPACE AND SUPPORT STAFF?

3

4 **C.E.O. SACHI HAMAI:** MR. MAYOR, MEMBERS OF THE BOARD, THE TOTAL
5 COST IS APPROXIMATELY \$1.476 MILLION.

6

7 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** DO APPROXIMATELY ALMOST \$1.5 MILLION.
8 CURRENTLY WE HAVE A STATE LAW WITH A COLLEAGUE THAT I SERVED
9 WITH IN THE STATE LEGISLATURE WHO LATER BECAME A CONGRESSMAN,
10 THAT WAS HOWARD BERMAN. THE STATE LAWS, BERMAN HIRING PROCESS,
11 THAT ALLOWS THE STATE LABOR COMMISSIONER TO HEAR ALL CASES OF
12 WAGE UNDERPAYMENT REGARDLESS OF WHETHER IT IS A LOCAL MINIMUM
13 WAGE OR A STATE MINIMUM WAGE ISSUE. SO HOW DOES THIS NEW
14 OFFICE NOT BECOME A DUPLICATION OF A STATE LAW THAT COVERS
15 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS AND LOCAL RESIDENTS?

16

17 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** SUPERVISOR, THERE IS A PROCESS THAT'S CALLED
18 THE BERMAN HEARINGS. AND SO INDIVIDUAL CLAIMANTS CAN GO TO THE
19 STATE AND FILE A CLAIM FOR THEIR INDIVIDUAL ACTION. THERE ARE
20 FEW EXCEPTIONS LIKE IF THE BUSINESS IS IN BANKRUPTCY AND SOME
21 OTHER EXCEPTIONS, BUT AN INDIVIDUAL COULD GO STRAIGHT TO A
22 BERMAN HEARING TO HAVE THEIR OWN CLAIM DECIDED. THEY CAN ALSO
23 GO DIRECTLY TO COURT. THEY COULD BYPASS THE COUNTY AND THEY
24 COULD BYPASS THE BERMAN HEARING. THE ULTIMATE QUESTION IN THE
25 END, THOUGH, IS WHETHER YOU'RE SATISFIED WITH THAT AND THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 SERVICE THAT WOULD BE PROVIDED AT THE STATE AS OPPOSED TO AT
2 THE LOCAL LEVEL.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** FOR APPROXIMATELY \$1.5 MILLION
5 INVESTMENT WHICH COULD BE INVESTED IN EMANCIPATED YOUTH,
6 PUBLIC SAFETY AND PARKS AND RECREATION, INSTEAD OF ASKING FOR
7 A TAX ON PARKS, USING THESE FUNDS FOR THOSE TYPES OF PROGRAMS.
8 THE BOARD LETTER DESCRIBES THAT AN EFFECTIVE WAGE ENFORCEMENT
9 PROGRAM IS ALREADY BEING BASED ON PREVENTION, COMPLAINT
10 INVESTIGATION AND RECOVERY OF UNPAID WAGES. BASED ON THOSE
11 THREE OBJECTIVES, WHAT HAS BEEN THE SUCCESS RATE OF THE 10
12 CITIES THAT ALREADY HAVE A SIMILAR PROGRAM IN ACHIEVING THOSE
13 OBJECTIVES?

14

15 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** MOST OF THOSE CITIES ARE SUCCESSFUL IN
16 SETTLEMENTS. VERY FEW END UP GOING TO A CASE OR GOING TO
17 COURT. SO THE PROCESS THAT REALLY SEEMS TO WORK IS BRINGING
18 THE EMPLOYER AND THE EMPLOYEE TOGETHER AND WORKING OUT A
19 SETTLEMENT FOR THE UNPAID WAGES.

20

21 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** IN THE BOARD LETTER TO OUR BOARD, THE
22 DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS HAS THE CAPACITY TO PROVIDE
23 WAGE ENFORCEMENT SERVICES TO THE INCORPORATED AREAS. WOULD THE
24 CITIES BE BILLED FOR THE FULL COST OF THOSE SERVICES OR WOULD
25 THE COUNTY PAY FOR THAT FULL SERVICE TO CITIES?

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **BRIAN STIGER:** MR. MAYOR, WE DON'T HAVE THAT FLESHED OUT BUT
3 OUR UNDERSTANDING IS THAT WE WOULD CONTRACT WITH THESE
4 INCORPORATED CITIES FOR THE FULL COST OF ENFORCEMENT SERVICES.

5

6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** AND IF THE CITIES DIDN'T WANT TO PAY
7 FOR IT, WHO WOULD PAY FOR IT? THEY WOULD NOT BE OBLIGATED TO
8 PAY FOR IT?

9

10 **BRIAN STIGER:** IF THERE WASN'T A CONTRACT IN PLACE, THEN THAT
11 WOULD BE NON-JURISDICTIONAL TO THE COUNTY.

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THE BUDGET INCLUDES \$100,000 FOR A
14 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATION. WHAT WOULD BE THOSE DELIVERABLES
15 FOR THE C.B.O. CONTRACT AND WHAT EXAMPLES OF THESE C.B.O.S
16 WOULD PROVIDE THE TYPES OF SERVICES? WHAT WOULD THE TYPE OF
17 SERVICES WOULD THEY PROVIDE?

18

19 **BRIAN STIGER:** THE C.B.O.S WOULD BE PROVIDING OUTREACH INTO
20 DIVERSE COMMUNITIES. THEY WOULD BE HELPING US TO GAIN TRUST
21 WITH THESE COMMUNITIES. THEY WOULD ALSO SERVE AS A POINT OF
22 CONTACT FOR RECEIVING COMPLAINTS IN THE AREAS OF WAGE THEFT.
23 THOSE COMPLAINTS WOULD BE REFERRED TO US TO TAKE ACTION
24 AGAINST.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THE ENFORCEMENT PROCESS INCLUDES
2 ADMINISTRATIVE CITATIONS. WOULD THERE BE A CITATION EVEN IF
3 THE BUSINESS COMPLIES? HOW MUCH WOULD THAT CITATION FINE BE?
4 AND WOULD THE COUNTY HAVE THE CAPACITY TO PLACE A LIEN ON A
5 BUSINESS?

6

7 **BRIAN STIGER:** WELL AS FAR AS ENFORCEMENT PIECE GOES, WE WANT
8 TO MAKE SURE, FIRST OF ALL, THAT ALL OF THE BUSINESSES
9 UNDERSTAND THE RESPONSIBILITIES UNDER THE ORDINANCE. THERE MAY
10 BE MINOR VIOLATIONS OF THE ORDINANCE, FOR EXAMPLE, PERHAPS A
11 BUSINESS FAILED TO POST-- TO PUT A POSTER UP IN A CONSPICUOUS
12 PLACE. THAT MIGHT NOT RESULT IN A CITATION WITH A MONETARY
13 FINE. IT MIGHT BE A NOTICE OF VIOLATION. THINK OF IT AS A FIX
14 IT TICKET. SO AS WE FLESH OUT THESE VIOLATIONS, THE MONETARY
15 FINES WILL BE CONSISTENT WITH WHAT THOSE THOSE VIOLATIONS ARE.

16

17 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SO WOULD THE COUNTY HAVE THE CAPACITY
18 TO PLACE A LIEN ON A BUSINESS?

19

20 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** SUPERVISOR, THEY DO. THE COUNTY COULD GO TO
21 COURT AND OBTAIN A JUDGMENT AND PLACE A LIEN IF THAT IS THE
22 END RESULT. I MEAN OBVIOUSLY THERE WOULD NEED TO BE A LOT OF
23 DUE PROCESS AND HEARINGS AND THINGS THAT HAPPEN BEFORE THAT
24 POINT; BUT IN THE END, IF WE DON'T COLLECT, WE COULD GO TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 COURT AND GET A JUDGMENT AND THEN FOLLOW THE NORMAL LIEN
2 PROCESS.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** HOW IS THE INDEPENDENT HEARING
5 OFFICER, HOW ARE THEY SELECTED? IN CASES WHERE THE EMPLOYER
6 APPEALS THE COUNTY'S DETERMINATION, WHO PAYS FOR THAT HEARING
7 OFFICER? IS THAT COST ALREADY INCLUDED IN THAT \$1.5 MILLION
8 BUDGET?

9

10 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** IT IS NOT INCLUDED IN THAT.

11

12 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SO THAT WOULD BE ON TOP OF THAT?

13

14 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** RIGHT. AND ONE OF THE OPTIONS THAT'S
15 AVAILABLE TO THE COUNTY IN THE GOVERNMENT CODE IS THAT THERE
16 BE ESTABLISHED A COUNTY HEARING OFFICER. IF YOU FOLLOW THAT
17 PROCESS WHEN WE COME BACK WITH MORE INFORMATION ABOUT IT, THE
18 GOVERNMENT CODE REQUIRES THAT PERSON TO BE A LICENSED ATTORNEY
19 FOR AT LEAST FIVE YEARS BEFORE THEY'RE PUT IN THAT POSITION.
20 THAT SELECTION PROCESS COULD BE EITHER BY CONTRACT OR IT COULD
21 BE IN THE NORMAL HIRING PROCESS THE COUNTY WOULD FOLLOW.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THE STATE LAW AUTHORIZES THE
24 COMMISSIONER UPON REQUEST FROM LOCAL GOVERNMENT TO ENFORCE
25 THOSE LOCAL LAWS. WOULD THE COUNTY REQUEST THE STATE LABOR

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 COMMISSIONER TO ENFORCE MINIMUM WAGE COMPLIANCE SINCE THAT IS
2 ESSENTIALLY A STATE AND FEDERAL RESPONSIBILITY?

3

4 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** THE STATE RESPONSIBILITY IS FOR THE STATE
5 MINIMUM WAGE AND THE OTHER WAGE LAWS THAT THEY HAVE, LIKE
6 OVERTIME AND THOSE SORT OF LAWS, UNDER THE NEW A.B.970, THE
7 LABOR COMMISSIONER WOULD HAVE AUTHORITY, YOU'RE CORRECT, TO
8 ENFORCE LOCAL VIOLATIONS IF WE ASK THEM. IT IS DISCRETIONARY.
9 IT IS NOT A MANDATORY RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE STATE. THERE ARE
10 PROBABLY GOING TO BE SOME CASES THAT WE WOULD WANT TO PARTNER
11 WITH THE STATE IF THERE WERE LARGE CASES THAT HAVE A LOT OF
12 STATE VIOLATIONS, AS WELL. IT'S UNLIKELY THAT THEY WOULD
13 ASSUME RESPONSIBILITY FOR JUST VIOLATIONS OF THE LOCAL MINIMUM
14 WAGE. AND WE'RE INFORMED BY THIS LABOR COMMISSIONER, THEY HAVE
15 ABOUT 60 INVESTIGATORS STATEWIDE AND ABOUT 7 IN THE COUNTY.

16

17 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** ABOUT HALF OF THE CITIES WITH MINIMUM
18 WAGE ENFORCEMENT OFFICES, THEY GO THROUGH THEIR CITY ATTORNEY
19 TO USE SUBPOENA POWER. WHY DID YOU BYPASS COUNTY COUNSEL WITH
20 THAT AUTHORITY?

21

22 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** COUNTY COUNSEL DOESN'T HAVE INDEPENDENT
23 SUBPOENA POWER. BUT IN THE GOVERNMENT CODE, IF YOU ESTABLISH A
24 HEARING OFFICER PROCESS USING A COUNTY HEARING OFFICER, THEY
25 WOULD HAVE SUBPOENA POWER.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SO NOW YOU HAVE TO CREATE A NEW OFFICE
3 FOR SUBPOENA POWER.

4

5 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** OR THE OTHER ALTERNATIVE IS THAT YOUR BOARD
6 HAS SUBPOENA POWER.

7

8 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WELL, I AGREE THAT WAGE THEFT IS
9 IRRESPONSIBLE, SHOULD BE PUNISHED TO THE FULL EXTENT OF THE
10 LAW. WE ALREADY HAVE A STATE LAW IN PLACE. AND BECAUSE OF THE
11 PAST WITH THE STATE ALWAYS SHORTCHANGING US ON MANDATED
12 PROGRAMS WE ARE COMPLYING WITH, NOW WE'RE GOING TO BE CREATING
13 A PROGRAM THAT IS ALREADY BEING PAID FOR BY THE STATE BUT
14 TAKING 1.5 MILLION WHICH IS PROBABLY JUST THE STARTING POST
15 BECAUSE THERE ARE OTHER FACTORS THAT WILL BE ADDING TO THAT
16 COST. AND THAT'S MONEY COMING OUT OF THE GENERAL FUND THAT,
17 AGAIN, WITH EMANCIPATED YOUTH, THE FOSTER CHILDREN, PUBLIC
18 SAFETY, PARKS AND RECREATION AND OTHER VITAL SERVICES WITH THE
19 ARTS, IN MY OPINION, WOULD BE A BETTER INVESTMENT THAN TAKING
20 MONEY FROM THOSE PROGRAMS TO SUPPORT THIS PROGRAM. SUPERVISOR
21 KNABE.

22

23 **SUP. KNABE:** YEP. BRIAN, HOW MANY CALLS DO YOU GET RIGHT NOW AS
24 IT RELATES TO THESE KINDS OF VIOLATIONS IN THE UNINCORPORATED
25 AREA?

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **BRIAN STIGER:** OVER THE PAST SIX MONTHS OR SO, OUR CALLS HAVE
3 ESCALATED UP. ON AVERAGE WE PROBABLY GET ABOUT 30 TO 50 CALLS
4 A MONTH.

5

6 **SUP. KNABE:** ALL IN THE UNINCORPORATED? LIKE THE CALLS OUR
7 OFFICE GETS ARE NOT UNINCORPORATED BUT CITIES OF L.A. AND SOME
8 OTHER AREAS. DO YOU MONITOR THAT? DO YOU KEEP TRACK OF WHERE
9 THESE CALLS ARE COMING FROM? WHETHER IT'S COMING FROM
10 INCORPORATED CITY OR UNINCORPORATED AREA?

11

12 **BRIAN STIGER:** NOT AT THIS TIME, WE DON'T KEEP TRACK OF WHERE
13 THEY'RE COMING FROM. IN THIS PARTICULAR EXAMPLE, THOUGH, IF
14 SOMEONE CALLS, WE WILL GIVE THEM-- WE WANT TO FIND OUT EXACTLY
15 WHAT THE ISSUE IS, SO WE SPEND A LITTLE TIME ON THE PHONE WITH
16 THEM OR CORRESPONDENCE THROUGH EMAIL TO FIND OUT WHAT THAT
17 ISSUE IS.

18

19 **SUP. KNABE:** FIND OUT THE AREA? SINCE YOU'RE SPENDING TIME WITH
20 THEM, DO YOU LOOK AT THE AREA? WHETHER IT'S UNINCORPORATED
21 WHITTIER OR THE CITY OF WHITTIER OR UNINCORPORATED EAST L.A.?

22

23 **BRIAN STIGER:** NO, WE DON'T.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. KNABE:** WOULDN'T THAT BE A GOOD STARTING POINT TO SORT OF
2 SEE HOW YOU MIGHT STAFF UP?

3

4 **BRIAN STIGER:** WELL CERTAINLY GOING FORWARD, WE PLAN TO PUT
5 SOME-- A NUMBER OF METRICS IN PLACE TO MAKE SURE WE ARE ABLE
6 TO CAPTURE THE WORKLOAD.

7

8 **SUP. KNABE:** AND I GUESS, TO COUNTY COUNSEL. FIRST OF ALL, I'VE
9 NEVER SEEN SUCH A RESTRICTIVE MOTION COME BEFORE THIS BOARD IN
10 THE ACTIONS THAT ARE VERY HEAVILY ARTICULATED, OBVIOUSLY
11 WRITTEN BY OUTSIDE COUNSEL OR SOMETHING. WHAT AREAS INSIDE OF
12 THIS ARE DUPLICATE OF MOST STATE AND FEDERAL EFFORTS AND THE
13 LAWS THAT ALREADY EXIST, SIMILAR TO WHAT MIKE HAD ASKED?

14

15 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** SO THE LAWS-- OUR MINIMUM WAGE ORDINANCE IS
16 NOT IN CONFLICT WITH THE STATE OR FEDERAL LAW.

17

18 **SUP. KNABE:** I'M TALKING MORE IN TERMS OF THE WAGE THEFT, WHICH
19 IS A VERY EGREGIOUS VIOLATION.

20

21 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** SO THE STATE AND THE FEDERAL LAW WOULD FOLLOW
22 THINGS LIKE THE FEDERAL MINIMUM WAGE. THE STATE WOULD GOVERN
23 THE STATE MINIMUM WAGE. OBVIOUSLY AN INDIVIDUAL WHO'S NOT
24 GETTING PAID THE COUNTY MINIMUM WAGE, WHICH IS MUCH HIGHER
25 THAN THE FEDERAL, IS GOING TO COME TO THE COUNTY AS OPPOSED TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 GOING TO THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT WHERE THE MINIMUM WAGE IS ONLY
2 \$7.25. SO THERE IS A LITTLE BIT OF AN OVERLAP AND IT DEPENDS
3 ON WHO HAS THE MOST RESTRICTIVE LAW. THERE ARE OTHER AREAS
4 THAT THE COUNTY IS NOT REGULATING. WE DON'T HAVE-- OUR LAW IS
5 ONLY A MINIMUM WAGE ORDINANCE, SO WE DON'T HAVE A LAW ON
6 DISCRIMINATION AND OTHER THINGS LIKE THAT, OVERTIME AND THOSE
7 RESTRICTIONS. THEY WOULD GO TO THE STATE FOR THAT AND THAT
8 WOULD BE THE STATE OR THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT'S JURISDICTION.

9

10 **SUP. KNABE:** SO IN THIS NEW STRUCTURE, IT WOULDN'T INCLUDE THE
11 OVERTIME VIOLATIONS OR THE UNDER-THE-TABLE VIOLATIONS?
12 STRICTLY MINIMUM WAGE?

13

14 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** MINIMUM WAGE EXCEPT THAT I WOULD SAY THAT
15 UNDER-THE-TABLE PAYMENTS RELATE TO MINIMUM WAGE. IF YOU HAVE
16 SOMEONE THAT'S PAYING SOMEONE \$5 CASH AN HOUR TO AVOID THE
17 MINIMUM WAGE, THERE IS A RELATIONSHIP TO THE MINIMUM WAGE WITH
18 UNDER-THE-TABLE PAYMENTS.

19

20 **SUP. KNABE:** WHAT ABOUT NO BREAKS? NOTIFICATION, THOSE KINDS OF
21 THINGS?

22

23 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** THAT'S NOT NECESSARILY CONTEMPLATED BY THIS
24 ORDINANCE. BUT OBVIOUSLY WE'LL HAVE TO LOOK AT IT AND FIND A
25 TIE TO WHETHER IT IMPACTS -- MINIMUM WAGE.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. KNABE:** SO WOULD IT NOT BE BETTER FOR BRIAN TO OPEN UP
3 PART OF HIS OFFICE AND HAVE THE DEPARTMENT OF LABOR, BOTH THE
4 STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT SHARE AN OFFICE INSIDE THERE AND
5 DO THESE KINDS OF THINGS, INSTEAD OF CREATING OUR OWN
6 DEPARTMENT OF LABOR? I KNOW YOU'RE SHAKING YOUR HEAD. BUT
7 THAT'S THE QUESTION. EXACTLY. AND SO YOU'RE ASKING FOR STATE
8 AND FEDERAL VIOLATIONS TO BE CONSIDERED HERE BUT YET YOU ARE
9 ARTICULATING THAT THAT MAY NOT FALL INTO THAT. SO I'M JUST
10 SAYING, TO GO AFTER THESE FOLKS IN THE RIGHT WAY, WOULDN'T IT
11 BE BETTER TO HAVE THE FEDERAL FOLKS AND THE STATE FOLKS INSIDE
12 OUR OFFICES TO WHERE THEY COULD GO DIRECTLY INSTEAD OF YOU
13 SAY, "LOOK AT THIS. WELL, MAYBE YOU SHOULD CONTACT SO-AND-SO?"

14

15 **BRIAN STIGER:** SUPERVISOR, IN OUR HISTORY OF ENFORCING CONSUMER
16 PROTECTION LAWS, WE CERTAINLY REALIZE THAT IT TAKES A NUMBER
17 OF AGENCIES WORKING TOGETHER TO REALLY PROTECT CONSUMERS. AND
18 WE SEE THE SAME THING IN WAGE ENFORCEMENT. THE LABOR
19 COMMISSIONER, QUITE FRANKLY, JUST DOES NOT HAVE THE RESOURCES
20 TO SERVE THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES IN A MANNER THAT PEOPLE
21 HAVE BEEN SORT OF USED TO. SO IN YOUR PARTICULAR EXAMPLE, IF
22 THROUGH OUR INVESTIGATION, IF WE FOUND THERE WERE ISSUES OF
23 PEOPLE NOT BEING PAID OVERTIME OR NOT GETTING THEIR BREAKS, WE
24 WOULD REFER THAT PIECE TO THE LABOR COMMISSIONER. BUT WE WOULD
25 PROBABLY DO THE GROUNDWORK FIRST.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. KNABE:** SO IF WE PICK UP SOME OF THE EFFORTS OF THE STATE
3 OF CALIFORNIA, WOULD WE BE BILLING THEM FOR THOSE SERVICES,
4 THEN?

5

6 **BRIAN STIGER:** WE WOULD NOT BE BILLING THE STATE

7

8 **SUP. KNABE:** WELL, I MEAN, IF WE'RE GOING TO DO THEIR JOB,
9 SHOULDN'T WE BE PAID FOR IT? LIKE WE DO WITH PUBLIC HEALTH?

10

11 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** I WOULD JUST ADD THAT OVER THE LAST SEVERAL
12 YEARS, THE ENFORCEMENT BODIES FOR THE LABOR COMMISSIONER AS
13 WELL AS THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT KEPT UP TO PACE WITH
14 THE KINDS OF VIOLATIONS. AND IF YOU WERE TO GO INTO THEIR
15 OFFICES AND ASK THEM WHAT THAT BACK LOAD IS, YOU WILL FIND A
16 LARGE NUMBER OF CASES THAT ARE NOT EVEN LOOKED AT. AND AS
17 FORMER SECRETARY OF LABOR, I CAN TELL YOU THAT WAS ONE OF OUR
18 BIGGEST COMPLAINTS, THAT THERE WASN'T ENOUGH STAFF ON THE
19 GROUND TO CARRY OUT THE KIND OF ENFORCEMENT. SO IT HAD TO BE
20 VERY TARGETED. AND THEY WENT AFTER CERTAIN INDUSTRIES WHERE
21 THEY KNOW THERE ARE VIOLATIONS. AND ACCORDING TO THE
22 INFORMATION THAT COUNTY COUNSEL THAT YOU ALL PUT TOGETHER, YOU
23 CAN SEE WHERE THERE MAY BE A TENDENCY. BUT THE REAL ISSUE HERE
24 IS ABOUT GIVING INFORMATION, EMPOWERING THESE BUSINESSES SO
25 THEY DO THE RIGHT THING. AND MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE MAKING

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AVAILABLE ALL THE RESOURCES THAT WE HAVE AT HAND TO MAKE SURE
2 THAT THEY UNDERSTAND WHAT THEIR ROLE, THEIR RESPONSIBILITY, BY
3 LAW IS. AND THEN, SECONDLY, HOPEFULLY IF THERE IS A WAY TO GET
4 SOME OF THAT FUNDING BACK INTO THE POCKETS OF THE PEOPLE THAT
5 ARE OUT THERE WORKING AND NOT BEING PAID A DECENT WAGE, THAT
6 MONEY WILL COME TO THE COUNTY. IT WILL GO TO THE FEDERAL
7 GOVERNMENT AND IT WILL GO TO THE STATE. SO I DON'T SEE IT
8 BEING THAT SOMEHOW WE'RE GOING TO SHORTCHANGE PEOPLE FROM
9 GETTING MENTAL HEALTH SERVICES, EDUCATION SERVICES, BECAUSE IF
10 PEOPLE ARE MAKING \$15 AN HOUR, THEY ARE GOING TO BE PAYING FOR
11 MORE GROCERIES, THEY ARE GOING TO BE PAYING TO GO TO WORK,
12 THEY ARE GOING TO BE PAYING TO DO A LOT OF THINGS. THAT MONEY
13 WILL COME BACK TO US. SO I DON'T SEE THAT IT'S AN END-ALL HERE
14 OR A NEGATIVE. THAT'S MY PERSONAL OPINION. BUT THAT'S WHAT-- I
15 UNDERSTAND.

16

17 **SUP. KNABE:** I UNDERSTAND. I'M NOT INDICATING THAT--
18 [APPLAUSE.] I SHOULD HAVE A RIGHT TO ASK THE QUESTIONS. MY
19 POINT BEING IS, EXACTLY TO WHAT SUPERVISOR SOLIS INDICATED, IS
20 IF WE ARE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO DO ALL INCLUSIVE, WE'RE
21 BASICALLY CONTRIBUTING TO THE BACKLOG. THE BACKLOG'S GOING GET
22 BIGGER AND FASTER BECAUSE WE'RE DOING ALL THE GROUNDWORK.
23 WOULD IT NOT BE BETTER TO HAVE THOSE FOLKS IN-HOUSE? THAT'S MY
24 POINT. YOU ARE JUST GOING TO CONTRIBUTE TO THE BACKLOG.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** I THINK YOU'RE WRONG. I THINK YOU'RE WRONG.
2 WHEN YOU SET AN EXAMPLE THAT THIS IS NOT HOW YOU CONDUCT YOUR
3 BUSINESS AND HERE ARE SOME PARAMETERS AND THE COUNTY IS GOING
4 TO TAKE UP THAT ROLE, IT SENDS A SIGNAL TO OTHER INDIVIDUALS
5 THAT ARE UNDERMINING WHAT COMPETITION SHOULD BE. AND THAT IS
6 FAIR PLAY. AND EVERYONE'S PLAYING BY THE SAME SET OF RUSE.
7 UNFORTUNATELY, THEY DON'T. AND THAT'S WHY WE HAVE THIS
8 PROBLEM. SO THAT'S WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO GET TO, IS TO MAKE
9 CLEAR THOSE STAND-UP BUSINESSES, THEY ARE DOING THE RIGHT
10 THING, GREAT. WE WANT TO EMULATE THAT. BUT WE WANT THE FOLKS
11 THAT ARE NOT PLAYING BY THE RULES AND TAKING ADVANTAGE OF
12 WORKERS AND NOT PAYING WHAT PEOPLE ARE DUE, THAT'S WRONG. AND
13 I THINK WE HAVE AN OBLIGATION TO SET THOSE KIND OF EXAMPLES.
14 IT DOESN'T MEAN YOU CAST A BIG NET. IT MEANS YOU DO IT IN A
15 VERY METHODICAL, STRATEGIC MANNER.

16

17 **SUP. KNABE:** IT ALSO DOESN'T MEAN THAT WHEN YOU QUESTION THIS,
18 TO MAKE IT THE MOST EFFECTIVE WAY POSSIBLE, THAT YOU ARE NOT
19 IN SUPPORT OF WAGE THEFT ENFORCEMENT.

20

21 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** I'M NOT SAYING THAT.

22

23 **SUP. KNABE:** WELL, YOU SORT OF DID AND I TAKE OFFENSE TO THAT
24 BECAUSE I'M JUST ASKING THE QUESTION. ARE YOU NOT CONTRIBUTING
25 TO THE BACKLOG? SHE'S ABSOLUTELY CORRECT, THAT'S PART OF THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 PROBLEM HERE IS THE BACKLOG THAT'S BEING CREATED BY THE STATE
2 AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENTS. WE ARE GOING TO PICK UP THAT PIECE.
3 BUT AT OUR COST, AND THAT'S WHAT I'M TRYING TO SAY. NOT ANY
4 COMMENT ON WAGE ENFORCEMENT OR WHATEVER.

5

6 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** BUT I THINK THAT IF WE MOVE FORWARD WE WILL
7 BE CAPTURING THAT INCOME THAT SHOULD RIGHTFULLY BE COMING IN
8 BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE NOW PAYING TAXES AT A SET RATE THAT THEY
9 SHOULD BE, ANYWAY. WE'LL BE ABLE TO BRING IN SOME OF THAT
10 REVENUE, AND AGAIN I'VE SEEN THAT HAPPEN IN OTHER PLACES
11 AROUND THE COUNTRY. THAT'S ALL I'M SAYING.

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS?

14

15 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MR. MAYOR AND
16 COLLEAGUES. I APPRECIATE THE DISCUSSION. I JUST WANT TO MAKE A
17 COUPLE OF OBSERVATIONS, THE FIRST OF WHICH IS THAT THIS IS
18 OBVIOUSLY NOT A PRIORITY FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, THAT
19 WHICH IS TO BE CHARACTERIZED BY ENFORCEMENT IS ANEMIC AT BEST.
20 AND TO THE EXTENT THAT WE RECOGNIZE THAT THIS IS A PROBLEM OF
21 CONSEQUENCE, WE SHOULD DO WHAT WE KNOW WE OUGHT TO DO IN THE
22 INTEREST OF PROTECTING AND SECURING THE RIGHTS OF THESE
23 WORKING MEN AND WOMEN WHO CAN EVIDENCE THE FACT THAT THEY HAVE
24 BEEN ESSENTIALLY RIPPED OFF. NOW WE DON'T MAKE A WHOLESALE
25 CONDEMNATION OF BUSINESS PRACTICE. WE UNDERSTAND THAT THE VAST

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 MAJORITY OF BUSINESSES DO THE RIGHT THING. IT'S FOR THOSE WHO
2 DON'T, AND UNFORTUNATELY, THERE ARE TOO MANY. THIS IS WHAT I
3 WOULD CALL AN UNDERREPORTED VIOLATION OF LAW. THERE'S ONLY ONE
4 ADDITIONAL EXAMPLE OF UNDERREPORTED VIOLATION OF LAW THAT I
5 CAN THINK OF AND THAT IS THE ISSUE OF SEXUAL ASSAULT. WITH
6 RESPECT TO WAGE THEFT, ALL TOO MANY PEOPLE ARE INTIMIDATED OR
7 DON'T KNOW HOW TO ENGAGE THE SYSTEM IN ORDER TO GET WHAT THEY
8 ARE RIGHTLY DUE. THEREFORE, IT DOES FALL UPON GOVERNMENT. THAT
9 IS THE ROLE OF GOVERNMENT, I BELIEVE, TO ASSIST IN WHATEVER
10 WAYS POSSIBLE TO CAUSE IT TO BE MADE RIGHT. IT'S PRACTICALLY,
11 IN MY VIEW, UNCONSCIONABLE THAT SOMEONE WOULD PUT IN A HARD
12 DAY'S WORK FOR AN HONEST DAY'S PAY AND AT THE END OF THAT BE
13 TOLD, "SEE YOU, I WOULDN'T WANT TO BE YOU." I THINK ON THE
14 POINT OF DATA, I THINK WE HAVE TO RIGOROUSLY COLLECT THE DATA,
15 HAVE A PROFILE ON WHICH INDUSTRIES ARE MOST OFTEN IDENTIFIED
16 AS VIOLATING OUR ORDINANCES AT THE STATE AND LOCAL LEVELS, I
17 THINK WE NEED TO HAVE A SENSE OF THE GEOGRAPHY IN WHICH THERE
18 IS A PREPONDERANCE. I THINK FULL DEMOGRAPHIC, ETHNOGRAPHIC,
19 ALL OF THAT NEEDS TO BE IN PLACE SO THAT WE HAVE A CLEAR
20 PROFILE OF WHAT WE ARE DEALING WITH FOR MORE EFFECTIVE
21 ENFORCEMENT. NOW, IN PART ENFORCEMENT CAN BE ASSUAGED BY
22 EDUCATION. SO IF WE HAVE A SENSE OF WHO'S DOING IT AND WHAT
23 INDUSTRIES ARE DOING IT, WE GO THERE AND SAY, "LOOK, WE KNOW
24 THERE'S SOME PROBLEMS HERE, BUT BEFORE YOU VIOLATE THE LAW,
25 LET ME TELL YOU WHAT YOU SHOULDN'T DO." THAT'S THE REASON FOR

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HAVING GOOD DATA. I DO TAKE THE POINT THAT THE MOTION IS
2 PRESCRIPTIVE, BUT LET ME JUST SAY WHO THE CULPRITS ARE. THEY
3 ARE THE LAWYERS AND IN THE FIRST DISTRICT, THE LAWYERS IN THE
4 SECOND DISTRICT AND THE LAWYERS IN COUNTY COUNSEL. THEY ARE
5 THOSE WHO HAVE A PROPENSITY FOR PRESCRIPTION. AND TO THE
6 EXTENT THAT THAT IS THE CASE, I SALUTE THEM BECAUSE THERE IS A
7 LEVEL OF SPECIFICITY THAT IS REQUIRED. SHALL I CALL THEM BY
8 NAME? IT IS A GOOD THING. AND IT SEEMS TO ME THE COMPETENCE IN
9 THIS REGARD MATTERS. I THINK WHEN WE MAKE SUCH EFFORTS, WE
10 SEND THE RIGHT MESSAGE. WE SEND THE RIGHT MESSAGE THAT WE WANT
11 EMPLOYEES TO COMPLY WITH THE LAW AND WE WANT EMPLOYERS TO
12 COMPLY WITH THE LAW. WE DON'T WANT ANYBODY RIPPING ANYBODY
13 ELSE OFF. AND THIS IS A PRUDENT, APPROPRIATE AND CLEARLY
14 NECESSARY STEP IN THE INTEREST OF INCOME DISPARITIES BEING
15 ASSUAGED AGAINST A BACKDROP OF AN EVER-GROWING CLASS OF
16 IMPOVERISHED PEOPLE. PART OF THE QUESTION THAT I'M INTERESTED
17 IN TERMS OF THE DATA IS WHAT THE INCOME STRATA HAPPENS TO BE
18 FOR THOSE WHO ARE MOST LIKELY TO BE RIPPED OFF. THIS, I
19 BELIEVE, WILL BE VERY REVEALING. MR. MAYOR AND COLLEAGUES, I
20 THINK SUPERVISOR SOLIS IS TO BE COMPLIMENTED FOR HER
21 INITIATION OF THIS EFFORT. I'M PLEASED TO CO-AUTHOR IT AND I
22 URGE UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE SAME.

23
24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR SHEILA KUEHL?

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR. IT'S INTERESTING TO
2 ME WHEN WE TALK ABOUT ORDINANCES BECAUSE THIS IS THE FIRST
3 BODY I EVER SAT ON WHERE THE LAW WAS CALLED THE ORDINANCE. YET
4 IT IS THE LAW. SO IT SEEMS TO ME IT IS A MAXIM OF GOVERNMENT
5 OR IT'S SUPPOSED TO BE THAT GOVERNMENT DOES NOT ENGAGE IN A
6 FUTILE ACTION. THAT IS, EVERYTHING IT DOES IS MEANT TO BE
7 ACTIONABLE OR ENFORCEABLE OR USED. THIS ORDINANCE FOR MINIMUM
8 WAGE, IN ADDITION TO OTHER ORDINANCES THAT WE'VE ADOPTED TO
9 PROTECT THE WORKERS IN L.A. COUNTY, IS THE LAW. AND WHEN WE
10 LOOK AT WITH RESPECT, AND I MEAN THIS, AT THE BUDGET, THE
11 MONEY WE PUT INTO THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT, FOR INSTANCE,
12 ENFORCING THE LAW, IT'S A BILLION AND A HALF DOLLARS A YEAR
13 JUST OF COUNTY MONEY PLUS STATE AND FEDERAL. SO THAT IS HOW
14 SERIOUSLY WE TAKE ENFORCEMENT OF THE LAW, OR AS WE SOMETIMES
15 CALL IT LAW ENFORCEMENT. THIS IS THE SAME THING. I DID HAVE A
16 QUESTION. I'M VERY GRATEFUL TO SUPERVISOR SOLIS AND SUPERVISOR
17 THOMAS FOR TAKING THIS NEXT STEP BECAUSE IT'S FINE FOR US TO
18 PARTICIPATE IN PASSING A MINIMUM WAGE ORDINANCE AND THEN THE
19 QUESTION IS, SO WHAT? WHAT IF I DO NOTHING ABOUT IT? AND I
20 THANK YOU SO MUCH, SUPERVISOR SOLIS, FOR TAKING A LOOK AT THIS
21 BUSINESS LICENSE QUESTION, BECAUSE I WANTED TO ASK COUNSEL IN
22 THE PRESENTATION THAT YOU MADE ABOUT REGULATORY TOOLS, YOU
23 INDICATED THAT WE ONLY LICENSE ABOUT A THIRD OF THE BUSINESSES
24 OR A LITTLE BIT LESS DEPENDING UPON HOW WE IDENTIFY THE
25 BUSINESSES IN THE UNINCORPORATED AREAS. AND YOU SAID GENERALLY

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE BUSINESS LICENSES THAT WE USE INVOLVE A HEALTH OR A SAFETY
2 COMPONENT. THEN THERE WAS A PARAGRAPH UNDER THAT IN YOUR
3 PRESENTATION SAYING WE MAY AMEND THE ORDINANCE TO LICENSE OR
4 REGISTER ALL BUSINESSES. SO THERE'S NO REQUIREMENT THAT IT
5 ONLY RELATE TO HEALTH OR SAFETY. THAT IS IF YOU'RE A BUSINESS
6 IN THE COUNTY, WE COULD, THOUGH WE HAVE NOT CHOSEN TO, REQUIRE
7 THAT YOU HAVE A LICENSE IN ORDER TO OPERATE IN THE COUNTY.

8

9 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** THAT'S CORRECT, SUPERVISOR. THE HEALTH AND
10 SAFETY COMPONENT SEEMS TO BE THE HISTORY THAT WE'VE FOLLOWED.
11 IT COMES FROM MANY YEARS AGO PRIOR TO THE 1950S, IT LOOKED
12 LIKE THE ORDINANCES WERE PATCHWORKS OF RESTRICTIONS DEPENDING
13 ON THE CIRCUMSTANCES AT THE TIME, LIKE THEY RELATED TO
14 CIRCUSES AND BILLIARDS AND VARIOUS THINGS LIKE THAT AND THEY
15 WERE PIECEMEALS OF BUSINESS LICENSING THAT WAS THEN CONDENSED
16 INTO ONE BUSINESS LICENSE ORDINANCE BUT IT DOESN'T INCLUDE
17 LICENSING OR REGISTRATION OF ALL BUSINESSES.

18

19 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** THERE IS A LIMITATION ON THE FEE THE COUNTY
20 CAN CHARGE, HOWEVER, FOR A BUSINESS LICENSE. IT'S REALLY
21 LIMITED TO WHAT IT COSTS US TO PROVIDE IT AND MAINTAIN IT.

22

23 **JUDY WHITEHURST:** YES.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** SO GENERALLY THE LICENSE COST IS MINIMAL.

2 BUT I SUPPOSE IF YOU MULTIPLY IT BY 20,000, IT COULD HELP.

3

4 **JOSEPH KELLY:** SUPERVISOR, GOOD MORNING. JOE KELLY, TREASURER
5 TAX COLLECTOR. UNDER THE ORDINANCE, TITLE 7, I AM THE ENFORCER
6 OF THE BUSINESS LICENSE ORDINANCE. FEES VARY BASED UPON, IN
7 GENERAL, BASED ON THE DEPARTMENTS THAT REVIEW THE APPLICATION.

8 SO IF IT IS A-- AND THE AMOUNT OF STAFF TIME INVOLVED IN THAT
9 REVIEW. SO IF IT IS AN APPLICATION FOR AN EATING

10 ESTABLISHMENT, REGIONAL PLANNING NEEDS TO LOOK AT IT FROM A
11 LAND USE PERSPECTIVE, PUBLIC HEALTH, FIRE. SO WE DID A
12 CALCULATION LAST NIGHT EXPECTING THIS QUESTION. THE WEIGHTED
13 AVERAGE COST IS \$475.

14

15 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** SO A RESTAURANT THAT'S GETTING A LICENSE
16 NOW, BECAUSE WE DO LICENSE RESTAURANTS IN THE COUNTY, WOULD BE
17 ABOUT \$475.

18

19 **JOSEPH KELLY:** WELL, I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S SPECIFIC TO
20 RESTAURANTS, BUT THE WEIGHTED AVERAGE FOR ALL.

21

22 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** NO, I UNDERSTAND, AND THERE'S NOTHING IN
23 THE MOTION THAT SAYS WE'RE GOING TO DO THIS. SIMPLY A REQUEST
24 TO UNDERSTAND WHAT OUR COMPONENT CITIES ARE DOING BECAUSE I
25 THINK THEY PROBABLY TAKE A LOT OF DISPARATE LOOKS AT WHAT THEY

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 LICENSE. BUT IT OCCURRED TO US THAT IT'S SORT OF A TOOL,
2 POTENTIALLY, TO AT LEAST IDENTIFY WHETHER PEOPLE ARE
3 COMPORTING WITH THE LAW. SO THANK YOU FOR THAT ADDITION AND
4 FOR CLARIFYING, COUNSEL, IN YOUR PRESENTATION ABOUT THAT. I
5 STRONGLY SUPPORT THE ACTION THAT WE'RE GOING TO TAKE TODAY.

6

7 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** THANK YOU. I DO WANT TO, MR. MAYOR, MODIFY
8 MY AMENDMENT. AND THIS IS BASED ON JUST CLARIFYING TECHNICAL
9 LANGUAGE. SO IT SAYS "REVISED ITEM 4." . AND IT'S DIRECTIVE
10 NUMBER 2? ITEM NUMBER 2. IT'S ITEM 4 REVISED. NUMBER 2.
11 "DIRECT THE C.E.O. TO DESIGNATE THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AND
12 BUSINESS AFFAIRS AS THE ENTITY RESPONSIBLE FOR ENFORCEMENT OF
13 THE MINIMUM WAGE ORDINANCE. IMMEDIATELY BEGIN IMPLEMENTATION
14 OF THE WAGE ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM AS PROPOSED IN ATTACHMENT 1 OF
15 THE C.E.O. REPORT DATED NOVEMBER 10, 2015. IDENTIFY EXISTING
16 FUNDS WITHIN THE BUDGET TO ALLOCATE TO SUPPORT THE 2015-2016
17 PROGRAM STAFFING OF THE FIVE POSITIONS ESTIMATED AT \$408,000
18 AND DIRECT C.E.O. TO ALLOCATE THESE FUNDS IN TWO WEEKS FOR THE
19 FOLLOWING POSITIONS, A. ONE CHIEF, B3, CONSUMER AFFAIRS
20 REPRESENTATIVE III, AND C, ONE PUBLIC INFORMATION OFFICER.

21

22 **SUP. KNABE:** THE C.E.O., ANY COMMENTS? I WAS GOING TO ASK ON
23 THE ALLOCATION WITHIN A COUPLE WEEKS, ANY COMMENT ON THAT?

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **C.E.O. SACHI HAMAI:** THE FUNDING WILL BE COMING FROM BUDGETARY
2 UNCERTAINTIES AT THIS POINT IN TIME.

3

4 **SUP. KNABE:** BUDGETARY UNCERTAINTIES.

5

6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** LIST OF SPEAKERS, WE'LL GIVE EACH TWO
7 MINUTES, EACH. FIRST WE ARE GOING TO CALL UP DUSTAN BATTON,
8 BLANCA ARMENTA. MARIA GALVAN. ALSO I NEED A TRANSLATOR. AND
9 DANIEL LINARES.

10

11 **DUSTAN BATTON:** GOOD MORNING. I'M DUSTAN BATTON, SPEAKING ON
12 BEHALF OF TRACEY RAFTER, BIZFED'S FOUNDING C.E.O. AND OUR
13 MASSIVE DIVERSE GRASSROOTS ALLIANCE REPRESENTING 278,000
14 EMPLOYERS WITH 3 MILLION EMPLOYEES THROUGHOUT L.A. COUNTY.
15 THIS MEETING CONFLICTS WITH OUR MONTHLY BOARD MEETING, BUT
16 TRACEY WISHED SHE COULD BE HERE TO THANK SUPERVISOR SOLIS AND
17 HER STAFF FOR THE WORK ON THE IMPORTANT ISSUE AND ESPECIALLY
18 TO BEING OPEN TO IDEAS AND FEEDBACK FROM ALL STAKEHOLDERS. WE
19 PARTICULARLY APPRECIATE THE DIRECTIVE IN THE WAGE ENFORCEMENT
20 MOTION TO ENGAGE STAKEHOLDERS IN AN ONGOING WAY AS THIS
21 PROGRAM ULTIMATELY GETS IMPLEMENTED TO ENSURE EMPLOYERS AND
22 EMPLOYEES HAVE A CONTINUED VOICE IN THIS PROCESS. WE FEEL
23 STRONGLY, AS WE KNOW YOU DO, THAT WAGE THEFT IS A SERIOUS
24 CRIME. THAT SAID, BY THE COUNTY'S OWN NUMBERS, 99 PERCENT OF
25 EMPLOYERS ARE GOOD ACTORS WHO WANT TO FOLLOW THE RULES.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THEREFORE WE HOPE TODAY'S MOTION WILL RESULT IN A STRONG AND
2 FAIR ORDINANCE THAT PROTECTS BOTH EMPLOYEES AND EMPLOYERS WHO
3 ARE TRYING TO DO THE RIGHT THING. TO THAT END WE OFFER A
4 COUPLE SUGGESTIONS. FIRST WE URGE YOU TO DEVOTE THE NECESSARY
5 RESOURCES TO OUTREACH AND EDUCATION NOT ONLY OF EMPLOYEES BUT
6 ESPECIALLY OF EMPLOYERS, PARTICULARLY VERY SMALL EMPLOYERS,
7 INCLUDING THE MANY THOUSANDS WHO DON'T PRIMARILY SPEAK
8 ENGLISH, SO THEY KNOW AND UNDERSTAND THE RULES THEY NEED TO
9 FOLLOW. SECONDLY, PLEASE PROACTIVELY SUPPORT THE ABILITY OF
10 EMPLOYERS TO COMPLY BY ALLOWING THEM TO EASILY CLARIFY RULES
11 BY PHONE. AGAIN, THIS WILL ENSURE WORKERS GET THEIR PROPER
12 WAGES BY HELPING THE 99 PERCENT OF EMPLOYERS TRYING TO FOLLOW
13 THE RULES TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THEY MUST DO TO COMPLY. THE STATE
14 DEPARTMENT OF LABOR STANDARDS ENFORCEMENT DOES THIS ALREADY.
15 AND IT'S A MODEL WORTH EMULATING. THIRD WE STRONGLY URGE TO
16 ENSURE THE EMPLOYERS HAVE A FAIR OPPORTUNITY TO REMEDY ANY
17 ISSUES BEFORE PUNITIVE ACTION IS TAKEN. AGAIN, BY THE COUNTY'S
18 OWN NUMBERS, 99 PERCENT OF EMPLOYERS ARE GOOD ACTORS WHO WANT
19 TO COMPLY. BUT PEOPLE MAKE MISTAKES. SO THIS PROGRAM SHOULD
20 ENABLE EMPLOYERS TO CORRECT MISTAKES AND TAKE CARE OF THEIR
21 WORKERS WHILE SETTING PUNITIVE MEASURES FOR THAT TINY FRACTION
22 OF BAD ACTORS COMMITTING TRUE WAGE THEFT. AGAIN, ON BEHALF OF
23 BIZFED'S FOUNDING C.E.O., TRACEY RAFTER, AND THE HUNDREDS OF
24 THOUSANDS OF EMPLOYERS OUR MEMBERS REPRESENT, THANK YOU FOR
25 WORKING TO STRIKE THE RIGHT BALANCE TO PROTECT BOTH THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 EMPLOYEES AND EMPLOYERS WHO ARE BUILDING A VIBRANT ECONOMY
2 THROUGHOUT L.A. COUNTY. THANK YOU.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** YANIN SENACHAI. YES, MA'AM.

5

6 **BLANCA ARMENTA:** [THROUGH INTERPRETER] GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS
7 BLANCA ARMENTA. I'M A MEMBER OF C.H.I.R.L.A. I COME FROM THE
8 CITY OF PALMDALE. I LIVE THERE WITH MY FAMILY. FOR ME, IT IS
9 OF GREAT IMPORTANCE TO BE HERE IN FRONT OF THE BOARD OF
10 SUPERVISORS OF THE COUNTY OF L.A. TO GIVE MY TESTIMONY. I WAS
11 CONTRACTED ONE DAY BY A LADY TO CLEAN HER HOUSE. AFTER ONE
12 WEEK WHEN I CHARGED HER, THEY ONLY PAID ME \$65. THAT IS NOT
13 WHAT I HAD EARNED. I WORKED FOR FIVE DAYS FOR EIGHT HOURS A
14 DAY AT MINIMUM WAGE. I DID NOT TAKE THE SALARY BECAUSE IT WAS
15 A THEFT. IT IS VERY IMPORTANT FOR THE COUNTY OF L.A. TO PASS
16 NEW PROVISIONS SO THEY CAN HELP US RECOUP OUR SALARIES IN A
17 FASTER AND MORE EFFECTIVE WAY. TO SEND A CLEAR MESSAGE TO THE
18 BOSS THAT IN THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES, IT WON'T BE POSSIBLE
19 TO STEAL WAGES OF A WORKER OR PAY LESS THAN THE MINIMUM WAGE
20 THAT IS ESTABLISHED IN CALIFORNIA. PASSING THIS ORDINANCE WILL
21 HELP ME PROVIDE A BETTER FUTURE FOR MY FAMILY. THIS WILL
22 ENSURE THAT I WILL RECEIVE A FAIR PAYMENT FOR MY WORK. AND IF
23 I DO NOT GET PAID, THERE WILL BE A LAW THAT MAKE SURE I GET MY
24 SALARY. THE EMPLOYERS WILL HAVE TO FOLLOW THE LAW AND WON'T BE
25 ABLE TO STEAL THE WAGES OF PEOPLE WHO WORK HARD LIKE MYSELF,

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 VIOLATING THE HUMAN RIGHTS AND LABOR RIGHTS. HERE WE ARE TO
2 SUPPORT THE NEW INITIATIVE TO IMPLEMENT NEW PROVISIONS FOR
3 THAT TO GIVE JUSTICE TO THE WORKERS THAT ARE VICTIMS OF WAGE
4 THEFT. THANK YOU AND GOOD MORNING.

5

6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** LET ME ASK ONE QUESTION. DID SHE GO TO
7 THE STATE OFFICE FOR THE BERMAN HEARING PROCESS PROCEDURE?

8

9 **INTERPRETER:** NO. SHE DID NOT GO TO ANY STATE OFFICE.

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WAS SHE AWARE THAT THEY HAVE AN OFFICE
12 THAT WOULD MONITOR THIS?

13

14 **INTERPRETER:** NO, SHE WAS NOT AWARE THERE WAS AN OFFICE THAT
15 DOES THAT.

16

17 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY, LET HER KNOW THERE IS A STATE
18 OFFICE THAT DOES THAT.

19

20 **BLANCA ARMANDO:** THANK YOU.

21

22 **MARIA GALVAN:** [THROUGH INTERPRETER] GOOD MORNING, MY NAME IS
23 MARIA GALVAN AND I AM A MEMBER OF C.H.I.R.L.A. I WORKED FOR
24 NINE YEARS IN A FACTORY. I WAS A WAGE THEFT VICTIM. THERE WAS
25 NO LUNCH BREAKS AND OVERTIME WAS NOT PAID LIKE IT SHOULD HAVE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 BEEN. I HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO BECOME INDEPENDENT AFTER I WAS
2 LAID OFF, AND NOW WE HAVE A BUSINESS, A FAMILY BUSINESS. I
3 MAKE SURE THAT MY WORKERS HAVE A FAIR SALARY AND THAT THEIR
4 OVERTIME GETS PAID. THAT'S WHY I'M IN SUPPORT OF THIS
5 ORDINANCE SO WAGE THEFT CAN STOP. AFTER HAVING MY OWN BUSINESS
6 FOR FIVE YEARS, I STILL HEAR THE SAME STORIES OF WAGE THEFT.
7 THAT'S WHY IT'S IMPORTANT THAT THIS ORDINANCE GETS PASSED, BUT
8 IT IS ALSO IMPORTANT THAT A LAW GETS IMPLEMENTED THAT
9 EMPLOYERS THAT DO NOT PAY FAIR, THEY ARE... I WANT TO THANK
10 THE REPRESENTATIVES THAT MAKE SURE THAT EMPLOYEES HAVE FAIR
11 WAGES.

12

13 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** CAN YOU TELL US WHAT IS YOUR BUSINESS IS?

14

15 **INTERPRETER:** CARPENTRY.

16

17 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** WHERE IS YOUR BUSINESS LOCATED?

18

19 **MARIA GALVAN:** IN SAN FERNANDO, IN THE CITY.

20

21 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, SENORA.

22

23 **MARIA GALVAN:** GRACIAS.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** LET ME CALL UP ALEX DAVIS. JOHN
2 HOWLAND. JESSICA DUBOFF. YES, SIR. YOU NEED A TRANSLATOR?
3 YOU'RE NEXT.

4
5 **DANIEL LINARES:** GOOD MORNING, SUPERVISORS. MY NAME IS DANIEL
6 LINARES. I'M A MISCLASSIFIED DRIVER FOR PACIFIC KNIGHT
7 TRANSPORTATION. I DRIVE FOR [INAUDIBLE] BIG RETAILERS LIKE
8 COSTCO FROM THE PORTS OF LOS ANGELES AND LONG BEACH TO
9 WAREHOUSES AND RAIL YARDS ACROSS SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA. PAC.
10 KNIGHT IS ONE OF THE LARGEST PORT TRUCKING COMPANIES THAT
11 OPERATES ACROSS LOS ANGELES COUNTY. MISCLASSIFICATION RESULTS
12 IN ME OFTEN BEING PAID LESS THAN THE STATE OR POTENTIALLY
13 COUNTY MINIMUM WAGE, SOMETHING WE THINK THE COUNTY SHOULD BE
14 ABLE TO ENFORCE. MISCLASSIFICATION IS A PROBLEM ACROSS THE
15 PORT TRUCKING INDUSTRY. THERE ARE 10,000 OF US WHO DRIVE EVERY
16 DAY AND OVER 800 OF US ARE MISS CLASSIFIED. THE COUNTY HAS
17 ALREADY COMMITTED RESOURCES TO EDUCATE BUSINESSES AND DRIVERS
18 OF MISCLASSIFICATION. WITH THE POWERS TO INVESTIGATE
19 MISCLASSIFICATION WHERE IT OCCURS, IMPORTS, TRUCKING, BUT ALSO
20 IN OTHER SECTORS. BECAUSE OF THE MASSIVE WAGE THEFT, WE ASK
21 THAT THE COUNTY BE PREPARED TO INVESTIGATE VIOLATIONS OF
22 COMPANIES WHERE THE MINIMUM WAGE IS BEING VIOLATED BECAUSE WE
23 ARE MISCLASSIFIED AS INDEPENDENT CONTRACTORS. THIS SUMMER,
24 OVER 30 OF US TESTIFIED ABOUT THIS PROBLEM, THAT THE FACT THAT
25 MISCLASSIFICATION IS WAGE THEFT, THAT THE INDUSTRY IS USING

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THIS LANGUAGE TO AVOID PAYING US THE WAGES THEY OWE US. WE
2 EXPECT THAT PAC. KNIGHT OWES BETWEEN \$6 AND \$8 MILLION. THIS
3 IS TYPICAL OF THE CLAIMS AGAINST MANY COMPANIES AT THE PORT.
4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **YANIN SENACHAI:** GOOD MORNING, MY NAME IS YANIN SENACHAI AND
7 I'M A WORKERS' RIGHTS ATTORNEY AT ASIAN AMERICANS ADVANCING
8 JUSTICE LOS ANGELES. I'VE BEEN A WORKERS' RIGHTS ATTORNEY AT
9 THIS ORGANIZATION FOR THREE YEARS. WE ARE THE NATION'S LARGEST
10 AND OLDEST ORGANIZATION SERVING ASIAN MARKETS, NATIVE
11 HAWAIIAN, PACIFIC ISLANDERS. I WANT TO ADDRESS THIS OF WHETHER
12 OR NOT AN OFFICE OF ENFORCEMENT WITHIN THE COUNTY DUPLICATES
13 THE WORK OF THE STATE LABOR COMMISSIONER OR THE U.S.
14 DEPARTMENT OF LABOR. EVEN THOUGH ALL THESE AGENCIES HAD
15 PRIORITIZED WAGE THEFT, I'VE SEEN TIME AND TIME AGAIN THAT
16 THEIR RESOURCES ARE NOT ENOUGH TO ADDRESS AND DEAL WITH EVERY
17 INSTANCE OF WAGE THEFT. WE'VE HAD MANY CASES. SO MOST OF MY
18 CLIENTS WORK IN THE THAI RESTAURANT INDUSTRY. THE WORKERS HAVE
19 RECORDED THERE'S 100 PERCENT NONCOMPLIANCE IN LOS ANGELES. AND
20 IN A LOT OF CASES, FOR VARIOUS REASONS, THE D.O.L. HAS NOT
21 BEEN ABLE TO PROCEED WITH INVESTIGATIONS OF CERTAIN
22 RESTAURANTS. AND SO THESE WORKERS END UP GOING TO THE D.O.S.C.
23 BUT WHAT ENDS UP HAPPENING IS BECAUSE OF THE BACKLOG THERE,
24 THE PROCESS IS DELAYED FOR ABOUT A YEAR OR TWO YEARS. IN MORE
25 THAN A COUPLE OF INSTANCES, BY THE TIME WE'VE HAVE BEEN ABLE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TO REACH A HEARING, THE BUSINESSES HAVE FOLDED, THE DEFENDANT
2 HAS LEFT THE STATE AND OUR WORKERS WERE UNABLE TO RECOVER
3 THEIR WAGES. SO THERE IS ADDITIONAL RESOURCES FOR ENFORCING
4 OUR WAGE LAWS WILL REDUCE THE BACKLOG. THAT MAKES THE MOST
5 SENSE TO ME. WE NEED THEM AT THE LOCAL LEVEL, WE NEED THEM AT
6 THE STATE LEVEL, AND CERTAINLY AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL. BUT THE
7 LOCAL LEVEL IS BEST BECAUSE THEY ARE MORE CLOSELY CONNECTED TO
8 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS THAT UNDERSTAND THE NEEDS OF OUR
9 VULNERABLE WORKERS. SO WHAT DOES WAGE LEFT LOOK LIKE? I
10 REPRESENT THE RESTAURANT AND BAKERY WORKERS WHO HAVE TO GET TO
11 THE BAKERY AT 3 IN THE MORNING. THEY WORK FOR 10 TO 12 HOURS.
12 THEY MAKE BASICALLY \$3 AN HOUR AND THAT HAS NOT BEEN THE
13 MINIMUM WAGE IN ALMOST 35 YEARS. SO I URGE YOU TO SUPPORT
14 STRONG ENFORCEMENT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

15

16 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** ALSO, MAEGAN ORTIZ. YES, SIR.

17

18 **ALEX DAVIS:** GOOD AFTERNOON, MEMBERS OF THE BOARD. MY NAME IS
19 ALEX DAVIS AND I'M A LEGISLATIVE AFFAIRS MANAGER AT THE VALLEY
20 INDUSTRY AND COMMERCE ASSOCIATION, V.I.C.A. SINCE THIS BOARD
21 BEGAN LOOKING AT SUCCESSFUL WAYS TO END WAGE THEFT, THE
22 BUSINESS COMMUNITY HAS STEPPED UP TO SAY THAT WAGE THEFT HAS
23 NO PLACE IN LOS ANGELES. AS WITH ANY POLICY THOUGH, IT IS
24 IMPORTANT TO GET IT RIGHT THE FIRST TIME. ENGAGE THE
25 STAKEHOLDERS AND MAKE SURE NO QUESTION GOES UNANSWERED. AS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THIS MOTION MOVES FORWARD, WE ASK THAT YOU RE-ENGAGE
2 CONVERSATION TO FINALIZE DETAILS. CONSIDER THE LOCAL BAKERY
3 LOOKING TO CORRECT AN HONEST MISTAKE OR THE LOCAL THRIFT SHOP
4 FACING UNCERTAINTY AS IT SETTLES COSTLY LAWSUITS AND FINES.
5 EDUCATION AND OUTREACH TO BUSINESSES WILL HELP COMMUNITIES
6 STOP WAGE THEFT. CREATING AN ADVISORY BOARD THAT ENGAGES
7 BUSINESSES WILL HELP ENSURE THAT THIS BOARD'S INTENDED GOALS
8 ARE FULLY MET. WE NEED A COMPREHENSIVE PLAN TO STOP WAGE THEFT
9 AND HOPE THAT THIS BOARD WILL TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO DO JUST
10 THAT. THANK YOU.

11

12 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP ELISSA
13 BARRETT AND ERIC PREVEN. YES, SIR.

14

15 **JOHN HOWLAND:** GOOD AFTERNOON, I'M JOHN HOWLAND WITH THE
16 CENTRAL CITY ASSOCIATION. C.C.A. SUPPORTS ENFORCING WAGE THEFT
17 LAWS AND HOLDING ACCOUNTABLE THOSE PEOPLE AND BUSINESSES AND
18 PEOPLE WHO STEAL FROM THEIR EMPLOYEES. WAGE THEFT IS A CRIME
19 AND C.C.A. ENCOURAGES THE COUNTY TO ENFORCE WAGE THEFT LAWS.
20 WE THANK THE BOARD AND THE COUNTY FOR WORKING WITH US AND
21 OTHER REPRESENTATIVES OF THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY ON THIS
22 PROPOSAL AND TAKING OUR CONCERNS INTO CONSIDERATION. WE NEED
23 TO MAKE SURE THAT THE PEOPLE AND THE COMPANIES WHO ABIDE BY
24 THE NEW LAWS ARE NOT UNWITTINGLY PUNISHED AND OR FORCED TO
25 DEAL WITH NEW, UNWIELDY REGULATIONS. AGAIN, COMPANIES AND

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 INDIVIDUALS WHO DELIBERATELY BREAK THE LAW AND STEAL FROM
2 THEIR EMPLOYEES SHOULD BE PUNISHED BUT EMPLOYERS WHO MAKE
3 LEGITIMATE MISTAKES SHOULD NOT BEAR THE BRUNT OF PUNITIVE LAW
4 AIMED AT EGREGIOUS ACTIONS. OUTREACH AND EDUCATION TO
5 BUSINESSES, ESPECIALLY SMALL BUSINESSES, TO INFORM THEM OF THE
6 NEW LAWS AND TO HELP THEM COMPLY ARE CRUCIAL. LET'S CREATE A
7 SYSTEM THAT PROTECTS EMPLOYEES AND EMPLOYERS WHO ARE TRYING TO
8 DO THE RIGHT THING. THE INITIAL REPORTS POINT IN THIS
9 DIRECTION AND IT'S A PROMISING START. THANK YOU.

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. ANDY BALDENEGRO, VICTOR
12 NARRO. YES, MA'AM.

13

14 **JESSICA DUBOFF:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS JESSICA DUBOFF. I'M
15 VICE PRESIDENT OF PUBLIC POLICY OF THE L.A. CHAMBER. GARY
16 TOBEN WAS UNABLE TO BE HERE THIS AFTERNOON SO HE SENT A LETTER
17 THAT HE WANTED ME TO READ ON HIS BEHALF. "DEAR MAYOR
18 ANTONOVICH AND MEMBERS OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, MEMBERS OF
19 THE L.A. AREA CHAMBER OF COMMERCE ARE OPPOSED TO WAGE THEFT
20 FOR THE SAME REASONS AS ARTICULATED IN THIS MOTION BY
21 SUPERVISOR SOLIS AND RIDLEY-THOMAS, AND WE SUPPORT THE
22 ATTENTION TO THIS ISSUE. BECAUSE SO MANY OF THE BUSINESSES IN
23 L.A. COUNTY ARE SMALL, WE ARE ESPECIALLY SUPPORTIVE OF EFFORTS
24 TO FOCUS ON EDUCATION AND COMPLIANCE BEFORE YOU MOVE TO
25 PUNITIVE MEASURES. THIS WILL EMPOWER BUSINESSES TO PROACTIVELY

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 COMPLY WITH EXISTING LAW AND THIS NEW ORDINANCE. WE BELIEVE
2 PARAGRAPH 7 AND 8, WHICH CALL FOR BUSINESS INPUT IN THE
3 CRAFTING OF THE FINAL ORDINANCE AND EXTENSIVE PUBLIC OUTREACH
4 AND EDUCATION, ARE VERY IMPORTANT. BECAUSE BUSINESSES ARE
5 REGULATED BY STATE AND FEDERAL LAWS, AS WELL, IT IS IMPORTANT
6 THAT WE NOT CREATE LABOR LAW UNCERTAINTY OR SITUATIONS WHERE
7 BUSINESSES ARE REQUIRED TO INVEST IN LARGE AMOUNTS OF
8 DUPLICATIVE RECORDKEEPING AND FILING OF INFORMATION. IT WOULD
9 BE OUR PLEASURE TO ASSIST YOU IN PROVIDING THIS INPUT. THANK
10 YOU AGAIN FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP. WE HAVE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING
11 WITH YOU TO CRAFT AN ORDINANCE THAT ADDRESSES THE PROBLEM OF
12 WAGE THEFT IN A WAY IN WHICH THE HONEST AND HARD WORKING
13 BUSINESSES IN L.A. COUNTY BECOME YOUR PARTNERS. THANK YOU."

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
16 SCARLETT DE LEON AND CARLOS ALCALA. YES.

17

18 **ELISSA BARRETT:** HELLO, MY NAME IS ELISSA BARRETT. I'M VICE
19 PRESIDENT AND GENERAL COUNSEL OF BET TZEDEK LEGAL SERVICES. WE
20 SERVE MORE THAN 20,000 PEOPLE IN L.A. COUNTY EVERY YEAR. THAT
21 INCLUDES 300 AND MORE D.L.S.E. BERMAN HEARINGS CONDUCTED ON
22 BEHALF OF LOW-WAGE WORKERS EVERY YEAR THROUGH OUR EMPLOYMENT
23 RIGHTS PROJECT. WE SEE ROUTINELY A ONE TO THREE YEAR PERIOD
24 FROM COMPLAINT TO COLLECTION FROM D.L.S.E. THIS IS BECAUSE OF
25 THE LACK OF RESOURCES. THE EMPLOYERS THAT WE'RE DEALING ARE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 PEOPLE WHO ARE OPERATING OUTSIDE OF THE LAW AND OUTSIDE OF THE
2 BOUNDARIES OF COMMON DECENCY. TALK ABOUT ONE WORKER WHO WORKED
3 14 HOURS A DAY IN THE KITCHEN. IN ORDER TO GET THE MOST OUT OF
4 HER, SHE WAS GIVEN A BUCKET SO THAT SHE DID NOT LEAVE THE
5 KITCHEN TO GO TO THE BATHROOM. THESE ARE OFTEN CONDITIONS THAT
6 ARE INDISTINGUISHABLE FROM HUMAN TRAFFICKING CASES. WHAT IS
7 GOING TO BE MOST EFFECTIVE IN ADDRESSING THESE EGREGIOUS,
8 UNLAWFUL BUSINESS PRACTICES IS THE LOCAL ENFORCEMENT MODEL
9 WITH FUNDING FOR C.B.O. PARTNERSHIP. IN SAN FRANCISCO THEY
10 INVEST \$482,000 A YEAR IN C.B.O.S TO DO OUTREACH AND
11 COMPLAINTS TO THE COMMUNITY. IN THE LAST YEAR THE CHINESE
12 PROGRESSIVE ASSOCIATION WORKED WITH LOCAL ENFORCEMENT ON A
13 CASE THAT BROUGHT IN \$4 MILLION BACK TO THE LOCAL ECONOMY IN
14 BACK WAGES. IN 2013-2014, FISCAL YEAR FOR THE CITY OF SAN
15 FRANCISCO, THE COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATION OUTREACH EXCEEDED
16 THE RECOVERY OF BACK WAGES THAT CAME IN THROUGH INDIVIDUAL
17 COMPLAINTS. WHAT WE SEE THROUGH THIS MODEL ARE SUCCESSFUL
18 RESULTS IN FOUR AREAS. ONE, LEVELING THE PLAYING FIELD FOR
19 LEGITIMATE BUSINESSES. TWO, TARGETING THE WORST OFFENDERS.
20 THOSE OF US WHO ARE WORKING WITH THESE LOW-WAGE WORKERS WERE
21 CLOSEST TO THE GROUND. WE CAN SEE WHO IS DOING THIS CONDUCT
22 AND WHERE THEY'RE MOVING THEIR BUSINESSES. FOR INSTANCE THE
23 GARMENT INDUSTRY IS MOVING DOWN TO VERNON OUTSIDE OF DOWNTOWN
24 L.A. THREE, SHIFT THE COST OF DOING BUSINESS FOR FOLKS TO
25 REALIZE THAT BREAKING THE LAW ISN'T JUST PART OF RUNNING A

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 BUSINESS. AND, FOUR, RETURN DOLLARS TO THE LOCAL ECONOMY.
2 SUPERVISOR SOLIS MENTIONED SMALL BUSINESSES. LOCAL PEOPLE
3 SPEND LOCAL MONEY WITH LOCAL BUSINESSES. LET'S RETURN THOSE
4 DOLLARS TO OUR COMMUNITIES.

5

6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** LET ME ALSO CALL UP KEN TIRATIRA. YES,
7 SIR.

8

9 **VICTOR NARRO:** GOOD MORNING. GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS VICTOR
10 NARRO. I AM A PROJECT DIRECTOR WITH THE U.C.L.A. LABOR CENTER.
11 IN LOS ANGELES COUNTY, THE RATE OF WAGE THEFT IS 20 PERCENT
12 HIGHER THAN THE NATIONAL AVERAGE. A SURVEY THAT WE PRODUCED IN
13 2010 DEMONSTRATES THAT IN ANY GIVEN WORK WEEK IN LOS ANGELES 8
14 OUT OF 10 LOW-WAGE WORKERS SUFFER WAGE THEFT. THAT'S A NUMBER
15 OF 655,000 WORKERS SUFFER WAGE THEFT EVERY WEEK. 80 PERCENT OF
16 THESE WORKERS WHO WORK OVERTIME ARE NOT PROPERLY COMPENSATED.
17 ANOTHER 80 PERCENT OF THESE WORKERS ARE DENIED THEIR RIGHT TO
18 MEAL AND REST BREAKS. ALL THIS AMOUNTS TO \$26.2 MILLION PER
19 WEEK THAT ARE STOLEN FROM WORKERS IN WAGE THEFT VIOLATION
20 WHICH IS ESTIMATED AT \$1.4 BILLION PER YEAR. WE HAVE ALSO DONE
21 RESEARCH INTO THE HEALTH CONSEQUENCES OF WAGE THEFT. WE HAVE
22 PLENTY OF EVIDENCE THAT DEMONSTRATES THE HARM TO WORKERS'
23 EMOTIONAL AND PHYSICAL WELL-BEING. IN PARTICULAR WAGE THEFT
24 INTRODUCES OR AGGRAVATES STRESS RELATED CONDITIONS SUCH AS
25 DIABETES, HYPERTENSION, ANXIETY AND DEPRESSION. IN ADDITION TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE NEGATIVE IMPACT THAT THE WAGE THEFT CRISIS HAS ON BUSINESS
2 OWNERS AND EMPLOYERS THAT DO PLAY BY THE RULES AND COMPLY WITH
3 LABOR STANDARDS, EVERY YEAR WE ESTIMATE THE WAGE THEFT ROBS
4 THE STATE AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT OF BETWEEN 103 AND \$153 MILLION
5 IN LOST TAX REVENUES, \$11.7 TO \$25.5 MILLION OF WHICH IS LOST
6 TO THE CITY AND COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES. ACROSS THE COUNTRY,
7 ESPECIALLY IN CALIFORNIA, CITIES ARE PASSING THEIR OWN MINIMUM
8 WAGE LAWS. BUT EVERY CITY FROM SAN FRANCISCO TO THE SMALL
9 CITIES LIKE SANTA CLARA, MOUNTAIN VIEW, HAVE THEIR MINIMUM
10 WAGE LAWS CONNECTED WITH A WAGE THEFT ENFORCEMENT POLICY. WE
11 RECOMMEND THAT THE OFFICE OF LABOR STANDARDS ENFORCEMENT IN
12 THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER BUSINESS AFFAIRS TO REALLY ENGAGE
13 IN A POLICY THAT WILL CREATE PARTNERSHIPS WITH BUSINESSES AND
14 COMMUNITY GROUPS TO ENFORCE THE MINIMUM WAGE LAWS. THANK YOU.

15

16 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
17 DEREK JOHNSON. YES, MA'AM.

18

19 **SCARLETT DE LEON:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS SCARLETT DE LEON
20 AND I'M AN ADVOCATE AT K.I.W.A., KOREATOWN IMMIGRANT WORKERS
21 ALLIANCE. AS WE KNOW L.A. COUNTY IS THE WAGE THEFT CAPITAL OF
22 THE NATION AND THEREFORE WE NEED A REGIONAL SOLUTION. WE NEED
23 TO MAKE THE NEW MINIMUM WAGE A REALITY. AND ENFORCEMENT MUST
24 MATCH THE SCALE OF THE PROBLEM. PART OF THE SOLUTION IS TO
25 INCLUDE COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS. COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS SUCH

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AS K.I.W.A. HAVE THE EXPERIENCE AND THE TRUST OF THE
2 COMMUNITY. K.I.W.A. HAS BEEN FILING WAGE CLAIMS FOR OVER 23
3 YEARS . WE GUIDE THEM, SUPPORT THEM THROUGH WHAT IS OFTEN AN
4 OVERWHELMING AND LENGTHY PROCESS. HOWEVER, AFTER WORKERS WIN
5 THEIR JUDGMENT, THEY DO NOT SEE A DIME. DUE TO LACK OF TOOLS
6 TO ENFORCE, 83 PERCENT OF WORKERS WHO WIN THEIR WAGE THEFT
7 CASES NEVER SEE A DIME. BY THE TIME THEY RECEIVE A JUDGMENT,
8 BUSINESSES HAVE CHANGED THEIR NAMES, FILED FOR BANKRUPTCY OR
9 TRANSFERRED THEIR ASSETS. WE NEED A LOCAL SOLUTION. LET'S WORK
10 TOGETHER AND PUT THE MONEY THAT BELONGS TO THE WORKERS IN
11 THEIR POCKETS. THANK YOU.

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP FRANCO
14 RAIMONDO. YES, SIR.

15

16 **CARLOS ALCALA:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS CARLOS LUIS ALCALA
17 GONZALEZ AND I'M A MEMBER OF R.O.C. I'VE BEEN WORKING IN
18 KITCHENS FOR SEVEN YEARS MAKING TACOS AND WASHING DISHES. AND
19 DURING THESE SEVEN YEARS, I NEVER EXPERIENCED WAGE THEFT UNTIL
20 MY LAST JOB AT A WELL- KNOWN RESTAURANT CALLED OVERLAND CAFE.
21 THIS IS MY STORY. IN ORDER TO SAVE MONEY, MY FORMER EMPLOYER
22 MADE ME WORK UNDER EXTREME PRESSURE. I HAD TO WORK NOT ONLY AS
23 DISHWASHER BUT ALSO PREP COOK AND COOK AS WELL AS LOADING AND
24 UNLOADING MERCHANDISE AT THIS RESTAURANT. FOR A YEAR AND A
25 HALF, I WAS NOT PAID FOR OVERTIME, MISSED BREAKS OR MY FIRST

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 12 DAYS OF WORK. I WORKED 10 HOURS A DAY 6 DAYS A WEEK.
2 EVENTUALLY I WAS INJURED AT WORK DUE TO EXTREME STRESS AND
3 SPECIFICALLY A FALL ON MY BACK. I WANT THE SUPERVISORS TO PASS
4 A LAW SO THAT WHAT HAPPENED TO ME DOESN'T HAPPEN TO OTHERS.
5 THANK YOU FOR LISTENING.

6

7 **KEN TIRATIRA:** GOOD MORNING MR. MAYOR, SUPERVISORS. MY NAME IS
8 KEN TIRATIRA AND I'M HERE ON BEHALF OF EMPLOYERS GROUP, AND WE
9 REPRESENT OVER 2,000 EMPLOYERS ACROSS CALIFORNIA AND 500 HERE
10 IN LOS ANGELES COUNTY ALONE. WE KNOW FULL WELL THE CHALLENGES
11 OF TRYING TO COMPLY WITH THE MYRIAD WAGE LAWS AND COMPLIANCE
12 LAWS. CERTAINLY WAGE AND HOUR AND MISCLASSIFICATION AREAS ARE
13 THE LARGEST AREAS OF MISTAKES AND NONCOMPLIANCE THAT WE SEE
14 WITH THE EMPLOYERS THAT WE REPRESENT. WE ENCOURAGE STRICT AND
15 RIGID ENFORCEMENT EFFORTS AS PROPOSED HERE, AND WE'RE
16 CERTAINLY IN SUPPORT OF THOSE TYPES OF INITIATIVES. WE WOULD
17 JUST WEIGH IN ON BEHALF OF BIZFED AND V.I.C.A., CENTRAL CITY
18 ASSOCIATION AS WELL AS THE L.A. CHAMBER AND THE COMMENTS THEY
19 HAVE MADE, A PROACTIVE OUTREACH TO BUSINESS, TO EDUCATE
20 BUSINESSES THAT DON'T UNDERSTAND WHAT THEIR REQUIREMENTS ARE,
21 THAT DON'T UNDERSTAND THE CHALLENGES WITH MISCLASSIFICATION OF
22 WORKERS. IT REALLY IS IMPORTANT TO NIP THIS ON THE FRONT END
23 TO ENSURE THAT BUSINESSES CAN COMPLY AND ARE GIVEN THE TOOLS
24 TO COMPLY AS SUCCESSFULLY AS POSSIBLE. THANK YOU.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP JESSICA
2 DURRUM, PATRICIA SALAZAR, WE'LL NEED A TRANSLATOR. AND ROSA
3 LOPEZ, AND WE WILL NEED A TRANSLATOR ON THAT. YES, SIR.

4

5 **FRANCO RAIMONDO:** GOOD MORNING, SIR. MY NAME IS FRANCO
6 RAIMONDO. I AM A DAY LABORER FOR PASADENA JOB CENTER WHO IS
7 PART OF THE [INAUDIBLE]. I WAS REQUESTED TO DO A JOB FOR AN
8 INDIVIDUAL WHO CAME BY REQUESTING A WORKER. I WENT WITH HIM.
9 HE PAID ME THAT DAY, DID OKAY. CAME BACK THREE DAYS LATER. HE
10 REQUESTED ME AGAIN WITH A COUPLE MORE FRIENDS OR COLLEAGUES,
11 AND WE WENT TO DO A JOB FOR THREE DAYS. HE SAID HE WITH PAY US
12 AFTER THREE DAYS. ON THE THIRD DAY, HE DID NOT SHOW UP. AND WE
13 GOT A LITTLE EXCITED BECAUSE WE HADN'T BEEN PAID. AND ALL OF A
14 SUDDEN HE STARTED SAYING, "OH, I HAD A LITTLE PROBLEM. I
15 CANNOT FIND A TOOL BUT WE'LL PAY YOU THE HOURS THAT YOU'VE
16 BEEN WAITING FOR US." HE NEVER SHOWED UP. THEN HE SHOWED UP
17 VERY LATE. THEN HE SAID WELL DO YOU KNOW WHAT? HE STARTED TO
18 OFFEND US. AND WE DIDN'T TAKE THE BAIT. WE TOOK IT EASY.
19 EVENTUALLY THE PASADENA JOB CENTER INTERFERED OR INTERVENED
20 AND THEY MANAGED AFTER THREE WEEKS TO LET US GET THE MONEY. WE
21 DIDN'T GET ALL BUT WE GOT SOME OF IT. THE PROBLEM IS THIS:
22 THIS IS IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE STRONG PROTECTION FOR THESE DAY
23 LABORERS BECAUSE THERE ARE WORKERS THAT RECOVERED WAGES. IT'S
24 NOT FAIR THAT WE HAVE TO BE ABUSED IN SUCH A WAY. THERE SHOULD
25 BE WELL FUNDED CONTRACTS WITH THE COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION SO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THAT WE CAN GO TO THEM AND SAY, "HEY, LOOK THIS PERSON IS
2 TAKING ADVANTAGE OF US." THAT'S ALL I HAVE TO SAY.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
5 YES, MA'AM.

6

7 **JESSICA DURRUM:** HI, GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS JESSICA DURRUM.
8 I'M A RESEARCH AND POLICY ANALYST WITH L.A.A.N.E., THE LOS
9 ANGELES ALLIANCE FOR A NEW ECONOMY. AND FOR THE PAST DECADE
10 L.A.A.N.E. HAS BEEN STUDYING THE ISSUE OF MISCLASSIFICATION IN
11 THE PORT TRUCKING INDUSTRY. AND AS WAS MENTIONED PREVIOUSLY,
12 THERE ARE ABOUT 10,000 PORT TRUCK DRIVERS SERVING THE PORTS OF
13 LOS ANGELES AND LONG BEACH AND THAT 80 PERCENT OF THEM ARE
14 MISCLASSIFIED AS INDEPENDENT CONTRACTORS. AND I MYSELF HAVE
15 WORKED CLOSELY WITH MR. LINARES WHO PREVIOUSLY SPOKE AND OTHER
16 PORT TRUCK DRIVERS WHO ARE STANDING UP TO FIGHT
17 MISCLASSIFICATION AND TO EXERCISE THEIR RIGHTS AS EMPLOYEES.
18 SO I JUST WANTED TO BRING OUT A LITTLE MORE CONTEXT AS TO THE
19 ISSUE OF MISCLASSIFICATION AND ITS RELATION TO WAGE THEFT. WE
20 ARE ALSO SEEING MISCLASSIFICATION OF OTHER SECTORS BEYOND PORT
21 TRUCKING, SUCH AS DELIVERY WORK DRIVERS, WAREHOUSE WORKERS,
22 JANITORIAL SERVICES, UBER. ALL OF THESE SITUATIONS, WORKERS
23 ARE TOLD THAT THEY'RE NOT EMPLOYEES, BUT THEY'RE TREATED AS
24 EMPLOYEES IN THEIR DAY-TO-DAY WORK. THEY'RE TOLD THAT THE
25 MINIMUM WAGE DOES NOT APPLY TO THEM AND THAT OTHER BASIC

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 EMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ARE NOT AVAILABLE TO THEM. SO LEGALLY, THE
2 COUNTY SHOULD BE PREPARED TO INVESTIGATE SITUATIONS WHERE
3 WORKERS BELIEVE THAT THEY ARE UNFAIRLY DEPRIVED OF THESE
4 RIGHTS AND OF THE COUNTY MINIMUM WAGE. AND THE CITIES OF LONG
5 BEACH AND LOS ANGELES ARE CURRENTLY ESTABLISHING OR LIKELY TO
6 ESTABLISH PROCESSES TO ADDRESS MINIMUM WAGE VIOLATIONS THAT
7 ARE ROOTED IN MISCLASSIFICATION AND YES IF THE COUNTY RETAINS
8 SUCH POWERS AS WELL BECAUSE MISCLASSIFICATION IS A VEHICLE BY
9 WHICH MANY EMPLOYERS ENGAGE IN MILLIONS OF DOLLARS OF WAGE
10 THEFT. AND THE NEGATIVE PAYCHECKS THAT MR. LINARES SUBMITTED
11 AS AN EXHIBIT PREVIOUSLY ARE A CLEAR DEMONSTRATION OF THAT.
12 THAT WAS JUST ONE SAMPLE FROM ONE WORKER FROM ONE YEAR. I'VE
13 SEEN DOZENS UPON DOZENS OF ACTUAL PAYCHECKS WHERE THE WORKER
14 OWES THE EMPLOYER AT THE END OF THE WEEK. AND THERE ARE MANY
15 MORE CASES OF MINIMUM WAGE VIOLATIONS IN THIS SECTOR. SO WE
16 THANK YOU FOR DESIGNATING RESOURCES TO TAKE ON THIS
17 CLASSIFICATION, AND WE ASK THAT, MOVING FORWARD, THE COUNTY'S
18 WAGE ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM CONTINUE TO TAKE ON MISCLASSIFICATION
19 AS A PART OF ITS ONGOING EFFORTS TO ADDRESS WAGE THEFT
20 ENFORCEMENT.

21
22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP NORMA
23 TORRES. JORGE MARTINEZ. YES, MA'AM.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **ROSA LOPEZ:** [THROUGH INTERPRETER] GOOD AFTERNOON, SUPERVISORS.
2 MY NAME IS ROSA LOPEZ. I'M A WORKER, MOTHER AND A LEADER AT
3 K.I.W.A. FIRST OF ALL I'D LIKE TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR
4 LEADERSHIP IN TAKING SUCH IMPORTANT STEPS IN PROTECTING
5 WORKERS IN YOUR COUNTY. I, LIKE MANY WORKERS IN LOS ANGELES
6 AND OTHER CITIES, I HAVE BEEN THE VICTIM OF A CRIME, WAGE
7 THEFT. I WORKED FOR CHI DYNASTY IN THE CITY OF SUDER CITY FOR
8 THREE YEARS. WE WERE PAID LATE, WE WERE PAID WITH CHECKS
9 WITHOUT ANY FUNDS. WE WEREN'T ALLOWED TO TAKE ANY TYPE OF
10 BREAK OR PAID OVERTIME. WHEN WE WOULD ASK FOR OUR PAY, WE WERE
11 THREATENED. I HAD NO CHOICE BUT TO OPEN A CASE IN THE
12 DEPARTMENT OF LABOR. DURING THAT PROCESS, WITH MY TWO OTHER
13 COWORKERS, WE WERE FIRED. TWO MONTHS LATER, THE RESTAURANT
14 CLOSED THEIR DOORS. ALL I HAVE LEFT IS THE JUDGMENT. I HAVE
15 THIS JUDGMENT THAT I'M UNABLE TO COLLECT. YET CHI DYNASTY
16 STILL HAS TWO OTHER RESTAURANTS OPEN. ONE IN LOS FELIZ AND ONE
17 IN GLENDALE, CALIFORNIA. THANKS TO K.I.W.A., I WAS ABLE TO
18 FILE MY CASE. BUT WE NEED PROVISIONS THAT ARE ABLE TO TACKLE
19 THE MAGNITUDE OF THIS PROBLEM. THANK YOU.

20

21 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **JORGE MARTINEZ:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS JORGE MARTINEZ. I'M
24 HERE TO ASK THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS TO PLEASE IMPLEMENT
25 STRONG PROVISIONS, STRONG LEGAL PROVISIONS TO APPLY THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 MINIMUM WAGE LAW. WE NEED A REGIONAL SOLUTION. WE NEED A
2 REGIONAL SOLUTION OF WAGE THEFT BECAUSE THE COUNTY OF LOS
3 ANGELES IS THE CAPITAL OF WAGE THEFT IN ALL OF THE COUNTRY. AT
4 THIS MOMENT, MYSELF AND MY COWORKERS, WE ARE PART OF A WAGE
5 THEFT CASE AGAINST MY EMPLOYER INSUPER. HOPEFULLY WITH THE
6 HELP OF THESE PROVISIONS, LEGAL PROVISIONS, HOPEFULLY THE
7 EMPLOYERS CAN STOP STEALING FROM POCKETS OF THEIR EMPLOYEES.
8 THANK YOU.

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME CALL DR. GENEVIEVE
11 CLAVREUL, SHAMOYA HOLLAND. MATTHEW SIROLLY.

12

13 **NORMA TORRES:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS NORMA ERICA TORRES.
14 I'M FROM THE ORGANIZATION C.H.I.R.L.A. AND I LIVE IN CANOGA
15 PARK. I WAS CONTRACTED BY A GUY WHO WAS-- WHO GAVE US A JOB TO
16 CLEAN HOUSES AND APARTMENTS. WE AGREED THAT WE WERE GETTING
17 PAID WEEKLY. MY BROTHER AND I STARTED WORKING. WE TRAVELED
18 FROM CANOGA PARK TO HERE IN LOS ANGELES. HE SENT US TO VARIOUS
19 PLACES LIKE LA BREA, COMPTON. WE COMMUTED ON THE BUS. WE HAD
20 TO TAKE TWO BUSES AND THEN A TRAIN WITH OUR WORK TOOLS. AFTER
21 ONE WEEK HE PAID US THAT WEEK. WHEN WE WORKED THE SECOND WEEK,
22 WE WENT TO LOOK FOR HIM TO GET OUR PAYMENT BUT THE OFFICE HAD
23 ALREADY MOVED. WE CALLED THEM VARIOUS TIMES OVER THE TELEPHONE
24 AND HE NEVER ANSWERED. WE WENT TO LOOK FOR HIM IN HIS HOME AND
25 WHEN WE LOOKED FOR HIM HE HAD ALREADY MOVED AND OTHER PEOPLE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 LIVED THERE. WE LOOKED FOR HIM IN VARIOUS PLACES AND HE WAS
2 NEVER THERE AND HE OWED US ABOUT \$3,500. THIS CAUSED MANY PAIN
3 FOR MY BROTHER BECAUSE HE HAD NO MONEY TO PAY HIS RENT. I
4 SUPPORT THIS ORDINANCE SO THE EMPLOYERS CAN BE PUNISHED FOR
5 WAGE THEFT. SO THAT WOULDN'T HAPPEN TO OTHER PEOPLE LIKE IT
6 HAPPENED TO ME. IF YOU GUYS SUPPORT THIS ORDINANCE, WE WILL
7 FEEL BETTER, AND WE WILL BE ABLE TO RECUPERATE ALL OUR MONEY
8 FOR OUR WORK AND PAIN AND JUSTICE CAN BE MADE. THANK YOU.

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME CALL UP NENA RUIZ.
11 YES, SIR.

12

13 **MATTHEW SIROLLY:** HELLO, MY NAME IS MATTHEW SIROLLY. I AM THE
14 DIRECTOR OF THE WAGE JUSTICE CENTER WHICH IS A COMMUNITY
15 NONPROFIT GROUP THAT ACTUALLY SPECIFICALLY WORKS ON COLLECTING
16 UNPAID WAGES FOR LOW INCOME WORKERS. I THANK YOU FOR
17 CONSIDERING THIS MOTION, AND I REALLY WANT TO URGE YOU TO
18 SUPPORT IT. AND I WANT TO SPEC A LITTLE BIT MORE SPECIFICALLY
19 ABOUT ENFORCEMENT AND WHY I THINK LOCAL ENFORCEMENT IS SO
20 IMPORTANT. OUR ORGANIZATION, THE WAGE JUSTICE CENTER, HAS FOR
21 THE LAST EIGHT YEARS WORKED ON ENFORCING WAGE CASES, UNPAID
22 WAGES, WAGE JUDGMENTS, IN LOS ANGELES COUNTY AND FOR THE LAST
23 THREE YEARS THROUGHOUT THE STATE IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE
24 D.L.S.E., WITH THE STATE LABOR COMMISSIONER'S OFFICE. INDEED,
25 MOST OF THE CASES THE LABOR COMMISSIONER DECIDES COME

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ESSENTIALLY TO OUR OFFICE, OUR OFFICE, WHICH CONSISTS OF FIVE
2 LAWYERS. WE HAVE 3,000 CASES, LITERALLY 3,000 CASES, FROM THE
3 LABOR COMMISSIONER DEPARTMENT, FOUR OR FIVE LAWYERS. THE
4 NUMBERS ARE-- IT'S UNREASONABLE TO BELIEVE THIS THAT THE STATE
5 WILL BE ABLE TO ACCOMPLISH LOCAL ENFORCEMENT AND STATE
6 ENFORCEMENT AT THIS TIME. IT WOULD BE NAIVE TO BELIEVE THE
7 STATE WILL BE ABLE TO DO IT. THERE ARE 16 LAWYERS IN THE LABOR
8 COMMISSIONER DEPARTMENT FOR THE ENTIRE STATE OF CALIFORNIA. SO
9 THE LOCAL ENFORCEMENT WILL BE A KEY PART OF THIS WORK. I WANT
10 TO TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE TYPES OF BUSINESSES THAT WE
11 DEAL WITH. SEVERAL OF THE SPEAKERS SAID THAT MANY OF THE
12 BUSINESSES FOLLOW THE LAW. AND THIS IS TRUE. BUT THE KINDS OF
13 BUSINESSES THAT WE SEE, THE WAGE THIEVES, WHAT MAKES THEM WAGE
14 THIEVES IS THAT THEY DON'T FOLLOW THE LAW. SO WE NEED STRONG
15 ENFORCEMENT MECHANISMS TO MAKE THIS WORK. AND IT'S NOT SIMPLY
16 GOING TO BE DOING AN INVESTIGATION OR HAVING AN ADMINISTRATIVE
17 HEARING AND TELLING SOMEBODY THAT THEY OWE WAGES. THEY KNOW
18 THEY OWE WAGES. THEY'RE NOT PAYING THEM. IT'S GOING TO BE
19 IMPORTANT REMEDIES SUCH AS PREJUDGMENT LIENS WHICH WE USE AND
20 ARE EXTREMELY EFFECTIVE AND LICENSE REVOCATIONS, WHICH THIS
21 COUNTY HAS THE POWER TO DO, PARTICULARLY HEALTH PERMIT
22 REVOCATIONS, WHICH I THINK ARE CRUCIAL, BECAUSE--

23

24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. JEREMY BLASI. JUAN
25 GUTIERREZ. JONATHAN KLINE. YES, MA'AM. YES, SIR. YES, MA'AM.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SHAMOYA HOLLAND:** GOOD AFTERNOON, MY NAME IS SHAMOYA HOLLAND
3 AND I AM A MEMBER OF THE LOS ANGELES BLACK WORKERS CENTER. WE
4 KNOW THE ECONOMY HAS BEEN TOUGH FOR WORKING PEOPLE BUT BLACK
5 PEOPLE, IT'S EVEN TOUGHER. I'M A SINGLE PARENT WHO HAS BEEN
6 UNEMPLOYED FOR ALMOST FOUR YEARS BECAUSE I CANNOT FIND
7 EMPLOYMENT. THUS I AM A LIABILITY TO THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
8 AND COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES. I HAVE WORKED AT JOBS, ONE OF THEM
9 WAS THE MARRIOTT WHERE I WAS THE ONLY BLACK WORKER WORKING IN
10 THE LAUNDRY AND DESPITE BEING A GOOD WORKER I WAS LET GO
11 WITHOUT JUST CAUSE AND THE PAY I GOT WAS LESS THAN THE OTHER
12 MINORITIES THERE WHO BARELY, IF AT ALL, SPOKE ENGLISH. BUT I
13 CAN'T GIVE UP. I AM READY FOR A FRESH START BUT I AM CONCERNED
14 NO ONE CARES ABOUT THIS ISSUE. FOR INSTANCE IN THE LOS ANGELES
15 COUNTY, HALF OF BLACK PEOPLE IN THE WORKFORCE ARE EITHER
16 UNEMPLOYED OR ARE LESS THAN \$13 AN HOUR AND FACE WAGE THEFT
17 TWICE THAT OF WHITE WORKERS, WHICH IS GROSS, IF THEY GROSS
18 UNDER \$200 A MONTH, THAT AVERAGE, THE AVERAGE GROSS OF ONE
19 BEDROOM IN L.A. COUNTY IS \$1,100 A MONTH. SO MOST RENTERS
20 REQUIRE TIMES THE RENT IN NET WORTH. SO THAT JUST DOES NOT CUT
21 IT. I'M BATTLING HOMELESSNESS BECAUSE OF THESE INJUSTICES. FOR
22 THE NEW MINIMUM WAGE TO BE A REALITY, WE NEED LOCAL
23 ENFORCEMENT OF WAGE THEFT, COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS AND A
24 COMPLAINT RESOLUTION PROCESS TO ADDRESS DISCRIMINATION IN
25 HUMAN RELATIONS DISCRIMINATION. THANK YOU.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, SIR.

3

4 **JEREMY BLASI:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS JEREMY BLASI. I'M A
5 STAFF ATTORNEY WITH UNITE HERE LOCAL 11. I'D' LIKE TO NOTE
6 JUST SEVERAL MORE WAYS THAT THE COUNTY'S ENFORCEMENT LAW CAN
7 BE MADE AS STRONG AS POSSIBLE. FIRST, BECAUSE THE FEAR OF
8 EMPLOYER RETALIATION IS A SIGNIFICANT REASON THAT WAGE THEFT
9 VIOLATIONS GO UNREPORTED, STRONG ANTI RETALIATION PROVISIONS
10 WILL BE KEY TO THE LEGISLATION'S SUCCESS. IN CALIFORNIA, EVERY
11 MUNICIPALITY THAT HAS RAISED ITS MINIMUM WAGE EXCEPT SAN DIEGO
12 AND SANTA CLARA HAS CREATED A REBUTTABLE PRESUMPTION OF
13 RETALIATION WHEN AN EMPLOYER TAKES ADVERSE ACTION AGAINST AN
14 EMPLOYEE WITHIN THREE MONTHS OF THAT WORKER'S ASSERTION OF HIS
15 OR HER RIGHTS. OAKLAND'S ORDINANCE EXTENDS THIS PERIOD FOR 120
16 DAYS AND HOLDS EMPLOYERS TO A HIGH STANDARD OF EVIDENCE, CLEAR
17 AND CONVINCING TO PROVE THAT THEIR ACTION WAS NOT RETALIATORY.
18 WE ENCOURAGE THE COUNTY TO INCLUDE REBUTTABLE PRESUMPTION
19 LANGUAGE AT LEAST AS STRONG OF THAT OF OAKLAND. ADDITIONALLY
20 WE ENCOURAGE THE COUNTY TO FOLLOW THE LEAD OF NINE CITIES IN
21 CALIFORNIA THAT EXPLICITLY PROTECT WORKERS IN THEIR MINIMUM
22 WAGE LAWS FROM THE MOMENT THEY SPEAK TO ANYONE ABOUT THEIR
23 RIGHTS INCLUDING COWORKERS, A COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION OR A
24 UNION. EVEN BEFORE THE WORKER DECIDES TO APPROACH MANAGEMENT
25 OR FILE A COMPLAINT. THIS IS A KEY PERIOD IN WHICH RETALIATION

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 OCCURS BUT THERE'S NO PROTECTION CURRENTLY UNDER STATE LAW TO
2 PROTECT THEM. SECOND, WE ENCOURAGE THE COUNTY TO ENSURE THAT
3 ITS ENFORCEMENT OFFICE IS A CERTIFYING AGENCY FOR U-VISAS.
4 VARIOUS FORMS OF WORKER ABUSE SUCH AS LABOR TRAFFICKING AND
5 OBSTRUCTION OF JUSTICE CONSTITUTE QUALIFYING CRIMINAL ACTIVITY
6 UNDER THE U-VISA REGULATIONS. THE COUNTY CAN ENCOURAGE
7 IMMIGRANT WORKERS TO REPORT SUCH CRIMINAL ACTIVITY AND PROTECT
8 WORKERS WHO COME FORWARD BY DEVELOPING A PROTOCOL TO CERTIFY
9 U-VISA PETITIONS. THE STATE D.L.S.E IS ALREADY DOING SO.
10 FINALLY I'D LIKE JUST TO TAKE A MOMENT TO RECOGNIZE THE MANY
11 WORKERS WHO, TOOK THEIR DAY OFF OF WORK TO COME BUT MAY NOT BE
12 ABLE TO TESTIFY. SO IF THE WORKERS ARE HERE TODAY COULD JUST
13 STAND UP FOR A MOMENT SO WE COULD RECOGNIZE YOUR CONTRIBUTION.
14 [APPLAUSE.]

15

16 **JUAN GUTIERREZ:** MY NAME IS JUAN JOSE GUTIERREZ. I REPRESENT
17 VAMOS UNIDOS U.S.A., THE FULL RIGHTS FOR IMMIGRANTS COALITION
18 AND THE STOP HERBALIFE COALITION. I'M HERE TO SUPPORT WAGE
19 THEFT REGULATION BECAUSE THIS IS A HUGE PROBLEM AND IT'S NOT
20 ONE THAT INVOLVES ONLY SMALL BUSINESSES. THERE ARE GIGANTIC
21 TRANSNATIONAL CORPORATIONS LIKE HERBALIFE WHO DO WORSE THAN
22 THE SMALL BUSINESSES BECAUSE THEY HAVE SO MUCH AT THEIR
23 DISPOSAL AND YET THEY'RE STEALING THE WAGES OF THEIR MANY,
24 MANY WORKERS. I'LL GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE. HERBALIFE REQUIRES
25 RECRUITS TO WORK IN CLUBS WITHOUT PAY FOR AN UNDISCLOSED

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 PERIOD OF TIME. OFTENTIMES THEY ARE REQUIRED TO PURCHASE
2 PRODUCTS AT THE CLUB IN WHICH THEY ARE TRAINING AND ARE
3 REQUIRED TO RECRUIT FAMILY AND FRIENDS TO PURCHASE PRODUCTS,
4 AS WELL. THEY ARE PROVIDING A DIRECT MATERIAL BENEFIT FOR CLUB
5 OWNERS BUT ARE NOT COMPENSATED FOR THEIR TIME AND EFFORTS.
6 ESSENTIALLY, CLUB OWNERS ARE RELYING ON FREE LABOR TO OPERATE
7 THEIR CLUBS, A VIOLATION OF A FAIR LABOR STANDARDS ACT AS WELL
8 AS CALIFORNIA LABOR LAWS. NOW, WE HAVE PROBLEMS AT THE STATE
9 LEVEL ENFORCING LABOR LAW AND AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL, AS WELL.
10 SO THAT'S WHY WE NEED TO DO SOMETHING AT THE LOCAL LEVEL
11 BECAUSE HERE IN L.A. COUNTY, THIS IS A HUGE PROBLEM. TO GIVE
12 YOU AN EXAMPLE, MORE THAN 500 COMPLAINTS BY HERBAL LIFE
13 VICTIMS HAVE BEEN FILED WITH THE STATE, AND YET OUR ATTORNEY
14 GENERAL HAS DONE NOTHING TO DATE AND WE'VE BEEN WORKING ON
15 THIS ISSUE FOR MORE THAN TWO YEARS. SO I APPLAUD THIS
16 INITIATIVE. WE SUPPORT IT WHOLEHEARTEDLY. WE THINK IT WAS A
17 LONG TIME COMING AND WE HOPE THAT YOU MUSTER THE COURAGE AND
18 VOTE FOR IT AND WE'RE VERY HAPPY THAT MOST OF YOU HAVE ALREADY
19 EXPRESSED THAT YOU'RE GOING TO DO SO. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

20

21 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** ROSE MARIE MOLINA. ALL RIGHT. THAT
22 CONCLUDES THE PEOPLE THAT WE HAD CALLED. SUPERVISOR HILDA
23 SOLIS.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** I JUST WANT TO THANK THE BOARD AGAIN, OUR
2 COUNTY COUNSEL, C.E.O.'S OFFICE AND OUR STAFF, ALSO BRIAN
3 STIGER AND ALL THOSE THAT PARTICIPATED IN PUTTING THEIR
4 THOUGHTS AND STRONG WORDS TOGETHER TO PROVIDE FOR THIS
5 ORDINANCE AND ALSO TO THOSE IN THE PUBLIC AUDIENCE THAT
6 ATTENDED TODAY. THANK YOU. AND I MOVE AS AMENDED. THERE'S TWO
7 AMENDMENTS BEFORE US, MR. MAYOR.

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. MOTION BY SUPERVISOR SOLIS.
10 SECONDED BY SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS AS AMENDED. CALL THE
11 ROLL.

12

13 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR SOLIS?

14

15 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** AYE.

16

17 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR RIDLEY-
18 THOMAS?

19

20 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** AYE.

21

22 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR KUEHL?

23

24 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** AYE.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR KNABE.

2

3 **SUP. KNABE:** AYE.

4

5 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR

6 ANTONOVICH.

7

8 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** NO. MOTION CARRIES. SO ORDERED. LIFT

9 THE ROOF. OKAY. WE HAVE SUPERVISOR KNABE NO. 18 AND 8.

10 SUPERVISOR KUEHL IS 18.

11

12 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** IT WAS MINE. THANK YOU SO MUCH. I SIMPLY

13 WANTED TO COMMENT ON ITEM 18 WHICH IS AMENDMENTS TO MY HEALTH

14 L.A. CONTRACT. AND THE REASON I WANTED TO COMMENT IS REALLY TO

15 PRAISE THE PROGRAM VERY BRIEFLY TO SAY HOW MUCH I APPRECIATE

16 THE DEPARTMENT'S EFFORTS TO CONTINUALLY INCREASE ACCESS TO

17 THIS VERY IMPORTANT PROGRAM. THIS BOARD LETTER ADDS 38 MORE

18 SITES WHERE CLIENTS ARE ABLE TO ENROLL IN THE PROGRAM. AND THE

19 SUCCESS OF MY HEALTH L.A. RELATES DIRECTLY TO WHETHER PEOPLE

20 CAN ACCESS IT OR NOT. SO THIS IS REALLY WONDERFUL. THE BOARD

21 LETTER ALSO ALLOWS SATELLITE SITES LIKE SOME OF OUR SCHOOL DAY

22 HEALTHCARE CENTERS TO OFFER SERVICES TO ADULTS IN THE

23 COMMUNITY. THE WAY THAT WE'VE BEEN ENCOURAGING SCHOOL-BASED

24 HEALTH CENTERS TO SORT OF FACE BOTH WAYS INTO THE SCHOOLS, OUT

25 TO THE COMMUNITY. IT'S WONDERFUL TO SEE THE DEPARTMENT FIGURE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 OUT WAYS TO MAKE IT EASIER TO RENEW THEIR MEMBERSHIP AND TO
2 STAY IN THE PROGRAM. AND NOW IT'S EVEN EASIER BECAUSE ONE
3 FAMILY MEMBER CAN RENEW THEIR MEMBERSHIP FOR THE ENTIRE
4 FAMILY. SO YOU DON'T ANY LONGER NEED TO BRING EVERY SINGLE
5 MEMBER OF THE FAMILY THERE TO RENEW THEIR ENROLLMENT IN MY
6 HEALTH L.A. THERE'S ALSO A NEW FLEXIBILITY THAT'S IMPORTANT IN
7 THE DENTAL PROGRAM BECAUSE DENTAL CARE IS A HUGE UNMET NEED
8 ACROSS ALL OF THE PEOPLE WHO ENROLL IN THIS PROGRAM, AND IT'S
9 GREAT TO SEE THE DEPARTMENT ADD THIS FLEXIBILITY TO THE
10 PROGRAM, MAKE IT EASIER FOR CLIENTS TO ACCESS DENTAL SERVICES,
11 AND TO GO WHERE THEY CAN ACTUALLY ACCESS THE CARE. SO I'M
12 HAPPY TO SEE THE DEPARTMENT WORKING WITH CLINICS TO MAKE SURE
13 THAT OUR SAFETY NET IS PREPARED TO TAKE FULL ADVANTAGE OF
14 S.B.75, WHICH IS THE NEW BILL THAT ALLOWS UNDOCUMENTED KIDS TO
15 ENROLL IN MEDI-CAL WHEN IT'S IMPLEMENTED NEXT YEAR. SO I
16 SIMPLY WANTED TO PRAISE THE PROGRAM PUBLICLY, PRAISE THE
17 DEPARTMENT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MR. MAYOR.

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR HILDA SOLIS?

20

21 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** I JUST WANTED TO THANK OUR STAFF AT
22 DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH SERVICES FOR THEIR WORK ON THIS ISSUE. I
23 KNOW MY DEPUTY ON HEALTH, JOANNE PI ERO, HAS BEEN WORKING ON
24 THIS SINCE I GOT HERE. THIS WAS BROUGHT TO MY ATTENTION I
25 THINK THE MONTH THAT I TOOK OFFICE WITH RESPECT TO UNEQUAL

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ACCESS FOR MY HEALTH L.A. AND JUST THE FACT THAT SO MANY
2 PEOPLE COULD NOT BE ENROLLED APPROPRIATELY OUT IN DIFFERENT
3 SITES THROUGHOUT THE DISTRICT. IT WAS BROUGHT TO MY ATTENTION.
4 AND I WAS VERY HAPPY TO WORK WITH COMMUNITY CLINIC
5 ASSOCIATION, WITH OUR DEPUTIES TO SEE THAT THIS WAS IMPROVED
6 UPON. BUT MORE IMPORTANTLY, I THINK AT ONE POINT WE DID BRING
7 UP AN ISSUE REGARDING PHARMACEUTICAL MEDICINE BEING AVAILABLE
8 TO SOME OF OUR PATIENTS. AND I GAVE THE EXAMPLE THAT AT SOME
9 POINT, AT ROIBAL COMPREHENSIVE CENTER, INDIVIDUALS, ELDERLY
10 THAT WERE TRYING TO GET THEIR MEDICATION FOR DIABETES
11 TREATMENT WOULD HAVE TO NO LONGER RECEIVE THEM THERE BUT HAVE
12 TO COME BACK TO L.A.C+U.S.C, WHICH MEANT TAKING TWO OR THREE
13 BUSES FROM EAST L.A. THAT'S A HARDSHIP. SO NOW THAT HAS SINCE
14 BEEN RESOLVED, IT'S GOING TO BE EASIER. MORE PEOPLE WILL BE
15 ABLE TO GET THE APPROPRIATE HEALTHCARE THAT THEY NEED. AND I
16 JUST WANT TO THANK STAFF AND THANK ALSO OUR DEPARTMENT OF
17 HEALTH SERVICES AND OUR COMMUNITY MEMBERS FOR BRINGING THIS TO
18 OUR ATTENTION. SO THANK GOODNESS, WE MOVE ON. THANK YOU.

19

20 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT. FABIOLA
21 SANDOVAL. OLGA PEREZ. SOCORRO VASQUEZ MORALES. MARIA TORRES.

22

23 **FABIOLA SANDOVAL:** HONORABLE MEMBERS OF THE BOARD OF
24 SUPERVISORS, MY NAME IS FABIOLA SANDOVAL WITH MATERNAL AND
25 CHILD HEALTH ACCESS. I WORK PRIMARILY IN BOYLE HEIGHTS, COUNTY

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HISTORIC GENERAL HOSPITAL. ALSO WITH BUILDING OUT THE
2 COMMUNITIES BOYLE HEIGHTS. WE APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT LOS
3 ANGELES IS ONE OF THE FEW COUNTIES THAT ENJOYS OPTIONS SUCH AS
4 MY HEALTH L.A. FOR UNINSURED RESIDENTS. WE WANT TO MAXIMIZE
5 THE ABILITY OF LOS ANGELES RESIDENTS TO USE THIS PROGRAM.
6 M.C.H.A. HAS BOTH CONDUCTED ENROLLMENT, RE-ENROLLMENT AND
7 TROUBLESHOOTING IN HEALTH PROGRAMS AND HAVE TRAINED THE VAST
8 MAJORITY OF ENROLLERS IN L.A. COUNTY SINCE OUR INCEPTION IN
9 1996. WE ENROLLED THOUSANDS OF FAMILIES EACH YEAR. AND LAST
10 MONTH ALONE CONDUCTED OVER 500 INSTANCES OF TROUBLESHOOTING
11 PROBLEMS OF ENROLLMENT AND ACCESS TO CARE. WE ARE SUPPORTIVE
12 OF THE EXPANDED OPPORTUNITIES TO ENROLL PRESENTED BY THE
13 MOTION; HOWEVER, WE THINK THE EXPANSION TO SATELLITE AND
14 MOBILE CLINICS DOESN'T GO FAR ENOUGH. M.C.H.A. BELIEVES
15 ENROLLMENT IN MY HEALTH L.A. SHOULD BE INTEGRATED WITH THE
16 FAMILIES ENROLLMENT INTO ALL HEALTHCARE PROGRAMS. CERTIFIED
17 ENROLLMENT COUNSELORS SHOULD BE ABLE TO ENROLL IN MY HEALTH
18 L.A. WHEN WORKING WITH FAMILIES. MANY FAMILIES, AS WE KNOW,
19 ARE MIXED STATUS WITH SOME UNDOCUMENTED MEMBERS AND SOME
20 CITIZENS OR LEGAL PERMIT RESIDENTS. M.C.H.A. APPRECIATES THAT
21 THE ENTIRE FAMILY WILL NO LONGER HAVE TO COME TO THE CLINIC TO
22 RE-ENROLL IN THE PROGRAM, HOWEVER WE THINK SIMPLIFICATION
23 COULD GO FURTHER. PREPOPULATED FORMS COULD BE SENT TO THE
24 ENROLLEES AND A PASSIVE RE-ENROLLMENT TAKE PLACE IF THERE HAVE
25 BEEN NO INCOME CHANGES TO REPORT OR THE RE-ENROLLMENT COULD BE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 DONE OVER THE PHONE. FINALLY, WE WHOLEHEARTEDLY SUPPORT THE
2 MOTION TO NO LONGER SEPARATE DENTAL INTO SEPARATE FUNDING CAP.
3 WE ARE CONCERNED, HOWEVER, THAT NOT ALL CLINICS OFFER DENTAL
4 CARE AND HAVE SEEN MANY INSTANCES WHERE SPECIALTY DENTAL CARE
5 IS NEEDED. SO WE WOULD LIKE MORE SUPPORT THERE. THANK YOU FOR
6 THIS PROGRAM AND FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK TO THE NEED OF
7 REFORMS.

8

9 **OLGA PEREZ:** HELLO. GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS OLGA. I FIRST
10 WANTED TO THANK THE L.A. COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH SERVICES
11 FOR MY HEALTH L.A. THIS HEALTH COVERAGE IS A GREAT AND GOOD
12 BENEFIT FOR EVERY COMMUNITY AND EVERY FAMILY MEMBER IN OUR
13 COMMUNITY. I ALSO WANTED TO MENTION IF THEY CAN CONSIDER MORE
14 OUTREACH, MORE ANNOUNCEMENTS ON THE RADIO OR MORE ADVERTISING
15 TO GET MORE INFORMATION OUT THERE TO OUR COMMUNITIES AND TO
16 INFORM THEM OF THIS HEALTHCARE, OF MY HEALTH L.A. SO THAT
17 PARTICIPANTS THAT CAN BENEFIT FROM THIS PROGRAM COULD COME
18 FORWARD AND ENROLL BECAUSE TO STAY HEALTHY CAN MAKE ME AND
19 OTHERS WORK BETTER AND BE ABLE TO HELP OTHERS AS NOW WE'RE
20 WORKING WITH BUILDING HEALTHY COMMUNITIES AND INVESTING IN OUR
21 COMMUNITIES, DOING ENROLLING, SHARING KNOWLEDGE, BUILDING
22 LEADERSHIP AND POWER. AS WE ALL KNOW, A HEALTHIER SOCIETY IS A
23 LESS COSTLY SOCIETY. THANK YOU.

24

25 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, MA'AM.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SOCORRO VAZQUEZ-MORALES:** [THROUGH INTERPRETER] GOOD MORNING TO
3 THE FIVE SUPERVISORS I HAVE IN FRONT OF ME. MY NAME IS SOCORRO
4 VASQUEZ. I LIVED IN THIS COUNTRY FOR 20 YEARS. 20 YEARS THAT
5 FOR ME WERE A NIGHTMARE. BUT THANKS TO YOUR FIVE HEARTS THAT
6 WORK FOR ALL OUR BROTHERS THAT DON'T HAVE MEDICAL COVERAGE,
7 WHICH IS MY HEALTH L.A. I COME FROM THE CHURCH SAINT TERESITA,
8 L.A. VOICE. I HAVE WORKED HARD, AS WELL, FOR JUSTICE. THAT'S
9 WHY I'M HERE TO GIVE YOU A MILLION THANKS TO YOU ALL BECAUSE I
10 FEEL MY DILEMMA WAS BEFORE THAT I USED TO CARRY THE WORLD BY
11 BEING A DIABETIC AND HAVING ARTHRITIS. NOW I SAY THAT THE
12 WORLD CARRIES ME BECAUSE OF THIS PROGRAM, BECAUSE I AM A
13 SINGLE MOTHER AND I WORK HARD TO MAINTAIN THEM. A MILLION
14 THANKS TO YOU ALL. THANK YOU FOR WORKING FOR LOS ANGELES.
15 ESPECIALLY TO MY SUPERVISOR FROM MY DISTRICT. THANK YOU.

16

17 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** YES, MA'AM.

18

19 **MARIA TORRES:** [THROUGH INTERPRETER] GOOD MORNING TO ALL
20 SUPERVISORS. I AM A MEMBER OF L.A. VOICE. I LIVE IN BOYLE
21 HEIGHTS AND I HAVE FORTY YEARS LIVING IN THE COMMUNITY OF
22 BOYLE HEIGHTS. I HAVE NOTICED THAT HAD THERE'S MANY PEOPLE IN
23 MY COMMUNITY THAT DON'T BENEFIT FROM THIS PROGRAM OF MY HEALTH
24 L.A. I AM A U.S. CITIZEN. JUST LIKE MY FAMILY AND MY NEIGHBORS
25 IN COMMUNITY, THEY CAN'T BENEFIT FROM THIS PROGRAM. I WOULD

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 LIKE FOR YOU GUYS ALL TO SUPPORT THIS AND GIVE MORE BENEFITS
2 TO OUR COMMUNITY. IN THIS MONTH OF NOVEMBER AND DECEMBER, WE
3 HAVE THREE EVENTS. WE WISH TO REACH MORE THAN 500 PEOPLE. TO
4 ENLIST IN THIS PROGRAM AND GIVE THEM MORE INFORMATION. OUR
5 PEOPLE ARE AS INFORMED BECAUSE THERE IS NO INFORMATION TO GIVE
6 THESE COMMUNITIES. BUT WE AS AN ORGANIZATION ARE UNABLE TO
7 GIVE THEM AS MUCH INFORMATION TO OUR COMMUNITIES. WE NEED FOR
8 THESE COMMUNITIES TO BE INFORMED NOT ONLY BY THESE
9 ORGANIZATIONS. WE WOULD WISH FOR THEM TO BE INFORMED BY
10 NEWSPAPERS, L.A. TIMES. THE THING THAT I ENJOY OTHER MEMBERS
11 FROM OUR ORGANIZATION ENJOY. WE WISH FOR OTHER MEMBERS OF
12 OTHER ORGANIZATIONS TO ENJOY THE BENEFITS THAT WE ARE
13 ENJOYING. I WISH FOR THIS TO BE PUBLICIZED BY OTHER MEANS OF
14 COMMUNICATION, VIA NEWSPAPER. THANK YOU, BOARD OF SUPERVISORS.
15 THANK YOU, SUPERVISOR SOLIS. THANK YOU ALL. I WISH THAT
16 EVERYTHING THAT WAS SAID HERE WOULD BE SUPPORTED BY ALL OF
17 YOU. THANK YOU.

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
20 ON THIS ITEM. SUPERVISOR, MOTION? SUPERVISOR HILDA SOLIS.
21 SECONDED BY SUPERVISOR KUEHL. CALL THE-- MY PROBLEM IS. THIS
22 IS A FEDERAL REQUIREMENT, I SHOULD SAY A FEDERAL
23 RESPONSIBILITY. IT'S VERY DIFFICULT TO PROVIDE SERVICES TO
24 THOSE PEOPLE THAT ARE HERE LEGALLY IN OUR COUNTRY, BUT FOR THE
25 COUNTY, LOCAL GOVERNMENTS, WHO ARE DEPENDENT UPON LIMITED

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 RESOURCES TO ABSORB THIS COST, THIS IS A COST THAT THE FEDERAL
2 GOVERNMENT HAS A RESPONSIBILITY TO REIMBURSE LOCAL GOVERNMENT
3 FOR, AND THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IS NOT REIMBURSING US. I JUST
4 THINK IT'S ANOTHER HIT IN OUR BUDGET, WHICH IS VERY FRAGILE TO
5 BEGIN WITH. AND THAT'S WHY I WOULD BE OPPOSING THIS. IT'S A
6 FEDERAL RESPONSIBILITY THAT THEY PROVIDE THOSE RESOURCES FOR
7 THIS TYPE OF PROGRAM. SO CALL THE ROLL.

8

9 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR SOLIS?

10

11 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** AYE.

12

13 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR RIDLEY-
14 THOMAS?

15

16 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** AYE.

17

18 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR KUEHL.

19

20 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** AYE.

21

22 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR KNABE?

23

24 **SUP. KNABE:** AYE.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** SUPERVISOR
2 ANTONOVICH.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** NO. SO ORDERED. ITEM NO. 8 IS
5 SUPERVISOR HILDA SOLIS.

6

7 **SUP. KNABE:** NO, I THINK IT'S ME.

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** EXCUSE ME. SUPERVISOR KNABE.

10

11 **SUP. KNABE:** RIGHT, ALL RIGHT. MY REASON FOR HOLDING THIS IS
12 JUST TO COMMENT AND TO MAKE SURE THAT WE UNDERSTAND THE
13 REGIONALIZATION THIS HOMELESS ISSUE IS HAVING AN IMPACT. THIS
14 CONTINUES TO BE A VERY SUCCESSFUL PROGRAM AND A GREAT EXAMPLE
15 OF HOW REGIONALIZATION IN ADDRESSING THE NEEDS OF THE HOMELESS
16 ISSUES THAT ARE CONFRONTING US, AND MOVE IT OUT BEYOND THE
17 BOUNDARIES OF DOWNTOWN. THERE ARE 27 CITIES THAT MAKE UP THE
18 GATEWAY C.O.G, SPANNING THE FOURTH DISTRICT, THE SECOND
19 DISTRICT AND THE FIRST DISTRICT. AND THEY UTILIZE THIS FUNDING
20 TO WORK TOGETHER TO ADDRESS THE HOMELESSNESS ISSUE. SINCE
21 2012, THEY HAVE CONNECTED 14,000 HOMELESS INDIVIDUALS WITH
22 SERVICES AND PERMANENTLY HOUSED OVER 1,000 PEOPLE. OBVIOUSLY
23 WE HAVE VERY HIGH HOPES FOR A SIMILAR AMENDMENT THAT
24 SUPERVISOR RIDLEY-THOMAS AND I ARE PUTTING TOGETHER WORKING
25 WITH THE SOUTH BAY C.O.G. THIS FUNDING TODAY BEFORE US

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 CONTINUES THAT GREAT GATEWAY PROGRAM THROUGH THE END OF JUNE
2 2016. AND WE WANT TO CONTINUE TO MOVE FORWARD ON THIS AND
3 REALLY APPRECIATE THE WAY THIS PROGRAM HAS WORKED AND MARK AND
4 I LOOK FORWARD TO OUR ISSUES WITH THE SOUTH BAY C.O.G.S, AS
5 WELL, TOO. SO WITH THAT, MR. MAYOR, I MOVE THE ITEM.

6

7 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** IF I MAY, MR. MAYOR?

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS?

10

11 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** THIS IS IMPORTANT TO UNDERSCORE IN VIEW OF
12 THE FACT THAT OUR CONCERN ABOUT THE ISSUE OF HOMELESSNESS IS
13 NOT L.A. CITY-CENTRIC. OBVIOUSLY THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES IS
14 THE SEAT OF THE COUNTY IS IMPORTANT TO US AS THAT BODY
15 CURRENTLY DELIBERATES ON THE MATTER OF HOMELESSNESS. I SIMPLY
16 WANT TO SAY THAT THE 87 ADDITIONAL CITIES IN THE COUNTY ARE
17 AFFECTED BY THIS ISSUE. EACH MEMBER OF THIS BOARD CAN ATTEST
18 TO THAT BY VIRTUE OF THE FACT THAT THEIR RESPECTIVE CITIES
19 CALL IT TO THEIR ATTENTION. THIS ITEM IS GOOD BECAUSE IT MOVES
20 FORWARD WITH SOME IMMEDIACY. IN TERMS OF STREET ENGAGEMENT AND
21 COORDINATION, RAPID REHOUSING AND MORE, NOT THE LEAST OF WHICH
22 IF WE LOOK DOWNSTREAM IS THE WORK THAT HAS TO BE DONE IN TERMS
23 OF PERMANENT SUPPORTIVE HOUSING. SO I SHARE THE CONCERNS
24 ARTICULATED BY SUPERVISOR KNABE. AND THE MORE WE DO, THE
25 FASTER WE DO IT, THE EXTENT TO WHICH WE ACT OUT OF A SENSE OF

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 URGENCY, THE BETTER IT WILL BE FOR THOSE COMMUNITIES UNDER OUR
2 CONCERN AS WELL AS THOSE INDIVIDUALS WHO SUFFER AS A RESULT OF
3 BEING HOMELESS. I SUPPORT THAT WHICH IS BEFORE US AND THANK
4 SUPERVISOR KNABE FOR HIS LEADERSHIP.

5

6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SO MR. ERIC PREVEN.

7

8 **ERIC PREVEN:** YES, IT'S ERIC PREVEN THE RESIDENT FROM THE THIRD
9 DISTRICT. I TOO APPRECIATE THAT THIS IS ABOUT I THINK IT'S AN
10 \$800,000 ON TOP, SO IT WILL BE ABOUT A MILLION AND 16,000 FOR
11 ONE MORE YEAR OF THIS PROGRAM THAT HAS BEEN ONGOING. SO THE \$4
12 MILLION NUMBER, MOST OF THAT IS SPENT. AND ONE THOUGHT,
13 RICHARD POWERS OBVIOUSLY IS THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF GATEWAY
14 CITY COUNTY GOVERNMENT. HE'S HANDLING A LOT OF THIS FOR THIS
15 GROUP INCLUDING METRO ISSUES. I ASSUME THEY WORK IN TANDEM TO
16 TRY TO MAKE THOSE WORK EFFECTIVELY. THE HOT SPOT IS A HOT
17 BUTTON WORD. I KNOW THIS MEANS WE FIND A SPOT WHERE--

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** IT'S HOT.

20

21 **ERIC PREVEN:** WHICH IS HOT, SIR, VERY GOOD. BUT WHERE THEY HAVE
22 A GATHERING OF HOMELESS INDIVIDUALS. THERE'S A BIG DISCREPANCY
23 ABOUT HOW TO HANDLE THOSE ISSUES? SOMETIMES IT'S PERCEIVED
24 THAT THE WAY IT'S HANDLED IS MORE WITH A STEAM SHOVEL THAN
25 WITH A GENTLE TOUCH. NOW I KNOW THAT WOULD NEVER TAKE PLACE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 UNDER YOUR DIRECT AUSPICES, BUT WE HAVE TO WATCH VERY CLOSELY
2 ON THESE THINGS. FIRST RESPONDING TO THESE KINDS OF THINGS
3 SOMETIMES GETS DISTORTED. AND I KNOW THAT IN MR. BUSCAINO'S
4 DISTRICT OF THE CITY WHICH IS NOT-- IS THAT ONE OF THE C.O.G.
5 CITIES? IT MUST BE. NOPE, IT'S NOT. SO THERE YOU GO.
6 COMPLETELY MISS INFORMED. AS USUAL, THANK YOU, SIR. BUT THE
7 POINT IS WE WANT TO BE CAREFUL TO MAKE SURE THAT THIS IS MONEY
8 THAT'S BEING PUT TO VERY GOOD USE AS OPPOSED TO IN THE MORE
9 UNFRIENDLY CONDUCT. LIKE LET'S MAKE IT ILLEGAL FOR SOMEBODY TO
10 TRY TO PUT SOMETHING OVER THEIR HEAD, OR LET'S CLEAR THEM OUT
11 OF AN AREA WHERE NOBODY IS REALLY DOING ANY DAMAGE TO ANYONE.
12 THAT CAN BE DISRUPTIVE, AS WE ALL KNOW, SO THANK YOU.

13

14 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MOTION BY SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-
15 THOMAS IS GOING TO SECOND SUPERVISOR KNABE'S MOTION. SO
16 ORDERED. NOW WE'RE GOING TO HAVE MR. DANIEL WEIRZBA, ITEM NO.
17 16. DR. CLAVREUL, 21, 22, 24, 36, 37, C.S.-1 AND C.S.-4. AND
18 MR. PREVEN ON 7, 10, 11, 25, 34, 36, 39, 45 AND 46.

19

20 **DANIEL WIERZBA:** GOOD AFTERNOON, MR. MAYOR AND MEMBERS OF THE
21 BOARD.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MOVE THE MICROPHONE OVER.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **DANIEL WIERZBA:** THANK YOU. MR. MAYOR, I WAS ADVISED THIS WAS
2 ON TODAY'S AGENDA YESTERDAY AFTERNOON. SO FOR WITH YOUR
3 INDULGENCE, I HAVE A LETTER FOR EACH OF THE SUPERVISORS IF I
4 MAY PASS IT UP?

5

6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SURE. WHAT IS THE ITEM ON?

7

8 **DANIEL WIERZBA:** THIS IS AGENDA ITEM NO. 16. THANK YOU. FOR
9 ITEM NO. 16, THIS IS FOR A CONTRACT RECOMMENDATION BY THE
10 DEPARTMENT OF CHILDREN AND FAMILY SERVICES, D.C.F.S. TO BE
11 AWARDED TO PACIFIC TOXICOLOGY. MY NAME IS DANIEL WIERZBA. I'M
12 AN ATTORNEY HERE IN LOS ANGELES WITH SEYFARTH SHAW. I
13 REPRESENT TREATMENT ASSESSMENTS SCREENING CENTER, T.A.S.C.
14 T.A.S.C WAS A BIDDER ON THIS CONTRACT, AND A DISAPPOINTED
15 BIDDER AND FILED A BID PROTEST, FIRST WITH THE AGENCY AND THEN
16 IT WENT TO THE COUNTY INDEPENDENT REVIEWER. THIS PROCUREMENT
17 WAS THE LOWEST PRICED RESPONSIVE AND RESPONSIBLE BIDDER. THERE
18 ARE THREE CASES BEFORE THE COURT OF APPEAL IN THE CALIFORNIA
19 SUPREME COURT THAT SAY THE SAME THING. THEY SAY CONTRACTS
20 AWARDED WITHOUT STRICT COMPLIANCE WITH BIDDING PROCESSES WILL
21 BE SET ASIDE. THIS IS MOST NOTICEABLE IN THE KONICA CASE. THIS
22 IS EVEN WHERE THERE IS NO CORRUPTION, ADVERSE EFFECT OR EVEN
23 IF THE AGENCY WOULD SAVE MONEY. THE DEVIATION IS CONSIDERED
24 SUBSTANTIAL UNLESS IT COULD NOT AFFECT THE AMOUNT OF THE BID.
25 IN THE D.C.F.S. RECOMMENDATION LETTER, SPECIFICALLY IN PAGES 3

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AND 4 WHICH IS THE CONTRACT HISTORY, THE AGENCY ADMITS THAT
2 PACIFIC TOXICOLOGY, THE AWARDEE SUBMITTED ITS BID DOCUMENTS,
3 SOME OF THE BID DOCUMENTS, SPECIFICALLY THREE YEARS OF AUDITED
4 FINANCIAL STATEMENTS AFTER THE BID OPENING. NOW, THE AUDITED
5 STATEMENTS WERE A REQUIREMENT TO ENSURE THAT THE AWARDEE WAS A
6 CONTRACTOR THAT COMPLIED WITH FEDERAL O.M.B. AUDITING
7 REQUIREMENTS, SPECIFICALLY O.M.B.A. 122 AND O.M.B. CIRCULAR A-
8 133. THE D.C.F.S. ALSO ADMITTED THAT IT WAIVED THE THIRD YEAR
9 OF AUDITED FINANCIAL STATEMENTS FOR PACIFIC TOXICOLOGY BUT NO
10 OTHER BIDDER, INCLUDING T.A.S.C. T.A.S.C. IS IDENTIFIED AS THE
11 THIRD BIDDER BUT THE SECOND BIDDER, NORCAM WAS DETERMINED
12 NONRESPONSIVE SO THEREFORE T.A.S.C. IS NEXT IN LINE. D.C.F.S.
13 SAID THAT THERE WOULD BE A NO EFFECT ON BID PRICE; HOWEVER,
14 THAT'S NOT THE PROPER METHOD. UNDER KONICA, WHICH I JUST SAID,
15 AND UNDER MILLER VERSUS MCMANN FROM 1942 AND ALSO FOR VALLEY
16 CREST LANDSCAPE VERSUS CITY OF DAVIS FROM 1996, WHEN AN AGENCY
17 WAIVES A MATERIAL DEVIATION, THE CONTRACT IS CONSIDERED NULL
18 AND VOID. IN ESSENCE, AND I'D BE HAPPY TO ADDRESS ANY
19 QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE, BECAUSE THE AGENCY DEVIATED FROM THE
20 BID PROCESS, THIS CONTRACT, IF AWARDED TO PACIFIC TOXICOLOGY,
21 WILL LIKELY BE CONSIDERED NULL AND VOID BY A REVIEWING COURT.
22 THANK YOU.

23

24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. MR. PREVEN?

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **ERIC PREVEN:** IT'S ERIC PREVEN, RESIDENT FROM THE THIRD
2 DISTRICT. THAT IS OF SOME CONCERN. THIS IS WHY THE BOARD
3 PREFERS WHENEVER POSSIBLE TO NOT HAVE COMPETITIVE BIDDING,
4 UNFORTUNATELY, BECAUSE WHEN YOU DO HAVE COMPETITIVE BIDDING,
5 YOU HAVE TO DEFEND THAT KIND OF ACTION. YOU KNOW, TODAY
6 SUPERVISOR FROM THE SECOND DISTRICT WAS VERY ARTICULATE ABOUT
7 PREVENTING PEOPLE FROM BEING RIPPED OFF AND I APPRECIATED
8 THAT. THIS WAS INVOLVED WITH THE WAGE THEFT. THE WAGE THEFT
9 ITEM THAT GOT A LOT OF TRACTION TODAY. IN CONNECTION WITH
10 THAT, ITEM 7 IS CENTRAL PLAZA L.L.C. WHERE YOU HAVE TO GO TO
11 THE VERY BACK PAGE TO SEE IT IS THE JAMISON GROUP WHO IS A
12 TRUSTED COUNTY PARTNER. BUT WE HAVE A ROBUST AMOUNT OF
13 BUSINESS, RENTING OFFICE SPACE FROM JAMISON. AND SO I WOULD
14 JUST ASK IF BEFORE YOU APPROVE THIS ITEM TO CAREFULLY
15 BENCHMARK TO SEE THAT WE ARE SQUEEZING THEM AS MUCH AS WE CAN.
16 I THINK YOU REMEMBER BEFORE SALADINO STEPPED OFF AND THE GREAT
17 WICKHAM TOOK THE COUNTY COUNSEL CHAIR, WE HAD A SIMILAR ITEM
18 WHERE THEY WERE BULKING UP ON THE JAMISON OFFICE SPACE FOR
19 COUNTY COUNSEL. SO I WOULD REALLY ASK THAT YOU LOOK LONG AND
20 HARD TO SEE IF WE'RE GETTING REALLY A FAVORABLE DEAL. THEY
21 HAVE AN ENORMOUS AMOUNT OF BUSINESS WITH THE COUNTY. AND THEY
22 SHOULD MAKE IT VERY CLEAR. ITEM NO. 27 IS SUPERVISOR KNABE'S
23 AREA. IT'S THE MARINA CAPITAL OUTLAY FUND. THE CUMULATIVE
24 CAPITAL OUTLAY FUND. THERE'S ABOUT \$20 MILLION REMAINING IN
25 THAT FUND. THIS IS FOR \$6 MILLION IF I GOT IT CORRECT TO REDO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE BOAT HOUSE. THE BOAT HOUSE IS A CUTE LITTLE STRUCTURE BUT
2 A \$6 MILLION RENOVATION OF THAT BUILDING IS FULLY OFF THE
3 CHARTS. I CANNOT IMAGINE WHY IT SHOULD COST THAT MUCH MONEY TO
4 FIX UP A PLACE LIKE THAT. I WOULD ASK THAT YOU LOOK LONG AND
5 HARD BEFORE YOU APPROVE THAT. ITEM NO. 25 IS AN EXAMPLE OF WHY
6 WE DON'T DO COMPETITIVE BIDDING. WE HAVE PANELS OF GROUPS. SO
7 JOHNSON FEIN WILL BE TAKING A MILLION BUCKS TO HELP OUT ON A
8 PROJECT BECAUSE WE SIGNED UP WITH THEM EARLIER WITH PUBLIC
9 WORKS. ITEM NO. 35 IS A THANK YOU, CITY OF PARAMOUNT. THOUGH
10 THEY HAVE BUDGETARY CONCERNS OF THEIR OWN, THEY JUST HAD 100
11 PLUS THOUSAND SURPLUS AT THE END OF THEIR FISCAL YEAR, BUT
12 NONETHELESS THEY CAME UP WITH \$11,222 FOR A HYUNDAI A.T.V. I
13 APPRECIATE THEM DISCLOSING THAT APPROPRIATELY. I THINK THE
14 PRICE IS AMBITIOUS. ITEM NO. 34 IS THE GREAT V.A.N.I.R. WHO
15 HAVE BEEN CARRYING WATER FOR YOUR JAIL PROGRAM. AND HERE WE
16 ARE REWARDING THEM WITH A \$6.25 MILLION SHERIFF'S FACILITIES
17 SPECIALISTS CONSULTATION. THERE'S NOT EVEN A CLEAR ASSESSMENT
18 OF WHAT THEY'RE GOING TO BE DOING. I MEAN, WELL DONE. TODAY AT
19 ITEM NO. 39 YOU'RE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT THE BINGO CODE. AND
20 I'M VERY EMBARRASSED. THE THIRD DISTRICT HAS VERY LITTLE
21 BINGO. SO I WOULD RECOMMEND THAT SUSAN NISSMAN BE BROUGHT BACK
22 TO BE THE BINGO COORDINATOR FOR THE THIRD DISTRICT BECAUSE SHE
23 COULD CERTAINLY HELP US AT LEAST PUT UP ONE REASONABLE BINGO
24 FACILITY IN THE THIRD DISTRICT THAT WOULD BE LICENSED BY
25 SUPERVISOR KNABE'S TEAM. ITEM NO. 36, LET'S GET ESTABROOK DOWN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HERE ALREADY. WE NEED TO REVIEW THESE LIABILITIES. I THINK IN
2 ONE MONTH WE HAVE SEEN \$30 MILLION OUT THE DOOR, SIR, YOU GOT
3 TO BRING HIM DOWN HERE AND HAVE HIM REPORT. ITEM 11 IS XEROX,
4 THE GREAT XEROX PEOPLE WHO ARE CITING THE COUNTY RESIDENTS
5 REGULARLY BUT THEY ALSO ARE LOOKING OUT FOR THE EMPLOYEES
6 HEALTHCARE BENEFITS. (OFF MIC). (COUGHING).

7

8 **DR. GENEVIEVE CLAVREUL:** GOOD AFTERNOON, BOARD OF SUPERVISORS,
9 DR. GENEVIEVE CLAVREUL. I'M GOING TO FOCUS ON ACTUALLY MY
10 PRACTICE BECAUSE OF COURSE HEALTHCARE IS MY CLAIM TO FAME. WE
11 ARE LOOKING INTO TWO LAWSUITS HAVING TO DO WITH MALPRACTICE.
12 THAT IS OF CONCERN TO ME WHEN ITEM 21, WE HAVE THAT SPECIAL
13 ARRANGEMENT WITH S.E.I.U. BUT WE DON'T CALL IT S.E.I.U. WE
14 CALL IT FOR WORK DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM WHERE WE ARE PAYING EVERY
15 YEAR. AND ON THIS ITEM, IT IS VERY PUZZLING BECAUSE YOU HAVE
16 DECEMBER 1, 2015 TO JUNE 2016 WITH ONLY A SIX-MONTH PERIOD OF
17 TIME, BUT YOU ARE GIVING THE PRICE OF AN OBLIGATION OF
18 \$800,000 OF THE \$2 MILLION. SO THAT'S PRETTY STEEP FOR SIX
19 MONTHS. ESPECIALLY IT'S VERY OBVIOUS THAT THAT NURSING
20 WORKFORCE ARE NOT DOING THEIR JOB BECAUSE WE HAVE A LOT OF
21 AREAS THE NURSES ARE NOT APPROPRIATELY TRAINED. AND OF COURSE
22 AS USUAL WE HAVE CONFLICT OF INTEREST. WE HAVE THE PERSON WHO
23 IS IN CHARGE OF THAT PROGRAM, A DIANE FATTO, WHO IS NOT ONLY A
24 MEMBER OF THE S.E.I.U. BUT THE HEAD OF THAT PROJECT AND SHE'S
25 ALSO A COMMISSIONER AT THE HOSPITAL COMMISSION. SHE SHOULD NOT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 BE ON THAT COMMISSION. SHE HAS NO PLACE. THAT'S CONFLICT OF
2 INTEREST. SHE'S LOOKING AT REVIEWING PROBLEM HAVING TO DO WITH
3 THE PROGRAMS SHE DELIVERS. THAT'S ABSURD, BUT OF COURSE,
4 THINGS WE ARE VERY GOOD AT DOING HERE. WE HAVE A COUPLE OF
5 CONTRACTS HAVING TO DO WITH OLIVE VIEW, CAMPUS MASTER, M.L.K.
6 AND THE WAY IT IS WORDED, IT LOOKS LIKE THOSE TWO CONTRACTS
7 WERE NOT SOLE VENDOR, BUT NOT IDENTIFIED AS SOLE VENDOR. AND
8 I'M SURPRISED THE NAME OF THE VENDOR IS GIVEN HERE WITH NO
9 PREVIOUS R.F.P. OR WHATEVER. ON C.S.-1 I'M SURPRISED THAT
10 YOU'RE GOING TO CLOSED SESSION BECAUSE IT'S HAVING TO DO ABOUT
11 NURSING CALL. THERE IS NO EXPLANATION WHY IT'S GOING. AND
12 C.S.-4 WITH I THINK IT'S C.S.-4, YES, C.S.-4 HAVING TO DO WITH
13 LOOKING AT THE POTENTIAL HEAD FOR THAT ILLEGAL HEALTH
14 INTEGRATION PROJECT. BECAUSE YOU ARE DEFINITELY NOT-- DONE
15 VIOLATING THE BROWN ACT. SO I SEE WAITING FOR THE D.A. TO
16 RESPOND TO THE COMPLAINT. IT TOOK TWO MONTHS TO NOT SAYING
17 ANYTHING, MAKING VERY CLEAR TO ME IT WAS IN VIOLATION. THANK
18 YOU.

19

20 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** ITEM 7, 10, 11, 16,
21 21, 22, 24, 25, 34, 36, 37, 39, 45 AND 46 ARE BEFORE YOU.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MOTION BY HILDA SOLIS. SECOND WITHOUT
24 OBJECTION. SO ORDERED. SUPERVISOR SHEILA KUEHL.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** I DID SUPPORT 16 BUT I WANTED TO SAY
2 BECAUSE WE HAD SOME QUESTION RAISED BY AN UNSUCCESSFUL BIDDER,
3 WHICH IS ALWAYS APPROPRIATE IN COMMENT HERE, BUT IN THE
4 PROTEST PROCESS, THE INDEPENDENT REVIEW I THINK WAS CONDUCTED
5 BY A PERSON FROM AUDITOR-CONTROLLER. AND THOUGH HE "FOUND
6 MERIT", AND I PUT THAT IN QUOTES, TO THE FACT THAT THE THIRD
7 AUDITED FINANCIAL STATEMENT WAS NOT PROVIDED, HE WENT ON TO
8 RECOMMEND THAT UNDER THE RULES, IT MEANT THAT D.C.F.S. SHOULD
9 EVALUATE WHAT EFFECT THE EXCLUDED COSTS WOULD HAVE HAD ON THE
10 BILLING RATE TO DETERMINE IF THAT WOULD HAVE AFFECTED THE
11 OUTCOME. AND THEY DID SOME ANALYSIS AND CONCLUDED THAT IN
12 LIGHT OF THE SIZE AND SCOPE OF THE CONTRACT, IT WOULD NOT HAVE
13 ACTUALLY AFFECTED PAC. TOX'S BID. AND SO THE COUNTY HAS THE
14 ABILITY TO WAIVE WHAT IT CONSIDERS INCONSEQUENTIAL DISPARITIES
15 IN A BID. AND SO IN ADDITION, THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF
16 SOCIAL SERVICES RULES APPLY. AND SO IT SEEMS TO ME THAT WHAT
17 WAS DONE IN TERMS OF THE PROTEST WAS APPROPRIATE. AND I DON'T
18 TALK ABOUT WHERE THEY ALL WEIGHED, BUT I THINK THAT SINCE IT
19 WAS RAISED, I JUST SAY THAT I FEEL THAT THE EVALUATION WAS
20 APPROPRIATE AND THE AWARDING OF THE CONTRACT IS ALSO
21 APPROPRIATE.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** LET ME CALL IRENE PANG. LEONARD ROSE.
24 JOSE MARTINEZ. DANNY CRUZ. MR. ROSE?

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **LEONARD ROSE:** MY NAME IS LEONARD ROSE. I'M HERE TO TALK ABOUT
2 [INAUDIBLE]. I'VE GOT SIX SENTENCE AND IT SAYS CLEAR ALL
3 FLOOD, SEWER, DRAIN AND CONTROL [INAUDIBLE] DAMS, STREETS AND
4 HIGHWAYS AND LIKE ORANGE COUNTY GOT PREPARED FOR THE NINO. AND
5 THE 88 CITY CALL AND COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS DISTRICT 1
6 THROUGH 5 WORKING TOGETHER AS SAFETY DRILL, PUBLIC SCHOOL,
7 BUSINESS AREA, HAVE A WORK PROGRAM FOR WHEN A [INAUDIBLE]
8 WOULD COME. THEN THE BOARD EDUCATION NEWS ON T.V. FLYER WHAT
9 DO TO PREPARE A FIRE AND PUBLIC PARK, AND FIVE RUNNING STORM,
10 LIGHTING, WINTER, SPRING, DRINKING WATER WILL BE FULL AND
11 LAKES AND RIVER LIKE 1970 ONE MONTH RAIN OR OFF AND ON AND AT
12 SIX, A WARNING SIGN, EMERGENCY BROADCAST ALERT ON T.V., RADIO
13 STATIONS AND [INAUDIBLE] STORM CALL TEST, AND HAVE A VERY
14 LARGE TEST AND HAVE ANGEL PROTECT US AND PRAY TO GOD THAT
15 NOBODY NOT GET HURT AND HARM LIKE PSALM 91, VERSE 11 AND 12,
16 HOW ANGEL PROTECT US AND MAKE A COPY FOR THESE PEOPLE AND BE
17 CAREFUL WITH LIGHTNING STRIKING UP COMING UP THIS YEAR. THANK
18 YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

19

20 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MR. ROSE. LET ME ALSO CALL
21 UP SHELIAH WARD AND ERIC PREVEN. MISS PANG.

22

23 **IRENE PANG:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS IRENE. MY FAMILY MEMBER
24 AND I ARE WORKING TEAMS FOR THE U.S. ECONOMY AND OTHER
25 INFORMATION OF U.S. GOVERNMENT PERSON. BASIC ON I OR MY FAMILY

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 MEMBERS, THE CONDITION MORE ABOUT THE DIFFICULTY AND THE
2 PROBLEM OF OUR NATION U.S. THAT IS WHY WE WANT HELP AND WANT
3 TO SETTLE THE DIFFICULTY FOR U.S. I BELIEVE SINCE SIX MONTHS,
4 1776 U.S. PROCESS OF INDEPENDENCE, 229 YEARS THERE HAVE BEEN
5 HAD ANOTHER MEETING TO PRESENT TIME. SPECIAL, IF IN THE EAST,
6 THE 50, THE 60 YEARS. U.S. NATION KNOWS A LOT OF MONEY IN THE
7 BANK AND BIG BUSINESS HAVE BEEN CONNECT. EVEN THE FAMILY HOME
8 HOUSE. IN U.S. THE MINIMUM WORK THAT YOU MOVE OUT FROM FROM
9 THE NAME OF U.S. BUT WE, MY FAMILY MEMBER AND I, WORK HARD
10 [INAUDIBLE] TO STOP THE CONNECTION, CONTINUE AND CONFIRM THE
11 [INAUDIBLE] WORK BAN ON THE NAME OF U.S. WE ARE THE POWER OF
12 THE U.S. GOVERNMENT'S STRUCTURE TO PROTECT U.S. NATION IN ALL
13 THEIR PROPERTY EVEN THOUGH THE ECONOMY TO ALL. [INAUDIBLE] THE
14 NATION LOST ALL AND THE LIVING IN VERY DIFFICULT CONDITIONS.

15

16 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. XIE NI. MR. PREVEN? XIE NI.
17 OKAY. MR. PREVEN?

18

19 **ERIC PREVEN:** YES, IT'S MR. PREVEN. OKAY. THANK YOU, MISS PANG.
20 THANK YOU, MAYOR. IT IS ERIC PREVEN FROM THIRD DISTRICT. I'M
21 HAVING A COMPETING-- OKAY, FINE. I MUST SAY, URIBE, YOU ARE
22 DOING A FANTASTIC JOB, BUT I WILL SAY THAT READING IN THE
23 HEARING RULES HAS GOTTEN UNDER MY SKIN A LITTLE BIT. IF WE ARE
24 GOING TO DO THAT, IT NEEDS TO BE AGENDIZED SO THAT THEN THE
25 PUBLIC CAN GIVE THEIR COMMENT, WHICH IS, THE SUPERVISORS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 SHOULD ALSO BEHAVE APPROPRIATELY AND RESPECTFULLY AND SO ON
2 AND SO FORTH. THERE ARE OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO'VE
3 RAISED IT. THERE'S NOTHING WAY WITH THE WAY SHE READS IT.
4 FANTASTIC. I KNOW WHAT YOU'RE TRYING TO DO.

5

6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** I KNOW MR. SACHS.

7

8 **ERIC PREVEN:** MR. SACHS IS NOT HERE TODAY AND NO DIALOGUE WITH
9 CONSTITUENTS, REMEMBER? YOU DID A GOOD JOB OF ALMOST
10 DISTRACTING ME BUT I'M GOING TO BE OKAY. THAT IS TODAY, AT THE
11 PUBLIC HEARING ON THE WINE ISSUE, JUST CONTROVERSIAL, FRANKLY,
12 BUT IT WAS APPROVED. AS I WALKED OUT TO MY SEAT, A PERKY
13 LITTLE CHARACTER TURNED TO ME AND SAID, "YOU BLEEPING IDIOT. I
14 RETIRED." TO WHICH I RESPONDED, FIRST OF ALL, WHO DO YOU THINK
15 YOU'RE SPEAKING TO, YOU CAN'T USE THAT LANGUAGE HERE IN A
16 MEETING, NUMBER ONE. NUMBER TWO, IT'S RUDE, AND I'M SORRY, I
17 DIDN'T KNOW THAT YOU HAD RETIRED MISS NISSMAN, BUT IT WAS
18 REALLY VERY UNSAVORY. IT'S BENEATH WHAT WE EXPECT HERE AT THE
19 BOARD MEETING. THERE'S A LOT OF CONTROVERSY OUT HERE. I THINK
20 PEOPLE DISAGREE, THEY GET ANGRY WITH ONE ANOTHER BUT I'M
21 ALWAYS TRYING, STRUGGLING TO BE AT LEAST CIVIL. SHE WORKED AT
22 THIS COUNTY FOR 20 PLUS YEARS. AND IT'S A REAL SHAME. I KNOW
23 THAT, YOU KNOW,, SHE SHOULDN'T BE DOING THAT. AND I WOULD ASK
24 THE BOARD TO REPRIMAND HER BUT OF COURSE YOU HAVE NO AUTHORITY
25 OVER HER, SHE'S A CITIZEN. I MEAN, YOU COULD SEND THE SHERIFFS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 OUT, BUT THAT'S NOT GOING TO HAPPEN. LET'S NOT KID OURSELVES.
2 WITH THAT I WOULD TURN TO WICKHAM, AND SAY, MISS WICKHAM, I
3 APPRECIATE YOU TALKING TO C.E.O. BUT WE HAVE AN ISSUE WITH
4 SOME OF THE SIGNATURES ON COUNTY AGREEMENTS. AND WHEN IT'S
5 COMPLETELY UNCLEAR AS TO WHAT WAS SIGNED, I DO THINK IT'S
6 IMPORTANT THAT YOU COMPLY AND DISCLOSE WHAT THEY ACTUALLY PUT
7 DOWN WITH THEIR PEN.

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-
10 THOMAS, DO YOU HAVE ANY ADJOURNMENT MOTIONS?

11

12 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** MR. MAYOR AND COLLEAGUES, WOULD YOU JOIN
13 ME IN ADJOURNING IN MEMORY OF INNETTE MARIE WEASEL, BORN ON
14 OCTOBER 1, 1939 IN LAKE CHARLES, LOUISIANA AND PASSED ON
15 OCTOBER 31ST OF THIS YEAR AT THE AGE OF 76. SHE MOVED TO LOS
16 ANGELES AS A TEENAGER AND LIVED WITH HER OLDER SISTERS. SHE
17 WAS 50 YEARS OLD. SHE GRADUATED FROM EAST L.A COMMUNITY
18 COLLEGE WITH AN ASSOCIATE OF ARTS DEGREE IN LIBERAL STUDIES.
19 SHE WENT ON TO EARN A BACHELOR'S DEGREE FROM CAL STATE
20 UNIVERSITY AT DOMINGUEZ HILLS AS WELL AS A MASTER'S DEGREE IN
21 HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES FROM CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY OF
22 LONG BEACH. MISS WEASEL ATTENDED NURSING SCHOOL AND PURSUED A
23 CAREER AS A LICENSED VOCATIONAL NURSE, BEFORE WORKING AS AN
24 ELIGIBILITY WORKER AND AN ACCOUNTANT SUPERVISOR WITH THE
25 COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES, NOW KNOWN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AS THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SOCIAL SERVICES. IN ADDITION,
2 AFTER HAVING PREPARED MANY OF HER FAMILY MEMBERS AND FRIENDS,
3 THAT IS THEIR INCOME TAX FILINGS, SHE ESTABLISHED THE WEASEL'S
4 TAX SERVICE AND THE BUSINESS GREW TO SERVING OVER 200 CLIENTS
5 ANNUALLY. SHE WAS A FOUNDING MEMBER OF THE CONCERNED CITIZENS
6 OF COMPTON, COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION, A MEMBER OF THE
7 EMPOWERMENT CONGRESS HEALTH COMMITTEE, AND A FORMER TRUSTEE
8 WITH THE COMPTON CREEK MOSQUITO ABATEMENT DISTRICT. SHE WILL
9 BE REMEMBERED AS A STAUNCH ADVOCATE FOR IMPROVING THE QUALITY
10 OF LIFE IN THE COMMUNITIES OF EAST RANCHO DOMINGUEZ AND THE
11 CITY OF COMPTON. MISS WEASEL IS SURVIVED BY HER DAUGHTER
12 BILLIE, SON-IN-LAW TERENCE, GRANDDAUGHTER JASMINE AND A HOST
13 OF NIECES, NEPHEWS, COUSINS, FRIENDS AND MEMBERS OF THE EAST
14 RANCHO COMMUNITY AS WELL AS THE CITY OF COMPTON ALL OF WHOM
15 WILL MISS HER DEARLY. MR. MAYOR AND COLLEAGUES, INNETTE MARIE
16 WEASEL.

17
18 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SECOND WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.
19 SUPERVISOR KUEHL.

20
21 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR. I HAVE TWO
22 ADJOURNMENTS TODAY. FIRST I MOVE THAT WHEN WE ADJOURN TODAY,
23 WE ADJOURN IN MEMORY OF THOMAS LAMBERT, WHO WAS A TALENTED
24 ATTORNEY WITH KIND OF A WIDE-RANGING PORTFOLIO OF CLIENTS,
25 PROBABLY BEST KNOWN AS SENIOR LAWYER FOR PLAINTIFF FRED

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 GOLDMAN IN THE CIVIL SUIT AGAINST O.J. SIMPSON AFTER THE
2 CRIMINAL TRIAL WAS CONCLUDED. TOM ALSO REPRESENTED MANY
3 CORPORATE AND CELEBRITY CLIENTS, MOVIE PRODUCER DINO DE
4 LAURENTIS, BUT HE ALSO REPRESENTED OCCIDENTAL PETROLEUM WHEN
5 IT WAS SUED OVER DRILLING RIGHTS. SO HE WAS PROLIFIC IN HIS
6 REPRESENTATION. HE WAS BORN IN '46, GRADUATED FROM LOYOLA
7 UNIVERSITY AND U.C.L.A. LAW SCHOOL AND SURVIVED BY HIS WIFE
8 SUSAN AND HIS STEPDAUGHTER AMBER. I ALSO MOVE THAT WHEN WE
9 ADJOURN TODAY WE ADJOURN IN MEMORY OF SIDNEY GEORGE WHITE. HE
10 WAS A MAJOR FORCE IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE MEDICAL COMMUNITY
11 IN THE WEST SAN FERNANDO VALLEY. HE ATTENDED U.C.L.A., U.C.
12 BERKELEY AND U.C. SAN FRANCISCO MEDICAL SCHOOL. HE WAS A
13 LICENSED PHYSICIAN BY THE AGE OF 24. AS PART OF HIS MEDICAL
14 TRAINING, HE BECAME A HEMATOLOGY RESEARCHER. AND HE WAS CO-
15 DISCOVERER OF BLOOD FACTOR 9, WHICH WAS BASIC IN DISCOVERING
16 THE HEMOPHILIA B. DURING THE KOREAN WAR HE WAS A MAJOR IN THE
17 AIR FORCE. AFTER THE WAR, HE CONTINUED HIS LOVE FOR FLYING,
18 HELPING TO DEVELOP AND THEN PILOTING SUN DANCER, THEN THE
19 FASTEST BIKE LANE IN THE RENO AIR RACE HISTORY. THE PLANE IS
20 NOW PROPERTY AT THE SAN DIEGO AEROSPACE MUSEUM. HE WAS ALSO A
21 CONSULTANT FOR THE VOYAGER PRODUCT AND DEVELOPED THEIR OXYGEN
22 SYSTEM. HIS EQUIPMENT AND THE VOYAGER ARE HOUSED AT THE
23 SMITHSONIAN MUSEUM IN WASHINGTON, D.C. HE'S SURVIVED BY HIS
24 WIFE 34 YEARS MITZI, HIS SON GEOFFRY, NEAL, RORY, RUSH,

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 STEPCHILDREN STUART BLOCK AND JENNIFER BENNETT AND 9
2 GRANDCHILDREN. THANK YOU.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.
5 SUPERVISOR KNABE?

6

7 **SUP. KNABE:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR. A COUPLE OF ADJOURNMENTS, AS
8 WELL. FIRST OF ALL, THAT WE ADJOURN IN MEMORY OF GOOD FRIEND,
9 ANGEL CABRAL SR., WHO PASSED AWAY PEACEFULLY ON WEDNESDAY,
10 NOVEMBER 11TH AT THE AGE OF 75. ANGEL WAS A WELL KNOWN
11 RESIDENT OF UNINCORPORATED WHITTIER AND LOCAL BUSINESS OWNER
12 OF ANGEL'S TOW MOTOR REPAIR, KNOWN FOR HIS FORKLIFT SALES AND
13 OUTSTANDING SERVICE. HE OFTEN DONATED HIS TIME AND SERVICES TO
14 DIFFERENT ORGANIZATIONS, SUCH AS THE HEART OF COMPASSION, BOY
15 SCOUT TROOP 54, HISPANIC OUTREACH, THE WHITTIER OPTIMIST CLUB
16 AND VARIOUS OTHER CHARITIES. HE WAS VERY ACTIVE THROUGHOUT HIS
17 LIFETIME AND WAS DEDICATED TO IMPROVING HIS COMMUNITY. WAS A
18 TIRELESS ADVOCATE FOR BETTER QUALITY OF LIFE FOR LOCAL
19 RESIDENTS IN THE UNINCORPORATED AREA. HIS FATHER HELPED
20 MAYBERRY PARK BECOME A REALITY BY GRADING THE LAND AND
21 PLANTING OLIVE TREES THERE IN HIS YOUTH. SINCE THEN, ANGEL HAS
22 TAKEN AN ACTIVE ROLE IN SEEKING IMPROVEMENTS IN THE LOCAL PARK
23 COMMUNITY. HE LOVED TO TRAVEL, GO TO THE RACES, GO TO THE
24 CASINOS. HIS PASSION WAS HIS FAMILY AND DOING WHAT HE COULD TO
25 HELP OTHERS. ANGEL WAS BORN ON OCTOBER 1, 1940 IN LOS ANGELES,

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 WAS THE OLDEST OF FOUR CHILDREN. HE WAS BORN ON ALL SAINTS
2 DAY. HIS GRANDMOTHER DECIDED HE SHOULD BE NAMED ANGEL. HE MET
3 AND MARRIED DOLORES FROM PICO RIVERA, TO WHOM HE WAS MARRIED
4 51 YEARS. HE SURVIVED BY HIS BEAUTIFUL WIFE SIX CHILDREN,
5 CARMEN, MICHELLE, ANGEL, STELLA, JAMIE AND JAMES, 8
6 GRANDCHILDREN AND ONE GREAT GRANDCHILD. HE ALSO LEAVES BEHIND
7 TWO SISTERS, DINGO, A WONDERFUL MEMBER OF OUR LOS ANGELES
8 COUNTY PARKS AND RECREATION AND STELLA. HE WILL BE DEARLY
9 MISSED BY THOSE WHO KNEW AND LOVED HIM. GREAT GUY AND GREAT
10 COMPASSIONATE SUPPORTER OF THE UNINCORPORATED AREAS. ALSO WE
11 ADJOURN IN MEMORY OF A GOOD FRIEND, DR. STAN YUSHIRA, A
12 LONGTIME FRIEND WHO PASSED AWAY ON NOVEMBER 14TH. HE WILL BE
13 MISSED BY HIS FAMILY AND FRIENDS. HE WAS VERY ACTIVE IN THE
14 OPTIMIST CLUB OVER THE YEARS AND THE JAPANESE AMERICAN
15 COMMUNITY. OUR THOUGHTS AND PRAYERS ARE WITH HIS FAMILY. THANK
16 YOU.

17

18 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SECOND WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.
19 I'M GOING TO JOIN THE SUPERVISOR HILDA SOLIS ON NOHEMI
20 GONZALEZ WHO WAS TRAGICALLY KILLED IN THAT TERRORIST RADICAL
21 ISLAMIC ATTACK IN PARIS. AND SHE WILL READ A LITTLE MORE ABOUT
22 HER. AND ALSO THAT WE ADJOURN IN MEMORY OF THE VICTIMS. I KNOW
23 THERE ARE 129 VICTIMS. THERE MAY BE MORE BECAUSE SOME MAY NOT
24 SURVIVE THE HOSPITALIZATION FROM THE NOVEMBER 13TH ATTACK.
25 ALSO TRAGICALLY, MY DEPUTY'S CLASSMATES FRIEND, A FRESHMAN AT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 NOTRE DAME HIGH SCHOOL, TRAGICALLY PASSED AWAY TODAY AT THE
2 AGE OF 14 FROM A SEIZURE. NIKKI VALDEZ. SHE WAS A MEMBER OF
3 THE CLASS OF 2019 AND WAS A DEDICATED PLAYER ON HER SCHOOL'S
4 BASKETBALL TEAM AND SHE IS SURVIVED BY HER PARENTS AND
5 BROTHER. A GOOD FRIEND I SERVED WITH IN THE STATE LEGISLATURE
6 AND LATER SUPERVISOR, I WORKED WITH HIM ON ISSUES IN THE
7 ANTELOPE VALLEY, AND THAT WAS FORMER ASSEMBLYMAN, FORMER MAYOR
8 LARRY CHIMBOLE, WHO DIED AT THE AGE OF 96. HE SERVED AS A
9 RADIO OPERATOR ON A B-29 AIRPLANE DURING WORLD WAR II. HE
10 SETTLED IN CALIFORNIA AFTER THE WAR. AS A BUSINESS OWNER, HE
11 WAS ONE OF THE 50 GRAND MEN WHO LED THE THE INCORPORATION IN
12 THE CITY OF PALMDALE AND THE PALMDALE CULTURAL CENTER IS NAMED
13 FOR HIM AND A STATUE IN HIS LIKENESS WAS UNVEILED THERE LAST
14 MONTH AND HE IS SURVIVED BY HIS CHILDREN, STEVEN AND PATTY AND
15 FIVE GRANDCHILDREN AND SIX GREAT GRANDCHILDREN. RETIRED JUDGE
16 JAMES N. REESE, LONGTIME ARBITRATOR, PASSED AWAY AT THE AGE OF
17 96. HE SERVED AS ONE OF THE FEW AFRICAN-AMERICAN OFFICERS IN
18 THE UNITED STATES ARMY DURING WORLD WAR II. HE ATTENDED THE
19 U.S.C. SCHOOL OF LAW, BECAME THE FIRST AFRICAN-AMERICAN LOS
20 ANGELES COUNTY SUPERIOR COURT COMMISSIONER IN 1970. LATER
21 SERVED AS A JUDGE FOR BOTH LOS ANGELES CITY MUNICIPAL COURT
22 AND THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY SUPERIOR COURT FOR 20 YEARS. HE
23 JOINED THE JUDICIAL ARBITRATION MEDIATION SERVICES, J.A.M.S.,
24 IN 1989, AFTER RETIRING FROM THE BENCH AND RESOLVED OVER 1,000
25 CASES AS A MEDIATOR, INCLUDING A \$1,000 DONATION TO THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 U.S.C.'S SCHOOL OF LAW TO FUND A LITERACY PROJECT FOR LOCAL
2 YOUTH. HE'S SURVIVED BY HIS WIFE, FOUR CHILDREN, THREE
3 GRANDCHILDREN AND THREE GREAT GRANDCHILDREN. WILEY HARRIET
4 RANDOLPH PASSED AWAY AT THE AGE OF 93. ACTIVE LONG TIME
5 RESIDENT OF ANTELOPE VALLEY. SHE WAS INTERNED IN THE JAPANESE
6 PRISON CAMP FOR 2-1/2 YEARS DURING WORLD WAR II, YET SHE
7 MANAGED TO ALWAYS BE FULL OF KINDNESS. SHE'S SURVIVED BY HER
8 CHILDREN, 10 GRANDCHILDREN AND 20 GREAT GRANDCHILDREN. JANET
9 LOWE, LONG TIME RESIDENT OF THE ANTELOPE VALLEY, SHE WAS A
10 FIELD REPRESENTATIVE FOR SENATOR PETE KNIGHT AND LATER
11 ASSEMBLY MEMBER PHILIP WYMAN. SHE PASSED AWAY AT THE AGE OF
12 64. ROSE MARIE CORDARO, MOTHER-IN-LAW OF L.A. COUNTY DIRECTOR
13 PARKS AND RECREATION ACTING DIRECTOR, JOHN WICKER WHO PASSED
14 AWAY AT THE AGE OF 95. PUT ALL MEMBERS ON THAT. SHE WAS A
15 DEDICATED HOMEMAKER, WIFE AND MOTHER TO HER SIX CHILDREN.
16 ANNIE LIN, LONGTIME EMPLOYEE LOS ANGELES COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF
17 REGIONAL PLANNING PASSED AWAY AT THE AGE OF 40. SHE WAS HIRED
18 IN 1999 AS AN REGIONAL PLANNING ASSISTANT AND PROMPTLY
19 PROMOTED TO PRINCIPAL REGIONAL PLANNING ASSISTANT. SHE OVERSAW
20 NUMEROUS PROJECTS, INCLUDING THE RIVER VILLAGE TRACK, THE
21 FIRST NEWHALL RANCH PROJECT, PICO CANYON AREA AND THE VAL
22 VERDE RANCH DEVELOPMENT. SHE WAS AGAIN PROMOTED TO SUPERVISING
23 REGIONAL PLANNER WITH THE RESPONSIBILITY OF OVERSEEING NINE
24 FIELD OFFICES WHERE SHE IS SURVIVED BY HER MOTHER, MEI WA LIN.
25 PHYLLIS KIRST, LONGTIME RESIDENT OF GLENDALE, SHE WAS AN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ACTIVE MEMBER OF THE CARNATION CHURCH A MEMBER OF THE THIRD
2 ORDER OF ST. DOMINIC. SHE WAS DEDICATED MUCH OF HER LIFE
3 WORKING TOWARDS THE CANONIZATION OF SAINT KATERI TEKAKWITHA.
4 SHE IS SURVIVED BY HER EIGHT CHILDREN, 15 GRANDCHILDREN AND 21
5 GREAT GRANDCHILDREN. DONALD HANLEY FROM ANTELOPE VALLEY,
6 PASSED AWAY AT THE AGE OF 81, SERVED 20 YEARS IN THE UNITED
7 STATES MARINE CORPS IN BOTH THE KOREAN AND VIETNAM WARS AND
8 WAS A VOLUNTEER WITH THE SALVATION ARMY AND SPECIAL OLYMPICS.
9 GENE BRECKNER, LONGTIME RESIDENT OF ANTELOPE VALLEY PASSED
10 AWAY AT THE AGE OF 66. PHOTOGRAPHER FROM THE "ANTELOPE VALLEY
11 PRESS" FOR 30 YEARS AND HE RETIRED AS THE PHOTO EDITOR. ELAINE
12 ARCAN OF ARCADIA. SHE WAS A PERMANENT MEMBER OF THE PERMANENT
13 BOARD OF THE BLIND CHILDREN'S CENTER AND VOLUNTEERED AT THE
14 U.S.C. PACIFIC ASIA MUSEUM AND THE PASADENA ART MUSEUM. SHE
15 PASSED AWAY AT THE AGE OF 84. GENE AMDAHL, CHIEF ARCHITECT OF
16 I.B.M.'S MAINFRAME COMPUTERS AND FOUNDER OF AMDAHL COMPUTER
17 CORPORATION, PASSED AWAY AT THE AGE OF 92. HE RECEIVED HIS
18 DOCTORATE IN THEORETICAL PHYSICS FROM THE UNIVERSITY OF
19 WISCONSIN AND HE DESIGNED A SERIES OF REVOLUTIONARY MAINFRAME
20 COMPUTERS KNOWN AS THE SYSTEM 360. THOMAS SELLARS ALLSTON,
21 LONGTIME RESIDENT OF SANTA CLARITA VALLEY, SERVED IN THE
22 UNITED STATES ARMY DURING THE KOREAN WAR AND POLICE OFFICER OF
23 THE BEVERLY HILLS POLICE DEPARTMENT. WAS ACTIVE MEMBER OF THE
24 PRAYER ANGELS FOR THE MILITARY ORGANIZATION. SISTER MARGARET
25 REILLY. SISTER OF ST. JOSEPH'S OF CARONDELET, PASSED AWAY AT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE AGE OF 87. SHE SPENT 36 YEARS TEACHING IN CATHOLIC AND
2 ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS THROUGHOUT SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA AND ALSO
3 SERVED IN SAN JOSE AND DENVER BEFORE RETIRING IN 2001.
4 SURVIVED BY HER SISTER-IN-LAW, NIECE AND MANY COUSINS. JUAN
5 CASTILLO TORO PASSED AWAY AT THE AGE OF 83. HE IS SURVIVED BY
6 HIS WIFE LILLIAN AND THEIR CHILDREN AND NINE GRANDCHILDREN.
7 SECONDED BY SUPERVISOR KUEHL WITHOUT OBJECTION SO ORDERED.
8 SUPERVISOR HILDA SOLIS.

9

10 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR, IT IS WITH GREAT
11 SORROW THAT I MOVE THIS ITEM THAT WE ADJOURN IN MEMORY OF
12 NOHEMI GONZALEZ. SHE WAS THE FIRST CASUALTY THAT WE HEARD OF
13 IN TERMS OF BEING A U.S. CITIZEN THAT WAS KILLED IN FRANCE,
14 PARIS, FRANCE. WHILE I DIDN'T KNOW HER. I KNOW THAT SUPERVISOR
15 KNABE ALSO SHARES THIS PAIN AND SORROW. SHE SPENT MOST OF HER
16 LIVING LIFE, I THINK, IN THE CITY OF WHITTIER, GRADUATED FROM
17 WHITTIER HIGH SCHOOL AND ATTENDED CAL STATE LONG BEACH. HER
18 PARENTS LIVE IN THE CITY OF EL MONTE WHERE I LIVE, NOT TOO FAR
19 AWAY. SHE WAS KNOWN TO HER FRIENDS AS MIMI, SHE WAS BORN ON
20 OCTOBER 19, 1992 AND PASSED AWAY ON NOVEMBER 13, 2015 WHILE
21 SHE WAS STUDYING ABROAD IN FRANCE AT THE STRATE SCHOOL OF
22 DESIGN. SHE WAS RAISED IN WHITTIER, CALIFORNIA, THEN MOVED
23 WITH HER FAMILY TO EL MONTE, CALIFORNIA. SHE GRADUATED FROM
24 WHITTIER HIGH SCHOOL WHERE SHE PARTICIPATED ON THE TRACK TEAM
25 AS A SENIOR AT CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY OF LONG BEACH. SHE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 WAS WORKING TOWARDS A DEGREE IN INDUSTRIAL DESIGN. SHE WORKED
2 AS A TEACHING ASSISTANT IN THE DESIGN DEPARTMENT, THE SHOP
3 TECHNICIAN WHO ASSISTED OTHER STUDENTS, AND AT ONE POINT
4 WORKED IN RETAIL AT THE ARMANI EXCHANGE IN CERRITOS. SHE WAS A
5 MEMBER OF A TEAM THAT RECENTLY TOOK SECOND PLACE IN THE
6 INTERNATIONAL BIOMIMICRY GLOBAL DESIGN CHALLENGE FOR
7 INNOVATIVE BIODEGRADABLE INVENTION. SHE WAS KNOWN AS A
8 RELIABLE, GENEROUS AND SWEET FRIEND AND WILL BE REMEMBERED FOR
9 HER DRIVE AND INDEPENDENT SPIRIT. SHE'S SURVIVED BY HER MOTHER
10 BEATRIZ, HER FATHER NOE, HER STEPFATHER JOSE AND A HOST OF
11 EXTENDED FAMILY MEMBERS AND FRIENDS WHO WILL MISS HER DEARLY.
12 TOMORROW NIGHT AT THE CITY OF EL MONTE, CITY HALL AT 6 P.M.,
13 THEY WILL HAVE A CANDLELIGHT VIGIL IN HER MEMORY. AND I
14 BELIEVE THERE IS AN EVENT TONIGHT.

15

16 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** CITY HALL.

17

18 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** CITY HALL THIS EVENING AT 5:30 HERE IN LOS
19 ANGELES. TONIGHT THERE IS ALSO ANOTHER CEREMONY AT 6 P.M., I
20 BELIEVE AT WHITTIER HIGH SCHOOL IN WHITTIER. SO WE ALL I
21 BELIEVE WANT TO BE ON THIS AND SEND OUR CONDOLENCES TO THE
22 FAMILY AND TO THOSE INDIVIDUALS THAT LOST THEIR LIVES IN THAT
23 VERY TRAGIC FRIDAY.

24

25 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SECOND, WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **AVIANNA URIBE, ACTING ASS'T. EXEC. OFCR.:** IN ACCORDANCE WITH
3 BROWN ACT REQUIREMENTS, NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN THAT THE BOARD
4 OF SUPERVISORS WILL CONVENE IN CLOSED SESSION TO DISCUSS ITEM
5 NO. C.S.-1, CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL REGARDING EXISTING
6 LITIGATION. ITEM NO. C.S.-2, CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL
7 REGARDING SIGNIFICANT EXPOSURE TO LITIGATION, ITEM NO. C.S.-4,
8 PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT, CONSIDERATION OF CANDIDATES FOR APPOINTMENT
9 TO THE POSITION OF HEALTH AGENCY DIRECTOR. ITEM NO. C.S.-5
10 PERFORMANCE HEAD EVALUATIONS. ITEM NO. C.S.-6, CONFERENCE WITH
11 LABOR NEGOTIATOR SACHI A. HAMAI AND DESIGNATED STAFF, AND ITEM
12 NO. C.S.-7, PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT CONSIDERATION, CANDIDATES FOR
13 APPOINTMENT TO THE POSITION OF COUNTY COUNSEL AS INDICATED ON
14 THE POSTED AND SUPPLEMENTAL AGENDA.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 REPORT OF ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION NOVEMBER 17, 2015

2

3

4

5 CS-1. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION

6 (Paragraph (1) of Subdivision (d) Government Code Section

7 54956.9) SimplexGrinnell LP v. County of Los Angeles, et al.,

8 BC 565974 This lawsuit alleges breach of contract relating to

9 the installation of a nurse call system at Harbor-UCLA Medical

10 Center. (15-5372)

11

12 The Board authorized settlement of the matter entitled

13 SimplexGrinnell LP v. County of Los Angeles, et al. The

14 details of the settlement will be made available once

15 finalized by all parties. The vote of the Board was unanimous

16 with all Supervisors being present.

17

18 No reportable action was taken on items CS-2, CS-4, CS-5 or CS-

19 6. In Open Session, item CS-3 was continued one week to

20 November 24, 2015.

21

22 CS-7. PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT (Government Code Section 54957)

23 Consideration of candidate(s) for appointment to the position

24 of County Counsel. (15-2959) Pursuant to the memo dated

25 September 30, 2015, entitled Report on Appointment of County

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 Officers and Department Heads Who Report to the Board of
2 Supervisors and the provisions of the County Code, the Board
3 has selected Mary C. Wickham as the candidate for the position
4 of County Counsel for the County of Los Angeles. The Board
5 also instructed the Chief Executive Officer to negotiate an
6 annual salary and other contractual provisions and to return
7 to the Board in open session on November 24, 2015, for final
8 action on the appointment, and to execute an at-will
9 employment contract which is approved as to form by the County
10 Counsel. The vote of the Board was unanimous with all
11 Supervisors present.

12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 I, JENNIFER A. HINES, Certified Shorthand Reporter Number
2 6029/RPR/CRR qualified in and for the State of California, do
3 hereby certify:

4 That the transcripts of proceedings recorded by the Los
5 Angeles County Board of Supervisors November 17, 2015,
6 were thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my
7 direction and supervision;

8 That the transcript of recorded proceedings as archived
9 in the office of the reporter and which have been provided to
10 the Los Angeles County Board of Supervisors as certified by
11 me.

12 I further certify that I am neither counsel for, nor
13 related to any party to the said action; nor
14 in anywise interested in the outcome thereof.

15 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this
16 23rd day of November 2015, for the County records to be used
17 only for authentication purposes of duly certified transcripts
18 as on file of the office of the reporter.

19

20 JENNIFER A. HINES

21 CSR No. 6029/RPR/CRR

22