September 27, 2013

To: Executive Board

Subject: **Foothill Transit Arcadia Facility Service and Maintenance Review**

Recommendation

Receive and file a report on on-street service and fleet and facility maintenance at Foothill Transit's Arcadia Operations and Maintenance facility.

Background

A Service and Maintenance Review was received by the Executive Board at the February 22, 2013 meeting. During this review, information and activities related to the areas of on-time performance, bus appearance/cleanliness, customer comments, safety and security and fare classifications were provided as well as an action plan that was developed with First Transit to address operational and service quality issues. This report was an overview of service at both of the Foothill Transit facilities operated by First Transit.

At the August 30, 2013 meeting, the Executive Board received and filed a report on Foothill Transit's on-street service and fleet and facility maintenance operated from the Arcadia Operations and Maintenance facility. This report provided information of First Transit's performance in the areas of safety, service delivery, mechanical roadcalls and customer comments. Of particular note was a trend in the increased amount of missed service due to operator and vehicle shortages. The most frequent occurrence of this missed service took place in July 2013.

Foothill Transit's Arcadia facility operates 15 lines, which include the Silver Streak, Line 187 and Line 690 – some of Foothill Transit's most highly visible lines – utilizing 121 CNG buses and 23 diesel buses. First Transit provides these services through the employment of 363 coach operators, dispatchers, technicians and administrative personnel.

As outlined in the contract, the operations and maintenance contractors

> "...shall coordinate, manage, and control all activities necessary to perform Work and carry out its responsibilities under this Agreement, which include, but are not limited to, the following: maintaining all Revenue Vehicles and Non-Revenue Vehicles; providing Non-Revenue Vehicles for support and relief; providing operators, mechanics and all other project personnel, training personnel as necessary; developing administrative procedures and financial records; providing security for the Revenue and Non-Revenue Vehicles and the Facility; and developing methods to improve effectiveness and maximize service efficiency."

Maintaining appropriate staffing levels has been a challenge for First Transit at Foothill Transit's Arcadia location. During the proposal process, First Transit estimated a staffing requirement of 269 FTE operators to provide the service. In March 2013, First Transit Arcadia reported having 240 FTE operators available. The number of operators now exceeds their originally proposed staffing level.

The mechanics who were hired from the previous contractor were hired with the provision that the required certifications would need to be obtained by June 30, 2013 – a period of one year. Of the 29 technicians, 14 did not meet this deadline. In May and June of this year, First Transit recruited new technicians to fill these positions.

The decreasing levels of customer satisfaction with the service provided from the Arcadia Operations and Maintenance facility has been confirmed by an increase in customer complaints received through Foothill Transit's Customer Comment process as well as by customers attending the Executive Board Meetings to record their complaints about the service, notably on the Silver Streak.

Analysis

The sections below will provide additional information and activities related to the service provided by First Transit at the Arcadia Operations and Maintenance Facility

Safety

Safety is Foothill Transit's primary goal. To measure the effectiveness of the work towards safety, a performance target of 0.60 Preventable Accidents per 100,000 Miles has been established for FY 2014. Preventable accidents are defined as those which the Vehicle operator failed to do everything that he or she reasonably could have done or failed to react reasonably to the error of others including anticipating the hazard and applying appropriate defensive driving procedures. They include collisions, slips and falls, etc. The chart below reports the 12-month performance related to this target achieved by First Transit Arcadia in comparison to the systemwide performance.

Month	Arcadia Performance	System Performance
August 2012	1.25	0.9
September 2012	1.14	0.68
October 2012	0.53	0.44
November 2012	1.66	1.21
December 2012	2.38	1.22
January 2013	0.34	0.43
February 2013	1.15	0.78
March 2013	0.52	0.61
April 2013	0.52	0.61
May 2013	0.68	0.6

June 2013	0.54	0.54
July 2013	1.02	0.68
August 2013	0.51	0.42
12-Month Average	0.94	0.70

First Transit's Arcadia management team addressed the spike in preventable accidents reported in July by retraining operators involved in preventable accidents and regular reviews of defensive driving procedures. The contractor's 12-month average preventable accident performance is 0.94 per 100,000 miles. For six of the twelve months the performance target of 0.60 was achieved.

Service Delivery

In April 2013, a trend of increased missed service and/or trips was identified. The reasons provided by First Transit for the missed service were operator and vehicle shortages. The majority of these missed trips were on the Silver Streak, and Lines 185, 187, and 480. The chart below is the monthly report, beginning in April, of missed trips resulting from a shortage of available operators and unavailable vehicles. This chart is based on the missed service reported by First Transit when more than 50 percent of a trip was missed.

Month	Number of Missed Trips
April 2013	43
May 2013	31
June 2013	77
July 2013	131
August 2013	9
September (through September 20th)	15

Of the 43 trips missed in April, all were due to lack of an operator. Twenty-five of these trips were missed on Silver Streak, some during the owl service hours of 11:00 p.m. to 4:00 a.m. when Silver Streak is the only service travelling between the San Gabriel and Pomona Valleys. July saw the highest number of recorded missed trips, with the majority again due to the lack of operators available to meet the service demands.

The August 30, 2013 Board Agenda reported First Transit's plan to hire 30 additional operators. As of September 17, First Transit has hired 38 additional operators with another 26 in training. In addition, First Transit management continues to review the work schedule for operators and has plans to continue to make adjustments to staffing levels to provide coverage for sick or unscheduled time off.

Schedule Adherence

The Foothill Transit SMART*Bus* System monitors schedule adherence on a route by route basis. Using the on-board GPS, data is collected at each of the timepoints the bus passes. While work continues on the data collection and cleansing, this provides a framework to identify schedule adherence performance and address issues on a route by route level.

Roadcalls

One of Foothill Transit's customer service goals is to provide service with an average of at least 15,000 miles between service interruptions. Over the past 12 months, performance at Foothill Transit's Arcadia location has averaged 13,370 miles between mechanical service interruptions, while the systemwide performance at our has averaged 14,277 miles between mechanical service interruptions.

Month	Arcadia Performance	System Performance
August 2012	9,025	10,524
September 2012	19,440	14,051
October 2012	21,147	18,068
November 2012	20,069	17,020
December 2012	20,203	16,959
January 2013	8,488	12,017
February 2013	14,461	16,101
March 2013	13,715	15,833
April 2013	9,106	12,879
May 2013	9,011	12,017
June 2013	8,327	12,038
July 2013	8,543	12,161
August 2013	12,281	15,941
12-Month Average	13,370	14,277

Over the past several months, the majority of buses unavailable to provide service have been in maintenance for repairs that were not scheduled. This could be a contributor to the mechanical roadcalls and breakdowns noted in this chart. First Transit currently has a fleet of 139 coaches assigned to the Arcadia location. The current peak fleet requirement is 116 coaches. This provides 23 coaches (20 percent) as spares.

Foothill Transit's staff conducts daily monitoring of the vehicles available for service. This monitoring identifies buses that are scheduled for preventative maintenance and those that are in the shop to resolve unanticipated repairs. Depending on the

complexity of the repairs, these buses may have been out of service for a portion of the day, the entire day or sometimes several days for various reasons.

Maintenance of the vehicles and hiring of qualified personnel is the responsibility of First Transit. As of September 17, First Transit maintains a staff of 34 mechanics, which is more than the 29 indicated in their original proposal.

Customer Comments

Another indicator of the level of customer service provided is the number of complaints received per 100,000 boardings. Foothill Transit's performance goal for the current fiscal year is 10.25 complaints per 100,000 boardings. Foothill Transit's management team monitors customer comments received via telephone, email, mail, social media and in-person.

Month	Arcadia Performance	System Performance
August 2012	17.89	19.65
September 2012	13.52	13.48
October 2012	13.05	12.19
November 2012	14.91	9.35
December 2012	9.53	9.62
January 2013	7.80	7.26
February 2013	11.45	10.27
March 2013	6.98	7.68
April 2013	10.19	8.28
May 2013	14.58	10.08
June 2013	22.97	19.52
July 2013	20.07	16.35
August 2013	17.89	18.96
12- Month Average	13.91	12.51

Schedule adherence continues to be the area receiving the majority of customer comments. The majority of these complaints were related to Silver Streak service. Courtesy receives the next highest amount of complaints of which the Silver Streak also ranks highest. The Silver Streak is also the route with the highest number of miles operated.

The following issues have been formally addressed with First Transit:

1. Poor on-time performance, including gaps in service and bunching of buses
2. Poor fleet maintenance performance
3. Poor preventable accident performance; and
4. Missed service

A corrective action plan was required of First Transit with measurable targets. This plan has been received and is currently being reviewed.

Budget Impact

This is a status update item only. There is no budget impact.

Sincerely,

LaShawn King Gillespie
Director of Customer Service & Operations

Doran J. Barnes
Executive Director