

# SHERIFF CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION BUSINESS MEETING ST. ANNE'S CONFERENCE CENTER Thursday, December 19, 2024



#### MEETING MINUTES

Attachment: Video

## Commissioners Present:

Chair Robert Bonner
Vice Chair Luis Garcia
Vice Chair, Hans Johnson
Arthur Calloway
Irma Hagans Cooper
James Harris
Sean Kennedy

## **Commissioners Absent:**

Patricia Giggans Jamon Hicks

# **Staff Present:**

Sharmaine Moseley, Executive Director Tracy Jordan, Principal Staff Analyst Starlet Atkins, Management Secretary Robert Flores, Community Svcs. Coordinator Christina Villacorte, Communications Manager Joel Torrez, Staff Analyst Janssen Diaz, Sr. Deputy County Counsel

## I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME:

Chair Robert Bonner called the meeting to order at 9:08 a.m.

- II. PUBLIC COMMENT RULES: Commission staff member Tracy Jordan explained how the community can provide public comment on an item on the agenda during the meeting.
- III. ROLL CALL: Staff member Tracy Jordan conducted the roll call. The quorum requirement was met.

## IV. CONSENT CALENDAR:

Chair Bonner advised that the minutes from the November 21, 2024, meeting were not available and that they will be moved to the January 19, 2025, consent calendar for approval. Chair Bonner then moved to item V.

# V. COMMISSION/LASD REPORTS:

## 1. Chair's Report

(2:34) Chair Bonner advised that comments related to the 2024-25 Strategic Plan and Goals will be delayed to later in the meeting, and briefly commented on items 1B and 1C related to improving coordinating oversight of the jails and coordinating with the Office of Inspector General (OIG) regarding Citizen/Resident complaints. Chair Bonner advised that a meeting was held with Conditions of Confinement ad hoc members to address Sheriff Luna's concern with complying to overlapping requests from multiple oversight entities that oversee the jails.

Commented [BO1]: Are these minutes now complete?

Commented [SA2R1]: Yes, they're in the "S" drive

**Commented [BO3]:** Deferred to later in the meeting? Deferred to when?

Commented [SA4R3]: Later in the meeting

Chair Bonner reported on item 1B and advised that the Civilian Oversight Commission (COC) will coordinate better with OIG, Sybil Brand Commission (SBC) and County Counsel (CoCo) to avoid duplicated efforts. Chair went on to address item 1C and advised that he, along with Executive Director Sharmaine Moseley (ED) and IG Max Huntsman, met to discuss the current complaint process and concluded that the Complaints ad hoc committee will study the issue to determine the best practice. Chair Bonner called on IG Huntsman to comment.

(9:36) IG Huntsman expressed concern with the current Los Angeles Sheriff's Department (LASD) complaint process and investigations being conducted internally by LASD and provided a brief overview of the current process, and the lack of transparency by LASD regarding their investigation results. IG Huntsman commented about restrictions on the OIG's ability to provide confidential information to the COC.

#### 2. Executive Director's Report

(14:46) (ED) Moseley informed the Commission that she would report on 2024 Strategic Goals later in the meeting and briefly highlighted staff activities for the month of November. Ms. Moseley acknowledged Christina Villacorte as the new Communications Manager and a temporary employee, Joel Torrez. ED Moseley reported ongoing staff analyst vacancies and announced the reappointment of Commissioner Jamon Hicks. ED Moseley discussed improvements to internal operations and reported meeting with various stakeholders and Information Technology (IT) staff to discuss development of a complaint form and dashboard. Ms. Moseley reported that staff and Commissioners participated in various webinars and attended LASD Graduations. ED Moseley announced the next Town Hall meeting is scheduled for January 23, 2025, in East Los Angeles (ELA), to discuss LASD's response to public celebrations of the Los Angeles Dodgers World Series win in ELA and called on staff member Robert Flores to provide additional information about upcoming Town Halls.

(18:32) Mr. Flores confirmed the Town Hall meeting date and identified ED Moseley, Vice Chair Johnson, Vice Chair Garcia, and Community member Carlos Montes as the panelists. He advised that the February 2025 Town Hall meeting will be held in the Antelope Valley and that the date would be announced later.

(20:10) Ms. Moseley continued her report and advised that ongoing efforts are being made to develop a training curriculum for Commissioners and that staff is working with IT to develop an online complaint form and dashboard for the COC website. She reported working on a day-to-day-operations manual and anticipates completion in 2025. ED Moseley reported that the 2024 Annual report is delayed due to the Commission pivoting to drafting a calendar rather than fiscal year report. Ms. Moseley advised that the 2025 meeting schedule is attached to the agenda and provided an update on the status of the Commission's request to hold COC meetings at the Hall of Administration. She informed the Commission that COC meetings will continue to be held at St. Anne's until further notice. In closing, she briefly discussed the status on revisions to the 3.79 County code ordinance and anticipates feedback by the end of the year.

(26:41) Chair Bonner reminded the Commission of how imperative the changes to 3.79 are for effective oversight of LASD and requested CoCo to complete their review of the revisions, and to move them forward for the BOS to enact at the next BOS meeting.

(30:39) Chair Bonner also inquired about a draft of the annual report for the Governance ad hoc to review and requested a draft be provided to the Governance Ad Hoc during the first week of January.

#### 3. Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department

(32:45) Acting Chief Tania Plunkett introduced herself and provided the Commission with an update on LASD accomplishments. She reported that the Sheriff's department has achieved milestones in public safety, transparency, and community engagement, including a decrease in property and violent crime rates. Ms. Plunkett advised that ongoing efforts are being made by LASD to develop stronger, safer communities through collaboration, innovation, and accountability. Following the Sheriff's report, Chair Bonner called for Commissioner questions.

(37:26) Commissioner Kennedy inquired about incarcerated people missing court appearances or arriving to court late due to transportation issues. He also inquired about the number of buses available for court transportation.

(38:00) Acting Chief Plunkett advised LASD is working with justice partners and County agencies to rectify the issue. Ms. Plunkett advised she is unable to confirm the number of buses available and advised that the Office of Constitutional Policing (OCP) will provide that information at the next meeting.

(39:57) Commissioner Harris requested an update on the LASD's budget request for new buses and to provide information on what budgetary restraints have caused the delay for purchasing new buses.

(42:41) Chair Bonner requested a subject matter expert from LASD provide a report on LASD bus fleet and include information on the budget for purchasing new buses for court transportation at the Commission meeting in February.

(42:48) Commissioner Cooper requested clarification on property crime stats and if the number has declined.

(42:55) Chief Plunkett confirmed that property crimes have decreased and that she would request OCP to provide additional statistical information on property crimes at the next meeting.

Chair Bonner held public comments and moved to the motion to establish the Complaints ad hoc committee and advised that public comment on all items would follow.

# VI. NEW BUSINESS

# 1. Creation of new Complaints Ad Hoc Committee

(47:40) Chair Bonner briefly discussed LASD complaints and reminded the Commission about Commissioner Calloway's request to establish a Complaints Ad Hoc Committee because it is needed.

## **MOTION**

Chair Bonner stated the motion for the complaints ad hoc committee is for "the Chair of the Commission to form a new ad hoc committee to be called the Complaints Ad Hoc committee and select Commissioners less than a quorum to serve on this committee. The committee will review, study, analyze and evaluate the LASD policies, procedures and practices for handling external citizen/resident complaints relating to the conduct of Sheriff Department personnel as well as examine the practices of other law enforcement agencies regarding the handling of external complaints and recommend any changes in policies and procedures needed to improve the Sheriff's Department complaint process." The primary focus of the new Complaints Ad Hoc is to review processes for handling citizen/resident complaints holistically, and the current and

**Commented [B05]:** Did anyone follow up on this issue? Was this a request that was tracked during th meeting?

**Commented [SA6R5]:** I'm not sure who is assigned to do f/u on the items.

**Commented [BO7]:** Will this be for the February meeting?

**Commented [SA8R7]:** Yes, that was my understanding.

future roles of the OIG and COC in the overall process of addressing citizen complaints against the LASD. A secondary purpose of the Complaints Ad Hoc Committee will be to work with staff and the ED to develop procedures for logging and tracking citizen/resident complaints formerly submitted to the Commission. This committee will also work with staff to enhance messaging regarding the limitations of the Commission to acquire information regarding the status/and or disposition of complaints made to the Sheriff's Department. Vice Chair Hans Johnson made the motion to establish the Complaints Ad Hoc Committee. The motion was seconded by Commissioner James Harris. Chair Bonner then moved to Commissioner questions and comments.

(<u>55:42</u>) Chair Bonner announced Commissioner Calloway as the Chair of the Complaints Ad Hoc Committee with Vice Chair Garcia, Vice Chair Johnson, and Commissioner Harris as members. Chair Bonner opened the floor for any other Commissioner interested in being a member of the committee prior to finalization.

(<u>58:22</u>) Vice Chair Garcia expressed concern with internal grievances being overlooked and suggested internal grievance complaints be included in the process.

#### **Public Comment:**

(1:00:25) Vanessa Perez commented on the complaint process.

(1:01:50) Michelle Infante commented on transparency and accountability and misconduct complaints.

(1:05:11) Unknown caller commented on establishing a complaints committee.

(1:07:55) Jay commented on the death of his friend Francisco Nunez.

Following public comment, Chair Bonner called for a roll call vote on the motion.

Ayes: 7 - Chair Bonner, Vice Chair Garcia, Vice

Chair Johnson, Commissioner Calloway, Commissioner Cooper, Commissioner Harris

Commissioner Kennedy.

Navs: 0 -

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Patti Giggans, Commissioner

Jamon Hicks

The vote passed Ayes 7, Nays 0, Abstentions 0.

## 2. Discussion of the Commission's 2024 Strategic Plan and Goals

(1:12:05) Chair Bonner provided an overview of the status of the Commission's 2024 Strategic Plan. Chair Bonner suggested reviewing the COC's current accomplishments to determine what accomplishments to focus on in 2025. He advised the Commissioners to consider the limited number of staff, and resources available, and suggested focusing on systematic issues that impact members of the public that interact with LASD, such as policy changes and reforms. Chair Bonner called on Commissioner Kennedy to update the Commission on Deputy Gangs.

(1:14:50) Commissioner Kennedy briefly updated the Commission on the progress made on Deputy Gangs and Cliques. He reported that some progress was made by LASD on Deputy Gangs and

Cliques, which included developing a policy prohibiting participation in deputy gangs. He reported the Union representing LASD rejected the section of the policy that would prohibit deputies from joining Deputy Cliques and that Sheriff Luna agreed to develop a policy prohibiting the joining of Deputy Cliques. Commissioner Kennedy expressed concern with the violence and unconstitutional policing by deputy gangs and cliques based on testimony provided during Special Hearings in the past. Commissioner Kennedy identified this issue as a priority goal for 2025.

(1:20:45) Chair Bonner advised that one of the 2025 goals would include the 27 recommendations hat was presented to Sheriff Luna that outlined various suggestions to eradicate deputy gangs, cliques and/or subgroups. Chair Bonner commented about the public corruption unit established by the previous administration, which has been disbanded. Chair Bonner further inquired if additional special hearings should be considered to discuss the unit that reported to Undersheriff Murakami.

(1:23:08) Commissioner Kennedy shared information about the LASD homicide unit and recommended continuing with the special hearings as part of the 2025 strategic goals.

(1:26:49) Chair Bonner reported on the Discipline Process Ad Hoc and advised that its members met with several subject matter experts to identify the best recommendations to use for improving LASD's discipline process in the first quarter.

Chair Bonner called for a 15-minute break at 10:45. Chair Bonner resumed the meeting resumed at 11:00 a.m.

(1:53:25) Commissioner Irma Cooper reported on the Prison Rape Elimination Act (PREA) Ad Hoc committee and advised that it was tasked with responding to the BOS 3/19/24 motion to evaluate LASD's compliance with PREA. Commissioner Cooper reported receiving information from LASD to consider for the development of a report to reform recommendations, and that the committee anticipates the report back to the BOS will be placed on the January 2025 COC agenda. Commissioner Cooper reported that PREA ad hoc committee goals for 2024 were met.

(1:57:06) Commissioner Kennedy reported on the Use of Force (UOF) Ad Hoc and advised that the ad hoc committee's goal was to develop a report with recommendations to reduce UOF incidents by studying LASD uses of force and current policies. However, it was unable to complete that task due to LASD's failure to fulfill multiple PRA requests made by the ad hoc committee. Commissioner Kennedy expressed concern with approved UOF incidents and suggested the ad hoc committee hold special hearing focusing on UOF to retrieve information that LASD continues to withhold. Commissioner Kennedy reported that the UOF ad hoc committee did not meet its goal for 2024 and that special hearing on UOF will be the goal for 2025.

(2:02:23) Chair Bonner responded to Commissioner Kennedy's report and approved the ad hoc committee holding one or two special hearing on UOF.

(2:03:02) Commissioner Calloway inquired about retrieving information from cases that are closed.

<u>2:04:02</u> Chair Bonner advised that he and Commissioner Kennedy will request investigative case files related to the case.

(2:05:29) Commissioner Harris noted that the case is very similar to the Perez case and suggested requesting case files on the Perez case as well.

(2:07:06) Chair Bonner agreed with Commissioner Harris and moved to the Governance ad hoc report. Chair Bonner reported on the Governance Ad Hoc committee goals and objectives and

Commented [BO9]: What about the 27

**Commented [SA10R9]:** They will be included in the 2025 Strategic goals

**Commented [BO11]:** The formatting here needs to be fixed

Commented [BO12]: Has anyone followed up with Chair Bonner about how he wants to proceed with the Discipline report?

**Commented [SA13R12]:** I'm not sure if any f/u has been done.

advised that these have been completed. He shared the committee's goals for 2025, which included BOS approval of revisions to ordinance 3.79 and the development of an internal operations manual for the Commission by the end of the year. In closing, Chair Bonner suggested updating the Commissioner's handbook as a goal for 2026. Chair Bonner then called on ED Moseley to complete her report on accomplished goals for 2024.

## 3. Discussion of the Commission's Goals and Priorities for 2025

(2:11:03) ED Moseley provided an overview of the strategic goals and accomplishments for 2024 which included providing training on LASD operations, policies, and initiatives, participating in LASD ride-alongs, jail visits, attending various webinars. She, along with several Commissioners, also attended the 2024 National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement (NACOLE) conference. She announced that Brown Act and other trainings are available to Commissioners through Commission Services and that Commissioner Calloway will receive training from the CoCo liaison.

(2:13:33) Chair Bonner commented on the goals and identified strengthening the relationship with OIG and monitoring LASD compliance with Senate Bill (SB) 1421 PRA requests as additional objectives for 2025 and noted that an ad hoc committee would need to monitor LASD PRAs for it to be effective.

(2:15:30) Commissioner Kennedy advised that the PRA issue is closely related to the UOF ad hoc and agreed to take on monitoring the LASD PRA compliance.

(2:15:48) Chair Bonner tasked staff with providing an update on outreach for 2025 and inquired about virtual mini conferences.

(2:18:36) Ms. Jordan provided an overview of mini conferences which included communicating with the public, Justice Deputies from each supervisorial district, and ad hoc committees to identify key topics, the benefits of the mini conference, and identifying subject matter experts.

(2:21:50) Chair Bonner expressed concern with limited staff and requested future mini conferences be discussed with the Governance committee to determine the benefits.

(2:22:30) ED Moseley advised that the Commission has a staff analyst deficit and that she is confident that the Communications Manager and the Community Engagement Coordinator can handle the task.

(2:23:37) Commissioner Bonner noted that several ad hoc committees did not have any goals or objectives to report and recommended each ad hoc committee identify one goal and objective for 2025 and beyond. He also recommended that each ad hoc Chair develop one reoccurring monthly meeting and that staff forward a draft agenda one week prior to the meeting date Chair Bonner advised that each Chair will be asked to provide an update on their meeting schedule at the next COC meeting.

(2:29:23) Commissioner Harris reported that the Budget ad Hoc will request that LASD present their budget priorities for the ad hoc committee to review and make recommendations, and that a presentation will be provided to the full Commission for feedback. Chair Bonner inquired about the timeline for 2025.

(2:32:41) Vice Chair Garcia reported that the Quality-of-Life (QOL) ad hoc accomplishments and goals are to include, but not be limited to, finalizing the law enforcement mental health report. He Meeting Minutes

L.A. County Sheriff Civilian Oversight Commission

Page 6 of 8

reported that the committee's role for 2025 is to identify potential challenges of accountability and transparency involving LASD presence, and that the ad hoc will hear from subject matter experts (SMEs) through mini conference sessions and QOL issues followed by a full report to the Commission. Vice Chair Garcia identified advocating for policy updates as a potential goal. He reported increasing awareness of QOL issues involving public safety in L.A. County and said the committee's reviewing QOL policy, scheduling a educational presentation at a COC meeting with LASD and other SMEs, and conducting research and analysis of the QOL process.

Chair Bonner called on Vice Chair Johnson to share the goals and objective for the Technology Ad Hoc Committee.

(2:35:33) Vice Chair Johnson reported that the Technology ad hoc committee prepared reports on the use of drones and tasers by LASD in 2023, and that the department will be upgrading the tasers to a more modern device soon. Vice Chair Johnson reported for 2025 the ad hoc will revisit the drone issue and Memorandas of Understanding between LASD and other outside agencies to ensure compliance with federal standards on the use of drone technology. The ad hoc will also research the use of Artificial Intelligence (AI) by LASD and identify ways that AI can benefit oversight efforts by detecting patterns and problems at the department. Vice Chair Johnson also commented about the bus fleets and reminded the Commission about his recommendation that LASD to switch to a less polluting vehicle; he added that the Technology ad hoc is open to assist in that matter. Chair Bonner called on Commissioner Cooper to share priority goals and objectives for the Conditions of Confinement Ad Hoc Committee.

(2:38:42) Commissioner Cooper shared 2025 Conditions of Confinement priorities that included advocating for policy updates that encourage fair and unbiased policing. She highlighted objectives that included increased transparency in LASD implementation policies and revision dates, and to conduct research, review, and analyze jail public tours, review the jails corrective action plan, continue to meet and collaborate with the Sybil Brand Commission (SBC) and OIG, and develop a report of the ad committee's recommendations.

(2:40:38) Chair Bonner advised that ED Moseley and the Governance Ad Hoc Committee will generate the 2025 priorities and objectives and present them at the January COC meeting. Chair Bonner then called on ED Moseley to share her goals and objectives for 2025.

(2:42:04) ED Moseley shared a PowerPoint presentation outlining goals and objectives for 2025, which included developing a citizen complaint process for the Commission and improving internal operations and procedures for the COC.

(2:49:41) Vice Chair Johnson commented on the number of ad hoc committees and inquired if ED Moseley could identify any ad hoc committees that can be dissolved or consolidated.

(2:50:55) ED Mosely recommended combining the Jail Staffing and Conditions of Confinement ad hoc committees.

<u>2:51:53</u> Chair Bonner noted that the Governance Committee will identify the priorities and reduce the goals and priorities for 2025.

# Public Comment:

(2:56:35) Vanessa Perez commented on UOF against minors.

(2:57:51) T Carter commented on ED Moseley presentation.

(2:59:30) Michelle Infante commented on the importance of report writing.

(3:02:26) Yousef Miller commented on transparency and accountability.

**Commented [BO14]:** This sentence is too long and can be broken up.

Commented [SA15R14]: Done!

(3:04:48) Carlos Montes clarified his comments made at the last meeting about Fort Apache.

(3:06:32) Salena Coleman thanked the Commission for the work being done.

(3:08:54) Deana Brock commented on the complaint process.

# VII. COMMISSION AD HOC COMMITTEES & AGENCY REPORTS/UPDATES A. Deputy Gangs Ad Hoc Committee

(3:17:35) Chair Bonner referenced a letter dated April 2, 2024, that was drafted by Commissioner Kennedy during his tenure as Chair of the Commission regarding LASDs investigation into the Industry Indians investigation and called on Commissioner Kennedy to provide more information on the issue.

(3:19:14) Commissioner Kennedy provided background information related to requests made to LASD and CoCo regarding information on the Industry Indians investigation and that he has not received a response from either entity despite legal authority presented.

#### B. Use of Force Ad Hoc

Commissioner Kennedy shared the background.

#### 2. Office of Inspector General (OIG)

(3:12:08) Inspector General Max Huntsman commented about the need to investigate the Deputy who falsified a police report related to a UOF incident involving a transgender man and encouraged the Commission to request an investigation. Mr. Huntsman also commented about overlapping oversight of LASD and advised that this is due to LASDs failure to respond to numerous requests.

Following item VII, Chair Bonner moved to Public Comment.

3:25:12 Vanessa Perez commented about the Industry Indians.

3:26:20 T. Carter commented on the OIG report and his unresolved complaint.

3:28:31 Crystal Chavez commented about LASDs inappropriate use of Tasers.

3:31:00 Tiara Thomas spoke about the death of her brother Eugene Youngblood

3:32:41 Cindy Nunez commented on the death of her brother Francisco Nunez.

3:36:22 Cassandra commented about the death of her uncle Francisco Nunez.

3:28:36 Raquel Derfler commented about LASDs use of Tasers.

3:40:49 Michelle Infante commented about oversight of the jails.

3:42:32 Allison Rubinfeld commented on adopting the complaints ad hoc committee.

3:44:00 Stephanie Luna commented about her nephew who was shot by LASD.

3:46:10 Yousef Miller spoke about transparency and accountability.

3:48:37 Salena Coleman commented about the availability of LASD camera footage.

3:51:21 Paloma Serna commented on LASD transparency and the death of her daughter.

3:53:31 Chair Bonner announced that the 2024 list of accomplishments and the fourth goal that the Commission will review is attached to the agenda. Chair Bonner thanked the staff and Commissioners for their efforts and adjourned the meeting.

# **UPCOMING MEETINGS & EVENTS**

The next regular COC Business meeting will be held on January 16, 2025. The meeting adjourned at 1:07 p.m.

Commented [BO16]: Need to do what?