



**SHERIFF CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION
BUSINESS MEETING
ST. ANNE'S CONFERENCE CENTER
Thursday, September 19, 2024**



MEETING MINUTES

Attachment: [Video](#)

Commissioners Present:

Chair, Robert Bonner
Co-Vice Chair, Luis Garcia
Co-Vice Chair, Hans Johnson
Arthur Calloway
Patti Giggans
James Harris
Jamon Hicks
Sean Kennedy

Commissioners Absent:

Irma Hagans Cooper

Staff Present:

Sharmaine Moseley, Executive Director
Bikila Ochoa, Deputy Executive Officer
Starlet Atkins, Management Secretary
Tracy Jordan, Principal Staff Analyst
Daniel Delgadillo, Sr. Staff Analyst
Nune Petrosyan, Management Analyst
Janssen Diaz, Sr. Deputy County Counsel
Mathew Dill, Sr. Deputy County Counsel

I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME

Chair Robert Bonner called the Sheriff Civilian Oversight Commission (Commission) meeting to order at 9:08 a.m. Chair Bonner acknowledged Co-Vice Chairs, Hans Johnson, and Luis Garcia and provided a brief overview of the items listed on the meeting agenda. Chair Bonner introduced and welcomed Arthur Calloway as a new Commissioner and briefly discussed the Commission's code of conduct.

II. PUBLIC COMMENT RULES: Commission staff member Tracy Jordan explained how the community can provide public comment on an item on the agenda during the meeting.

III. ROLL CALL: Staff member Tracy Jordan conducted the roll call. The quorum requirement was met.

IV. CONSENT CALENDAR:

The Commissioners reviewed the items on the consent calendar. There were no questions.

1. Chair Bonner explained that the Commission had two consent calendar items- the June 26, 2024 POC/COC Joint Meeting minutes and July 18, 2024 COC meeting minutes for approval. He also sought to approve the revised COC Ad Hoc committee list and advised that commissioners contact him regarding any changes made to the list. Chair Bonner called for a motion to approve the consent

calendar. Commissioner James Harris moved for the Commission to approve the consent calendar. The motion was seconded by Co-Vice Chair Hans Johnson. The motion carried unanimously by a voice vote.

Ayes: 8 – Chair Robert Bonner, Vice Chair Hans Johnson, Vice Chair Luis Garcia, Commissioner Arthur Calloway, Commissioner Patti Giggans, Commissioner James Harris, Commissioner Jamon Hicks, Commissioner Sean Kennedy

Absent: 1 – Commissioner Irma Cooper

The vote passed with 8 Ayes – 0 nays vote 1 Absent/Excused: Commissioner Irma Cooper

It was noted that there was no public comment for this item.

V. Sheriff Civilian Oversight Commission’s Investigation into Deputy Gangs/Cliques and Exclusionary Subgroups Operating within the Los Angeles County Sheriff’s Department (LASD).

1. Swearing in and Testimony

[\(8:46\)](#) Chair Bonner advised that a subpoena was issued for LASD Sergeant Max Fernandez to appear at today’s meeting and that Mr. Fernandez’s subpoena will be continued and heard at a special hearing on October 11, 2024, at 9:00 a.m. at Loyola Law School, in the Robinson Auditorium. Chair Bonner also reported that, at the recommendation of counsel Harve Anand and County Counsel, the Commission reissued a subpoena for Mark Lillienfeld who was previously subpoenaed but did not appear. Commissioner Kennedy moved to reissue a subpoena for Mark Lillienfeld to appear before the Commission and provide testimony. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Harris.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM V

[\(11:46\)](#) Raquel Derfler requested clarification on the topic and agreed with reissuing the subpoena to Mark Lillienfeld.

[\(13:06\)](#) Paloma Serna commented and agreed with the Commission to reissue the subpoena.

[\(13:57\)](#) Benny Adrian expressed support of the Commission’s efforts to investigate and hold LASD deputy gangs accountable.

Chair Bonner called for a voice vote to approve reissuance of the subpoena to Mark Lillienfeld:

Ayes: 8 – Chair Robert Bonner, Vice Chair Hans Johnson, Vice Chair Luis Garcia, Commissioner Arthur Calloway, Commissioner Patti Giggans, Commissioner Harris, Commissioner Hicks, Commissioner Kennedy

Absent: 1 – Commissioner Irma Cooper

The voice vote passed 8 Ayes – 0 Abstention – 1 Absent/Excused: Commissioner Irma Cooper.

VI. **FAMILY IMPACT REMARKS:**

Cindy Nunez commented about her loved one, Francisco Nunez, LASD gangs, the alleged ongoing harassment towards her family by LASD, and complaints submitted to OIG.

[\(23:04\)](#) Chair Bonner requested that OIG investigate the status of LASD's investigation into the Nunez matter.

[\(23:36\)](#) Inspector General Huntsman informed the Commission that the OIG is "blocked by the courts from conducting independent investigations" and that an Attorney has been assigned to monitor LASD actions.

[\(24:07\)](#) Chair Bonner requested the Commission's Use of Force Ad Hoc committee investigate the Nunez complaint to determine what needs to be done and to provide a report back at the next meeting.

[\(24:30\)](#) Vice-Chair Hans Johnson expressed concern with Cindy Nunez's complaint about retaliation from LASD.

[\(25:40\)](#) Chair Bonner noted that actions of retaliation violate LASD policy and requested the Use of Force Ad Hoc to also explore what LASD is doing to address the issues and include the assessment in the report back.

VII. COMMISSION/LASD REPORTS

1. Chair's Report (Chair Robert Bonner)

- A. This item was discussed under agenda item I.
- B. This item was deferred.
- C. Discussion and possible adoption of the Rules/Governance Ad Hoc Committee's proposed revisions to Chapter 3.79 of the County Code. (Chair Bonner)

Action Item: Motion for the full Commission to adopt the proposed revisions to Chapter 3.79 of the County Code and direct the Executive Director of the Commission to forward the proposed revised ordinance to the Executive Officer for the Board of Supervisors.

[\(26:50\)](#) Chair Bonner summarized the proposed revisions to Chapter 3.79 of the County Code and the benefits of the changes. Chair Bonner noted that including the role of "Secretary" to the ordinance was not intended and should have been red lined. He then called for a motion for the full Commission to adopt the proposed revisions to Chapter 3.79 of the County Code and direct the Executive Director of the Commission to forward the proposed revised ordinance to the Executive Officer for the Board of Supervisors. Commissioner James Harris made the motion and Commissioner Hicks seconded the motion.

[\(36:02\)](#) Inspector General Huntsman expressed support for the revisions to Chapter 3.79 of the County Code.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM VII

[\(37:15\)](#) Melissa Camacho commented on conditions in the jails and use of force UOF cases in the downtown facility and noted her support for the amendments to 3.79.

[\(39:36\)](#) Ali Rubinfeld commented on the LASD investigating itself and the need for this body (the Commission) to be able to conduct investigations.

[\(41:03\)](#) Raquel Derfler commented on the importance of adopting the amendments to 3.79 and that the recommendations be implemented.

[\(43:24\)](#) Carlos Montes expressed support for the motion and noted that the changes to 3.79 will give the

Commission the authority it needs for stronger oversight of LASD.

[\(44:51\)](#) Benny Adrian expressed support for the revisions to 3.79 and stated more resources are needed to have access to confidential information and to the jails.

[\(47:04\)](#) S noted support to 3.79 and commented about the LASD accountability.

[\(48:26\)](#) Paloma Serna encouraged the Commission to continue to fight for oversight over LASD and the need for the Commission to have separate outside counsel.

[\(50:30\)](#) Chair Bonner restated the motion and requested a roll call vote for the full Commission to approve and adopt the proposed revisions to chapter 3.79 of the County Code and direct the Executive Director of the Commission, Sharmaine Moseley, to promptly forward the revised ordinance to the Board of Supervisors through the Executive Officer of the Board.

Roll call vote to approve and adopt the proposed revisions to Chapter 3.79 of the County Code:

Ayes: 8 – Chair Robert Bonner, Vice Chair Hans Johnson, Vice Chair Luis Garcia, Commissioner Arthur Calloway, Commissioner Patti Giggans, Commissioner Harris, Commissioner Hicks, Commissioner Kennedy

Absent: 1 – Commissioner Irma Cooper

The vote passed 8 Ayes – 0 Abstention – 0 nays vote 1 Absent/Excused: Commissioner Irma Cooper.

Chair Bonner advised that Sheriff Luna had limited time at the meeting and moved to item 3.

2. Executive Director’s Report (Executive Director Sharmaine Moseley)

[\(1:19:22\)](#) Executive Director (ED) Moseley introduced and welcomed new Commissioner Arthur Calloway and new County Counsel liaisons Senior Deputies Janssen Diaz and Mathew Dill. Ms. Moseley provided an update on staff and Commissioner activities. ED Moseley reported that staff was developing a panel session for the National Association for Civilian Oversight Law Enforcement (NACOLE) and coordinating the 4th Annual COC conference scheduled for November 8, 2024. She also highlighted the benefits of the conference and encouraged the public to attend. ED Moseley announced Robert Flores as the new Community Services Coordinator and reported that the Communications Manager position would be filled soon. ED Moseley announced upcoming events that staff would participate in for the month of October and reported that billing inquiries to County Counsel are ongoing. ED Moseley advised that Deputy Executive Officer Ochoa is developing a complaint process that will include statistical data, demographics, and the results of the complaints. In closing, Ms. Moseley briefly discussed the strategic plan and recommended sending the draft to the Commission’s Governance Ad Hoc committee for review prior to discussing it with the full Commission.

3. Los Angeles County Sheriff’s Department Update (Sheriff Luna)

[\(53:14\)](#) Sheriff Luna addressed Cindy Nunez, who provided family impact remarks, and advised her that her complaints would be investigated. He then provided an update on crime statistics that included reductions in violent crime, property crime, burglary, and auto theft. He attributed the reduction to the Crime Impact Unit and thanked Assistant Sheriff Myron Johnson who oversees the unit for his leadership. Sheriff Luna reported statistics on calls for service, observations, arrests and that 1,254 guns have been seized. Sheriff Luna further reported LASD use of force is down by 9.6%. He noted an increase in Deputy-Involved Shootings (DIS) and a decrease in In-Custody Deaths with 31 deaths to

date compared to a total of 45 last year.

Sheriff Luna discussed the two-captain model and reported that LASD requested two-captains at six stations and was budgeted for three stations, with Lancaster, Palmdale, and East Los Angeles stations selected as priority. Sheriff Luna briefly discussed the Deputy Gangs policy that was released yesterday and recognized the OIG, COC, and County Counsel for their contributions. He noted that the policy addresses law enforcement gangs and hate groups and that this will let employees know that inappropriate conduct will not be tolerated. Sheriff Luna advised that discussions on deputy cliques and sub-groups are ongoing. In closing, Sheriff Luna reported 55 requests were received from the COC and that 50 of the requests have been completed and that he is working to complete the remaining pending requests.

[\(1:00:34\)](#) Commissioner Kennedy inquired if LASD is planning to investigate and disclose to individuals facing trial information about law enforcement gang members with tattoos under the Brady rule, specifically, the deputy gang members who serve as prosecution witnesses.

[\(1:01:20\)](#) Sheriff Luna reported that in addition to the deputy cliques and sub-group policy previously discussed, he is also working on various policies including tattoos and emblems. He reported that the Office of Constitutional Policing is in a meet and confer regarding these issues. Sheriff Luna commented on the use of force policy that was published and in the process of being implemented. He also highlighted training as one of his top priorities.

[\(1:02:38\)](#) Co-Vice Chair Johnson asked if Sheriff Luna intends to reference the 27 recommendations from the deputy gangs report during his negotiations for the deputy clique's policy.

[\(1:04:31\)](#) Sheriff Luna confirmed that the recommendations will be used during negotiations.

[\(1:05:03\)](#) Chair Bonner commented on the deputy gang policy and State law prohibiting law enforcement gangs and suggested Sheriff Luna adopt recommendation A3 which prohibits participation or membership in deputy cliques.

[\(1:15:53\)](#) Commissioner Calloway expressed concern with training being Sheriff Luna's top priority with regards to deputy gangs and requested Sheriff to provide more information on accountability.

[\(1:14:36\)](#) Sheriff Luna advised that policies, training, and accountability are very important and that training throughout LASD will assist in changing the mindset of staff within the department.

[\(1:16:28\)](#) Co-Vice Chair Johnson also commented on the two-captain model and noted that the three stations selected have a history of deputy gangs and inquired if Sheriff Luna believes that the model will help change the current culture. Sheriff Luna expressed full support for the two-captain model and reported that the model is working and will provide more assistance with reviewing incidents.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEMS UNDER VII

[\(1:30:20\)](#) Raquel Derfler commented on the two-captain model at the Lancaster and Palmdale stations and the harassment that the Nunez family is experiencing.

[\(1:32:52\)](#) T. Carter commented about his unresolved disposition and lack of response regarding complaints he filed with the OIG.

[\(1:35:22\)](#) Jung Park commented about his experience of misconduct, intimidation, and retaliation from South Los Angeles (SLA) Sheriff station and requested the Commission to investigate.

[\(1:37:41\)](#) Vanessa Perez expressed concern with Captains who are suspected of being in deputy gangs

being promoted to Chief.

[\(1:38:35\)](#) Ali Rubinfeld commented on the LASD's deputy gang policy.

[\(1:39:40\)](#) Benny Adrian commented about LASD training and not being accountable.

[\(1:41:46\)](#) Carlos Montes commented on the deputy gangs and the need for more de-escalation.

[\(1:43:48\)](#) Paloma Serna commented on LASD training and inquired if the Commission's November conference will be posted online.

[\(1:45:26\)](#) Sol Marquez spoke about deputy gangs and removing them from all LASD stations.

[\(1:46:59\)](#) Young Park shared concern with the injustices displayed by SLA Sheriff station.

[\(2:06:28\)](#) Chair Bonner called for a 15-minute break at 10:58 a.m.

[\(2:12:18\)](#) Chair Bonner called the meeting back to order at 11:21 a.m.

VIII. **Unfinished Business - None**

IX. **NEW BUSINESS - None**

X. **COMMISSION AD HOC COMMITTEES & AGENCY REPORTS/UPDATES**

Office of the Inspector General (OIG) Report

[\(2:13:38\)](#) Assistant Inspector General Peter Bibring provided a summary of the OIG's Quarterly Report. He noted that the LASD finalized the Taser report, and the information will be provided in the next OIG's quarterly report. He highlighted three sections of the report and expressed concern with: the operations section; ICIB and IAB investigative process; investigation into illegal gambling; and their failure to investigate potential leads and false statement. Assistant Inspector Bibring reported on LASD custody division and reported several complaints were made regarding LASD's failure to allow attorneys and legal clinics full access to attorney visitation rooms. Assistant Inspector General Bibring expressed concern with exercise time being given to pregnant people at CRDF during the early morning hours. In closing, Mr. Bibring voiced concern with two deaths that occurred at CRDF in the medical intake unit (Module 1400) and that there has been a total of four deaths in that unit and zero deaths in the other intake units.

Co-Vice Chair Johnson inquired about penalties for individuals perpetrating legal counsel to gain access to incarcerated people to retrieve information and if the OIG has identified any such incidents. Mr. Bibring advised that the OIG was not aware of such incidents and that his office would inquire.

2. Ad Hoc Committee Updates/Commissioner Comments

[\(2:25:16\)](#) **Deputy Gangs:** Commissioner Kennedy reported that the next Special Hearing for the Ad Hoc Committee's investigation into LASD Deputy Gangs/Cliques will be held on Friday, October 11, 2024 at 9:00 a.m. in the Robinson Court Room at Loyola Law School.

[\(2:26:05\)](#) **Disciplinary Process:** Chair Bonner advised there was nothing new to report on this item.

[\(2:26:19\)](#) **Quality of Life: Update:** Commissioner Garcia reported that ED Moseley and staff attended the July 30th Board of Supervisors meeting to provide an update on addressing illegal street takeovers. He noted that the Commission received the Quarter Two Report on Street

Takeovers from LASD, and that ongoing efforts are being made regarding Staff Wellness and Suicide Prevention within LASD. Additionally, collaboration with NACOLE is underway for the development of a webinar on examining law enforcement wellness & suicide prevention needs to increase public safety.

[\(2:27:13\)](#) **Governance Ad Hoc:** Commissioner Bonner reported on revisions to charter 3.79 and advised that the ad hoc will begin updating internal procedures and revising the COC handbook.

[\(2:28:11\)](#) **Conditions of Confinement Ad Hoc:** Commissioner Giggans reported that the Ad Hoc committee met on September 12, 2024, to discuss Board motions. ED Moseley and staff provided a verbal report on behalf of the Commission on July 30, 2024 to the Board of Supervisors (BOS) regarding the BOS motion titled "Report on Conditions at Men's Central Jail". In preparing for this report, staff visited several Sheriff stations to comply with the June 25, 2024 Board motion titled "Dignity and Health for People Who are Incarcerated."

[\(2:30:36\)](#) **Prison Rape Elimination Act (PREA):** Co-Vice Chair Hans Johnson reported that LASD delivered follow-up materials requested by the Commission and provided a response to the LASD staff report issued on April 18, 2024, regrading LASD PREA compliance.

[\(2:31:19\)](#) **Technology:** Co-Vice Chair Johnson reported that the Commission has received the revised LASD policy on Tasers and Unmanned Aircraft Systems.

[\(2:31:54\)](#) **Use of Force:** Chair Bonner reported on LASD's K-9 policy. He referenced that the Ad Hoc requested to review the documents relating to a dog bite incident. Chair Bonner reported that the Commission was advised by LASD that approval from County Counsel is required before the information could be released. Chair Bonner reminded the Commission about previous requests made by Ad Hoc committee for death review reports on 18 in-custody deaths and reports on unsubstantiated allegations of sexual misconduct. He expressed concern with the lack of access to information and advised that support for charter 3.79 revisions from the BOS will resolve the issue.

Public Comment on this item

[\(2:38:56\)](#) Cassandra Nunez commented about Francisco Nunez and her family's grief in his absence.

[\(2:41:44\)](#) T. Carter commented on the OIG report and requested the Commission to vote on replacing the IG.

XI. EDUCATIONAL PRESENTATION

1. Presentation on Homeless Outreach Services Team (HOST)

[\(2:44:10\)](#) Captain Jeffrey Deidrick of the LASD Community Partnership Bureau summarized a presentation on LASD's HOST/MET programs. He attributed the success of HOST to personnel selection, collaborative partnerships training, policies and procedures, and collaborating with various County agencies. Captain Deidrick reported zero use of force incidents or arrests were made since HOST's inception in 2016. Captain Deidrick spoke about collaborating with the Department of Mental Health (DMH) HOST Program and shared that the goal is to reduce the number of unhoused people with mental disabilities, decrease hospitalization, provide in-patient and out-patient mental health services and to promote mental health services and education.

2. Presentation on current revisions to LASD's Use of Force Policy

[\(3:04:16\)](#) Sergeant Ismail Opina, of the LASD Training Bureau, provided a summary of the revisions to the LASD's use of force policy that included de-escalation, force reduction, carotid restraints and chokeholds, unreasonable force, prohibited force.

[\(3:16:29\)](#) Assistant Inspector General Peter Bibring updated the Commission on the OIG's involvement regarding the LASD use of force policy and reported that the OIG received a draft copy of the use of force policy last year and made recommendations to it. He advised that the OIG was not involved in the meet and confer process and was not privy to the changes made to the updated policy until the policy was publicized. Mr. Bibring reported that some of the recommendations made by the OIG were adopted but many were not. He identified de-escalation, clear standards to define less lethal force and the recommendation for the training unit to track use trends and to follow-up with department-wide training as some of the OIG's concerns.

[\(3:24:19\)](#) Commissioner Hicks asked about the standards related to disabilities and if they include those with mental and physical disabilities, MET hours of availability, and the procedure for when a deputy should call MET.

[\(3:25:17\)](#) Captain Deidrick confirmed that the policy states mental and physical disabilities and that MET is available 24 hours a day, with a two-hour gap. The policy 16-003 outlines when a deputy should call MET. Captain Deidrick will forward that policy to the Commission.

[\(3:25:48\)](#) Commissioner Harris informed the Commission that MET is available 24 hours a day but due to limited trained staff may not always be available and that DMH also plays a role. Commissioner noted that the BOS should be encouraged to exhaust efforts to increase the number of trained MET staff.

[\(3:26:36\)](#) Captain Deidrick reported that MET has 34 teams while 60 is recommended by the BOS.

[\(3:28:15\)](#) Chair Bonner referenced the goal of MET and requested the Use of Force and Budget Ad Hoc committees identify ways to increase staffing for MET.

[\(3:33:10\)](#) Patti Giggans requested a report from MET on how they're doing.

PUBLIC COMMENT

[\(3:36:41\)](#) Raquel Derfler commented on de-escalation, carotid arteries and LASD's failure to define improvised weapons.

[\(3:39:00\)](#) Vanessa Perez commented on her personal experience with contacting MET.

[\(3:39:40\)](#) Benny Adrian commented on LASD training and de-escalation.

[\(3:41:51\)](#) Carlos Montes commented on the need for more training and additional MET.

[\(3:44:05\)](#) Julie Martinez commented on LASD's presentation on de-escalation and use of force.

XII. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENTS

[\(3:47:19\)](#) Ayinde Love commented about de-certification when a deputy's use of force leads to death.

[\(3:49:38\)](#) T. Carter suggested the Commission form a relationship with the U.S. Attorney.

[\(3:51:53\)](#) Tony Raheim commented on being falsely arrested on his private property.

[\(3:54:28\)](#) Juanita Correll commented on criminal activity involving the Sheriff's Department.

[\(3:55:46\)](#) Carlos Montes commented on systemic racism and oppression.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS - None

XIII. UPCOMING MEETINGS & EVENTS

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Bonner announced that 1. the Joint SBC/COC Joint Meeting would be held at the Earvin "Magic" Johnson Conference Room; 2. the Special Hearing on Deputy Gangs would be held on October 11, 2024, at Loyola Law School, Robinson Court Room; and 3. the next regular Commission meeting would be held on October 24, 2024, at St. Anne's Conference Center. The meeting adjourned at 1: 07p.m.